

2007-01-25 OHV C1 x

STATE OF CALIFORNIA

OFF-HIGHWAY MOTOR VEHICLE RECREATION COMMISSION

REGULAR MEETING

Thursday, January 25th, 2007

9:10 a.m. to 5:19 p.m.

held at

Red Lion Hotel
1401 Arden Way
Sacramento, California

Commissioners Present: Anderson, Brissenden, McMillin,
Priznich, Spitler and Thomas
Commissioner Absent: Willard

Reported by CHERYL L. KYLE, CSR No. 7014

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
Certified Shorthand Reporters
2315 Capitol Avenue, Suite 1010
Sacramento, CA 95816

916-492-1010

877-453-1010

FAX 916-492-1222

2

3 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Good morning, welcome to the
4 Off-Highway Vehicle Commission meeting to discuss
5 grants and other wonderful things. Cheryl, thanks for
6 transcribing all of this. So without further ado, I
7 will look to Mardi to hold the flag and Phil to lead us
8 in the Pledge of Allegiance.

9 (Pledged the Flag.)

10 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Thank you, Mardi. The agenda
11 says roll call. I will call out Michael Priznich, who
12 is now the retired sheriff of Amador County.

13 COMMISSIONER PRIZNICH: Here.

14 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Mark McMillin from San Diego.

15 COMMISSIONER McMILLIN: Here.

16 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Judith Anderson from -- where
17 are you from?

18 VICE-CHAIR ANDERSON: Montrose.

19 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: And Hal Thomas.

20 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: Sacramento, here.

21 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Paul Spittler, all across the
22 map. And I'm here from Hope Valley. So thank you all
23 for being here. Obviously, Mardi, you need to do a
24 better job of selling tickets.

25 OHMVR STAFF STALLCOP: Can we move everybody to
263

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 the front?

2 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: As in the past if you want to
3 be heard, please submit the appropriately colored
4 cards. We will have an eleven o'clock public forum,

5 which I believe is the blue cards.

6 And I think, as in the meeting in November, we
7 were somewhat informal on the Consent items, but we
8 will go over that and Phil will fill us in, and Ken
9 will go over the procedure for comments on Consent when
10 it is time.

11 Do I have approval of the agenda?

12 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: So moved.

13 COMMISSIONER McMILLIN: Second.

14 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: It's been moved and seconded.

15 All those in favor?

16 (Commissioners simultaneously voted.)

17 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: And I will dispense with my
18 mantra about being respectful, as I think that's gotten
19 across, and we have had some successful meetings with
20 limited sources of funds and a limited amount of time,
21 we just want to proceed with the most civil process
22 possible.

23 So without any other things to do, I know the
24 Deputy Director is dispensing with her report this
25 morning. We will have that on Saturday morning; is

264

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 that correct? So our unfinished business this morning
2 is local assistance grants in the non-CESA category.

3 And who on staff will be guiding us through?

4 CHIEF JENKINS: Let me begin.

5 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: You know what, I did overlook
6 one thing. Can you introduce everybody that's
7 assisting the Division on staff and introduce them all,

8 please?

9 CHIEF JENKINS: Good morning, Commissioners, so
10 nice to be here. This morning here at the table, let
11 me see who I'm looking down the table at. So I assume
12 you all know me, Phil Jenkins, Chief of the Division,
13 and, of course, Deputy Director Greene here. Tim
14 LaFranchi is with us today, of course, our chief
15 counsel. So then we have grant administrators who you
16 will be hearing from throughout the day as we go
17 through the projects. So John Pelonio is the first one
18 of our law enforcement officers at the Division.
19 Kelly, raise your hand there, Kelly. Kelly Roach, also
20 one of our law enforcement officers of the Division.
21 And Larry Bellucci is here with us today for the last
22 time. He is going to be moving on -- he received a new
23 position in another department, so it's going to be
24 quite a loss, Larry, he's been very good for us here.
25 And I want to thank you, Larry, for all of the good

265

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 work that you've done while you were here, and it's
2 going to be really hard to see you go.
3 DEPUTY DIR. GREENE: Actually, we'd like to say
4 Larry has been gone. He went to State Lands
5 Commission. And I would just like to applaud Larry for
6 his dedication to this program because it was through
7 no push of our own, but Larry offered to come back. He
8 has been gone from the Division for a couple weeks now
9 and offered to come back to make sure that he provided
10 the input that he has had on the grants throughout the

11 entire last year. So, Larry, thank I do appreciate it.

