<u>May 9, 2024</u>

Hello Commissioners!

At 3:44PM on Thursday, May 9, 2024, the Off Highway Motor Vehicle Recreation Division (Division) of the California Department of Parks and Recreation (DPR) posted reports for your commission meeting to be held next Thursday, May 16, in Arroyo Grande. This meeting will occur the day after the Commission members and the public tour the Oceano Dunes State Vehicular Recreation Area (SVRA).

What is interesting about the posted reports is not what is in them, but what was not provided.

By now you know that State Parks has spent more than \$25 million in an attempt to eliminate PM10 violations on the Nipomo Mesa. This was revealed in March 2022 at the Commission's meeting in Redding, CA. As the Commission's upcoming tour of Oceano Dunes SVRA will reveal, that spending continues in earnest, as does the sacrificing of hundreds of recreational acres of the park. To date, more than 740 acres of the park have been artificially covered to eliminate violations of the state's PM10 standard (more on this later).

Given that the May 2024 meeting is focused on Oceano Dunes, you might think the Division and DPR would provide you an update on that spending—you should not have to request it. But State Parks has not. Why? Well, it's an ostrich thing: On top of that \$25+ million, they have spent millions more. It's not stopping. And critically, they have nothing to show for it.

The point of all the Division's spending is to theoretically meet the obligations of the stipulated order of abatement (SOA) imposed against Oceano Dunes by the San Luis Obispo County Air Pollution Control District (SLOAPCD). And the primary obligation of the SOA is to eliminate exceedances of the State's PM10 standard on the Nipomo Mesa (see chapter 3 of this document regarding PM10 and the state standard). And yet those exceedances continue in earnest.

Between this week and last week there were 14 violations of the state's PM10 standard on the Nipomo Mesa--14 violations in just 12 days (see image on the next page). And that's only the most recent data to show that the Division and DPR are getting NOTHING for the millions in public dollars they have spent. As you know, the <u>Scripps investigation</u>, which the Division paid for, has proven that, contrary to SLOAPCD claims, the PM10 on the Mesa is not dust from Oceano Dunes. In fact, there is very little dust in the PM10, making it doubtful the Oceano Dunes OHV recreation contributes anything to Mesa PM10. So of course the PM10 violations continue--Oceano Dunes and OHV recreation have nothing to do with PM10 on the Mesa.

You deserve to know the latest spending on these ineffective SOA/PM10 related undertakings as does the public. I respectfully ask that you request an immediate update on the budget for this wasteful, meaningless effort.