12 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: We get to pile on, too, and
13 say thanks from the Commission.

14 CHIEF JENKINS: And then Barbara Greenwood, who
15 is becoming one of our longest term grant
16 administrators. Next to Barbara is Martha Ibarra, who
17 has been coming on very strong here this last several
18 months and has been helpful to us. And, of course,
19 Kenny Glaspie, who not only works on grants, also works
20 on the RTP program. If you do RTP grants, you would
21 have spoken with Kenny on those things.

22 Back in the back hiding over -- there how did
23 you get way over there in the back, Dan? Dan Kentfield
24 is our newest addition. Stand up, Dan. He actually
25 showed enough dedication that actually before he began

266

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 the job he was at the last Commission meeting to begin
2 getting the lay of the land and really understanding
3 how the process works. And I've got to say, just the
4 very short time he's been with us since the last
5 meeting to now, it's been very -- it's always great to
6 get fresh eyes, new ideas coming in. And Dan has been
7 a great addition to the team.

8 Across the room, of course, we all saw during
9 the salute Mardi over there helping us out looking like
10 Lady Liberty with that flag. Thank you, Mardi, for
11 that. Cannot forget Vicki Perez, our assistant to the
12 Deputy Director and myself. And helping us on all of
13 the AV stuff today -- is it just you today as far as

14 the AV stuff? Aaron Freitas and Joanna Parra are going
15 to be helping us on the AV stuff and keep those things
16 all in order.

17 Who do we have out in the audience? Tom
18 Bernardo out in the audience, one of the
19 superintendents of the Division that helps us on so
20 many things, specializes in a lot of the sound issues,
21 a whole variety of issues that he helping us and
22 advises us on. And, of course, Jennifer Buckingham
23 works on a lot of our environmental issues and whatnot,
24 very nice to have you here.

25 Who else? Bob Williamson, the superintendent 267

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 for Prairie City is here observing today, as well. So
2 have I missed anybody from our staff? That's it.

3 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Thank you. We have dispensed
4 with the federal agency reports today. They're welcome
5 to comment if there is anything special at the public
6 forum at eleven o'clock. We do respectfully request
7 that in the future, that the federal agencies do
8 provide us a written report for the binders before they
9 go out, as we discussed, I think, at the last meeting.
10 And any additional remarks can be made at the various
11 Commission meetings. So thank you for that.

12 COMMISSIONER PRIZMICH: Mr. Chair, on the
13 Consent agenda, if we want items taken off, when would
14 the time frame be?

15 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: That will be momentarily.

16 COMMISSIONER PRIZMICH: Okay.

17 CHAIR BRISSSENDEN: So we will move to that
18 Consent agenda, unless there are additional remarks or
19 advice from staff.

20 CHIEF JENKINS: Just if I could really briefly
21 describe. The spreadsheets look slightly different
22 from the last meeting, so I thought I would let you
23 know what you're looking at there. If you look at the
24 packet that was handed out today of the spreadsheets,
25 you'll see that the first portion are white

268

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 spreadsheets, then you have the buff color or yellow
2 colored sheets behind that.

3 What we were doing here is the projects that
4 were heard at the last two meetings and that you have
5 already done the final scoring and the funding
6 determinations have been made there, those are all
7 recorded on those white sheets, so that we wanted
8 everybody to be able to see. I know at the last
9 meeting people were asking us to put it up on the
10 screen as you finished going through various
11 categories. So that's what reflected on the white
12 sheets here.