Respectfully,

May 9, 2024

					erage PM1 Display En		Data 3/2024			
Bas Cn	ty Si	te Name	7 Day Max	05/02/2024	05/03/2024	05/04/2024	05/05/2024	05/06/2024	05,070.24	05/08/2024
SCC SL	O Arroyo Grand	e-2391 Willow Road	64.6	<u>64.6</u>	17.5	5.6	44.0	45.7	<u>56.8</u>	>
SCC SL	O Atascader	o-Lift Station #5	11.7			5.4	7.8	9.8		
SCC SL	O Nipomo-G	Suadalupe Road	80.3	<u>80.3</u>	15.8	6.0	41.8	46.5	<u>67.2</u>	
SCC SL	O Nipomo-Oso	Flaco Lake Road	47.3	47.3	47.3	8.6	26.3	31.4	11.2	
SCC SL	O Nipomo-	Regional Park	40.5	40.5	16.6	6.1	18.7	19.9	32.8	
SCC SL	O Paso Robles	S-Santa Fe Avenue	22.1	22.1	13.3	5.4		10.6	13.3	
SCC SL	SLC SLC	D-Roberto	19.7	19.7	9.3	2.1	7.5	6.6	12.3	
Downlo	ad Data: Qui k (*) indicate	this Area Get Ad ck or Select Form s 25% or more I	hourly va	lues are m	issing.		c	hange Se	election	
Downlo Asteris Cell co	ad Data: Qui k (*) indicate lor is <u>red</u> if n lor is <u>yellow</u>	ck or Select Form	at hourly va standard standard	lues are m level is ex	issing. ceeded.	04/29/2024		2024 🗢 🛛	Мау	≎ 8 05/03/2024
Downlo Asteris Cell co Cell co Bas Cn	ad Data: Qui k (*) indicate or is <u>red</u> if n or is <u>yellow</u> ty Si	ck or Select Form s 25% or more l ational 24-hour if state 24-hour	at hourly va standard standard	lues are m level is ex level is ex	issing. ceeded.	04/29/2024 <u>76.3</u>		2024 🗢 🛛	Мау	
Asteris Cell co Cell co Bas Cn SCC SL	ad Data: Qui k (*) indicate or is <u>red</u> if n or is <u>yellow</u> ty Si O Arroyo Grand	ck or Select Form es 25% or more l ational 24-hour if state 24-hour ite Name	hourly va standard standard 7 Day Jaa	lues are m level is ex level is ex 04/27/2024	issing. cceeded. CCCCCCCC		04/30/2024	2024 ≎ 05/01/2024	May 05/02/2024	05/03/2024
Asteris Cell co Cell co Bas Cn SCC SL SCC SL	ad Data: Qui k (*) indicate for is red if n for is yellow ty Si 0 Arroyo Grand 0 Atascade	ck or Select Form es 25% or more l ational 24-hour if state 24-hour ite Name e-2391 Willow Road	hourly val standard standard 7 Day Max 79 9	lues are m level is ex level is ex 04/27/2024 <u>64.5</u>	issing. cceeded. ccectoa. 04/28/2024 <u>67.4</u>	<u>76.3</u>	04/30/2024	2024 ≎ 05/01/2024	May 05/02/2024	05/03/2024
Downlo Asteris Cell co Cell co Bas Cn	ad Data: Qui k (*) indicate or is red if n or is yellow ty Si O Arroyo Grand O Atascade O Nipomo-C	ck or Select Form es 25% or more l ational 24-hour if state 24-hour ite Name e-2391 Willow Road ro-Lift Station #5	hourly val standard standard 7 Day hax 799	lues are m level is ex level is ex level is ex 04/27/2024 <u>64.5</u> 10.9	issing. cceeded. cceuted. 04/28/2024 <u>67.4</u>	76.3	04/30/2024 <u>79.9</u>	2024	May 05/02/2024 <u>64.6</u>	05/03/2024 17.5
Asteris Cell co Cell co Bas Cn SCC SL SCC SL SCC SL SCC SL	ad Data: Qui k (*) indicate lor is red if n lor is yellow ty Si 0 Arroyo Grand 0 Atascade 0 Nipomo-Oso	ek or Select Form ational 24-hour if state 24-hour ite Name e-2391 Willow Road ro-Lift Station #5 Guadalupe Road	hourly val standard standard 7 Day Max 79 9 12-1 96.7	lues are m level is ex level is ex level is ex 04/27/2024 <u>64.5</u> 10.9 <u>72.6</u>	issing. ceeded. ccccica. 04/28/2024 <u>67.4</u> 12.1 7 <u>8.2</u>	76.3 8.1 80.2	04/30/2024 <u>79.9</u> <u>96.7</u>	2024	May 05/02/2024 <u>64.6</u> <u>80.3</u>	05/03/2024 17.5 15.8
Asteris Cell co Cell co Bas Cn SCC SL SCC SL SCC SL	ad Data: Qui k (*) indicate or is <u>red</u> if n or is <u>yellow</u> ty Si 0 Arroyo Grand 0 Atascade 0 Nipomo-Oso 0 Nipomo-Oso 0 Nipomo-Oso	ek or Select Form es 25% or more l lational 24-hour if state 24-hour if state 24-hour if e Name e-2391 Willow Road ro-Lift Station #5 Guadalupe Road o Flaco Lake Road	hourly val standard standard 7 Day hax 79.9 12:1 96.7 57.5	lues are m level is ex level is ex level is ex 04/27/2024 <u>64.5</u> 10.9 <u>72.6</u> 04.9	issing. cceeded. cceuted. 04/28/2024 <u>67.4</u> 12.1 7 <u>8.2</u> 43.8	76.3 8.1 80.2 48.6	04/30/2024 7 <u>9.9</u> <u>96.7</u> <u>57.5</u>	2024	May 05/02/2024 <u>64.6</u> <u>80.3</u> 47.3	05/03/2024 17.5 15.8 47.3
Asteris Cell co Cell co Cell co SCC SL SCC SL SCC SL SCC SL	k (*) indicate or is red if n or is yellow ty Si Arroyo Grand Atascade Nipomo-Oso Nipomo-Oso Nipomo-Oso Nipomo-Oso Nipomo-Oso	ck or Select Form ational 24-hour if state 24-hour if state 24-hour ite Name e-2391 Willow Road ro-Lift Station #5 Guadalupe Road o Flaco Lake Road -Regional Park	at hourly val standard standard 7 Day Max 79 9 12:1 96.7 57.5 42.9	lues are m level is ex level is ex level is ex d4/27/2024 <u>64.5</u> 10.9 <u>72.6</u> 04.9 22.5	issing. cceeded. CCCCCCC 04/28/2024 67.4 78.2 43.8 31.2	76.3 8.1 80.2 48.6 36.6	04/30/2024 79.9 96.7 57.5 42.9	2024 05/01/2024 57.6 58.8 50.9 41.0	May 05/02/2024 64.6 80.3 47.3 40.5	05/03/2024 17.5 15.8 47.3 16.6

Violations of the California PM10 Standard from the Air Resources Board air quality website. The red-circled items are the 24-hour PM10 readings from the two air quality monitoring stations that are on the Nipomo Mesa and operated by the SLOAPCD. These circled values indicate violations of the state's PM10 standard. There were 14 violations, including six days in a row. The violations spanned over just 12 days, from April 27, 2024 to May 7, 2024.