13 If you go back through the packet to page eight
14 of 613, which would be the last page for the
15 restoration grants, you see we highlighted those last
16 two restoration projects that we had left as kind of
17 hanging unfinished decision on how to treat those at
18 the last meeting. So those still need to be dealt with
19 at this meeting. We can go into that whenever you're

20 ready.

21 And then behind that you have all of the buff
22 colored sheets, and all of those buff colored sheets
23 are what we need to go through today.

24 CHAIR BRISSSENDEN: So the pleasure of the
25 Commission. I know there have been a couple of side

269

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 conversations, and I would appreciate that we not have
2 them at this time, the side conversations.

3 With regards to how to proceed today, with which
4 category first, so I'll defer to my Commissioners to
5 give me guidance.

6 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: Mr. Chairman, the reason
7 we're having side conversations is we are trying to get
8 oriented with the materials. Let me ask a couple of
9 questions so that we can put it on the record, as
10 opposed to merely just asking ourselves.

11 CHAIR BRISSSENDEN: Perfect.

12 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: The question was asked to
13 me, and I didn't have an answer, at what point did we
14 do the conservation projects. My recollection was we
15 spent the bulk of our time on law enforcement and
16 restoration. Was conservation items done first?

17 DEPUTY DIR. GREENE: Conservation projects were
18 the first projects that you heard, Commissioners. And
19 so we took them in the order. So it was conservation,
20 law enforcement, restoration. The two outstanding
21 restoration projects, which will be heard today, are
22 highlighted in yellow on page eight.

23 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: Thank you very much. That
24 helps my recollection, fading recollection.

25 Also, can you help us by providing the 270

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 application volume number when we get to the two
2 restoration grants. Because in trying to retrieve that
3 original application, I am overwhelmed by the number of
4 different documents.

5 CHIEF JENKINS: If you look at page eight of 13,
6 the third or fourth column across, volume of pages
7 listed there for those two projects, and then in the
8 findings binder that page where you would find the
9 findings that we have are also listed as a reference
10 there.

11 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: Eight of 13 is the sheet,
12 but I'm looking for the volumes; that's right. Six
13 one -- thank you very much. 6-1 and 4-1, 61. Thank
14 you. I will try to retrieve them.

15 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Do you need a movement for
16 retrieval?

17 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: Just go ahead.

18 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: I'm reminded that we will
19 stay on Consent and then we'll go to how we want to
20 approach, in what order, the rest of the grants.
21 What's the pleasure of the Commission with regards to
22 Consent?

23 VICE-CHAIR ANDERSON: Any order.

24 COMMISSIONER SPITLER: I would assume that we're
25 going to do the entire Consent list. We will do the

1 entire Consent agenda first, and then we will move to
2 the actual consideration of grants that aren't on
3 Consent?

4 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: That's the order as it's been
5 in the past. So do we have Commissioners wanting to
6 pull or put on? So I'll start with Commissioner
7 Priznich.

8 COMMISSIONER PRIZNICH: Yes, on Consent agenda
9 Item No. 23 of the first page of the yellow sheets,
10 Item No. 23, OR-795, that's San Bernardino County
11 Sheriff, Victor Valley, I would like to have that
12 removed from Consent.

13 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: Could you give me the
14 line.

15 COMMISSIONER PRIZNICH: Item No. 23.

16 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: 23, I'm sorry.

17 COMMISSIONER PRIZNICH: And then two lines down
18 from that, Item No. 25, OR-818, San Bernardino County
19 Sheriff, Barstow, have that removed. These are
20 equipment grants I think.

21 And then line number 29, OR-785, Yucca Valley,
22 I'd like to have that removed. Thank you.

23 COMMISSIONER McMILLIN: I have line 58 on the
24 third page of those, Gold Rock Outdoor Schools.

25 COMMISSIONER SPITLER: I have on the same page
272

1 lines 68 and 69, El Dorado County General Services; and
2 line 78 Yolo County Parks, Department Planning.

3 VICE-CHAIR ANDERSON: On that same page, I have
4 number 55.

5 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Any other Consent items that
6 should be removed or put on wishful thinking? Seeing
7 no other movement, are we still needing a little time,
8 Mr. Thomas?

9 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: Just to clarify, will
10 requests from the public to remove items from the
11 Consent Calendar follow the Commission's request?

12 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: That would be appropriate.

13 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: Thank you.

14 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: So now that the Commission
15 has pulled their items, do we have -- okay. The
16 Consent list requests for removal do not have the line
17 item numbers it appears. So I will, with the help of
18 staff, just call these folks up at this time as to why
19 they want to be off of Consent. Is that what you're
20 suggesting, Commissioner Spittler?

21 COMMISSIONER SPITLER: Yes.

22 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: So at this time I will hear
23 in this order. Bruce Cann, BLM Arcata, and then Bruce
24 Brazil following, Don Amador following Bruce.

25 BRUCE CANN: My name is Bruce Cann with BLM

273

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 Arcata Field Office, and I'd like to -- line 83, the
2 Arcata Field Office, Trail Maintenance, be removed from
3 the Consent.

4 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: So removed.
5 BRUCE BRAZIL: Bruce Brazil, California Enduro
6 Riders Association. And I've got, I believe, two items
7 on that list. The first one is line item one,
8 OR-1-N0-68. And I'd have to dig through a bunch of
9 these. Could you possibly call out the other one for
10 me?
11 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Yes, it's OR-1-CD-370.
12 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: If you don't know the
13 line, how did you get the number?
14 BRUCE BRAZIL: Project number.
15 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Is it 95 perhaps, Bruce? Are
16 you concurring with that, it's number 95?
17 BRUCE BRAZIL: Yes, I am. Thank you.
18 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: That's the Ridgecrest.
19 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Ridgecrest Field Office.
20 DON AMADOR: Don Amador, Blue Ribbon Coalition.
21 Items 16, 41, and 91; 16, 41 and 91.
22 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Next, I have Richard Collins,
23 then behind Richard would be John Stewart.
24 RICHARD COLLINS: Richard Collins, County of
25 Yucca Valley Police Department, OR-75. I forget what

274

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 line number that is down near the bottom.
2 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: That item has been pulled.
3 RICHARD COLLINS: Okay. Thank you.
4 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: So John Stewart, you have
5 various grants, I suppose, specific.
6 JOHN STEWART: Yes, John Stewart, California

7 Association of 4-Wheel Drive Clubs, United 4-Wheel
8 Drive Associations and Teirra de Sol 4-Wheel Drive
9 Club. Let's see if I can get all of these here. It
10 should be line 45.

11 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: While you're looking, John, I
12 just have to remind the general public that our
13 transcriber cannot hear what she needs to transcribe if
14 you're chatting in the background. So please keep your
15 comments to the outer spaces.

16 JOHN STEWART: Line 45, line 62, and line number
17 96. Thank you.

18 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Phil, who am I looking to to
19 keep track of all of these?

20 CHIEF JENKINS: Aaron is keeping an electronic
21 record of all of these.

22 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Shepherding the meeting and
23 trying to keep track of all of these numbers is not
24 conducive to doing both at the same time.

25 Next, would be Sky; is that right? Sky

275

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 Zaffarano? How did I butcher that?

2 SKY ZAFFARANO: Pretty good.

3 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: Pretty good butcher.

4 SKY ZAFFARANO: Sky Zaffarano, Redding BLM. I
5 would like to remove Item 94.

6 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: And Ray McCray followed by
7 Jim Keeler.

8 RAY McCRAY: Ray McCray, and I'd like to request
9 removal of line 101; it's OR-2-SR-35 and request

10 removal from Consent Calendar.

11 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Thank you.

12 Mr. Keeler, this is why the BLM is having
13 trouble with their budget. You could have put
14 everything on one sheet, but you used three.

15 JIM KEELER: I apologize, sir.

16 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: That's good.

17 JIM KEELER: And to make it even worse, you have
18 the three numbers that I wanted to pull.

19 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: 65, 88, and 43.

20 JIM KEELER: Thank you very much, sir.

21 COMMISSIONER McMILLIN: Is the list on the
22 screen the complete list so far?

23 OHMVR STAFF FREITAS: Yes.

24 COMMISSIONER McMILLIN: Is the screen just the
25 ones that the public has been requesting?

276

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 OHMVR STAFF FREITAS: This is just the public.

2 VICE-CHAIR ANDERSON: Mr. Chair?

3 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Yes, Commissioner Anderson.

4 COMMISSIONER SPITLER: Excuse me, question

5 for --

6 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: 65, 88 and 43.

7 COMMISSIONER SPITLER: 43 is the Plumas National
8 Forest. Mr. Keeler.

9 JIM KEELER: I'll have to check. I'm sorry.

10 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: Will the BLM kindly remove
11 the Forest Service?

12 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: So under Fred Krueger, I can

13 save you coming up here if we want to do this, 43 and
14 93 is what you're requesting?

15 FRED KRUEGER: Thank you very much,
16 Mr. Chairman.

17 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Tom Tammone wants OR-798. Do
18 you know which line item that is?

19 TOM TAMMONE: It's 58. I believe it's already
20 off Consent.

21 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: I believe Mr. McMillin pulled
22 that.

23 TOM TAMMONE: Okay. I pass.

24 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: And for the Tahoe, David
25 Michael would like line 102 removed from Consent; is

277

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 that correct?

2 Don Amador, I'm afraid I can't grant this all if
3 needed. He already spoke, okay.

4 Eric Hurtado, is there an Eric on the grounds?
5 OR-816 and OR-781. Do you have the lines on those?

6 ERIC HURTADO: Nine and 33.

7 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Nine and 33. Does that leave
8 anything left on Consent? Okay. There are two more
9 yellow cards for Santa Clara County Parks, Lisa
10 Killough has requested 97 be taken off. And the
11 Angeles Forest has requested that number 82 be removed,
12 as well.

13 Any further comments from the Commission?

14 VICE-CHAIR ANDERSON: And I have one additional
15 request, number 46.

16 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Number 46.
17 I'm sorry, do you want to come forward?
18 MONA DANIELS: I should have had a form up
19 there. Palm Springs, line item 73. Mona Daniels, Palm
20 Springs.
21 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: So noted.
22 DEPUTY DIR. GREENE: Mona, can you make sure
23 that you actually submit a yellow form to Mardi,
24 please?
25 MONA DANIELS: Yes.

278

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 KAREN MCKINLEY: Karen McKinley, Los Padres,
2 Items 60 and 90. I handed my papers in early.
3 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Items 60 and 90, so noted.
4 Those last two individuals, if they could make out
5 yellow slips, I do not have them.
6 DOUG HUBBARD: I had turned in yellow -- Doug
7 Hubbard, San Bernardino County Sheriff's Department. I
8 had turned in yellow slips for 23 and 25, and Sheriff
9 Priznich pulled those. I just wanted to reiterate our
10 request to have those removed from the calendar.
11 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: It can't get any better than
12 having Sheriff Priznich pull them.
13 COMMISSIONER SPITLER: We will remove them
14 again.
15 DOUG HUBBARD: Thank you.
16 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: So seeing no further movement
17 in the audience and no further yellow slips, do I have
18 a motion on Consent?

19 COMMISSIONER PRIZMICH: I'll make that motion.

20 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: It's been moved.

21 COMMISSIONER SPITLER: And seconded.

22 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: All those remaining on
23 Consent will be approved at this time by signaling aye.

24 (Commissioners simultaneously voted.)

25 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: We're all in favor. Good.

279

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 Suggestions on how to handle the balance of the grants
2 in what order?

3 COMMISSIONER SPITLER: I think we had two grants
4 that were carried over from the last meeting that seems
5 like we ought to dispatch of right off the bat.

6 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: So those two would be line
7 items 26 and 27 under Restoration, the Mendocino
8 National Forest and the Eldorado National Forest. And
9 who do we have on staff, John? Do you want to review
10 those for us please, briefly?

11 CHIEF JENKINS: So I'll have John review those
12 in just a moment. I just wanted to say before we get
13 going here on these two, I had the questions about
14 those at that last meeting and needed to pull those off
15 and really take a hard look at them. We really
16 appreciate the patience that the National Forest
17 Service staff, both in those individual locations and
18 the regional office staff, has had with us going
19 through this process. We've had a number of
20 discussions with them since then seeking clarification
21 of exactly what was planned for these projects as they

22 moved forward.

23 And that's why after quite a bit of deliberation
24 with them and trying to sort through what was really
25 the intent of these projects, I feel comfortable with
280

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 that's why they're back here before us today. Just
2 wanted to say I really appreciate the Forest Service
3 working with us on this, and I think with the
4 additional clarification that they plan to provide
5 today, that everything is going to be -- hopefully what
6 they'll provide to you is sufficient information to
7 make these eligible restoration grants.

8 So with that, John, do you want to go through
9 numbers, and we will start from there?

10 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Thank you. There is a
11 question from Commissioner Thomas.

12 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: One question. We have the
13 Thomas Creek staff report that was just handed to us.
14 I gather that is from our staff?

15 CHIEF JENKINS: No, that came from the Forest
16 Service staff.

17 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: Would there also be one
18 for El Dorado?

19 CHIEF JENKINS: I don't know if El Dorado had
20 planned to do it verbally or in writing.

21 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: This looks like a very
22 good job. I would -- second one, I would like to look
23 at it a while...

24 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Can you move your mikes
Page 18

25 closer?

281

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: The staff report for
2 Thomas Creek, or the national forest report, is
3 thorough on first look. If there is an Eldorado
4 report, I'd like to see that as well so I can analyze
5 the Eldorado. Thank you.

6 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Any further comments,
7 suggestions, before John reviews these two?

8 Go ahead, John.

9 OHMVR STAFF PELONIO: Page eight, line 26, U.S.
10 Forest Service Eldorado National Forest, restoration
11 project. Requested amount was \$162,186. The score was
12 18 for zero percent and zero dollars.

13 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: I have Mendocino first.

14 OHMVR STAFF PELONIO: Line 26, Mendocino
15 National Forest, Thomas Creek, Restoration. Requested
16 amount, \$75,680, a score of 23 for zero percent
17 funding.

18 JACK HORNER: Good morning, Commissioners. My
19 name is Jack Horner. I'm the forest recreation officer
20 on the Mendocino National Forest. And we would like to
21 refer you also to the handout that we did with the
22 rescoring of the project. We believe that with the
23 misunderstanding that we think the state had on whether
24 or not this fell into planning or restoration, that the
25 scoring wasn't quite adequate.

282

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax
Page 19

1 We went through the process, and in summary,
2 number one, if you looked at the scoring under number
3 one, you would see that we actually do have key
4 wildlife habitat, Lake Successional Reserve for the
5 Northern Spotted owl in that area, Thomas Creek area.
6 We have suitable habitat for bald eagle, peregrine
7 falcon and Goshawk hawks, and a very high probability of
8 prehistoric sites in the area. The Thomas Creek itself
9 is eligible for wild and scenic river status. And in
10 our land management plan, we went through that process.
11 We have not carried that forward yet. And the proposed
12 Devil's Basin Research National Area also borders that
13 area.

14 What we found out during the inventory, the
15 inventory that we did for the route designation, was
16 that there were a number of routes that were being used
17 by motorized equipment in these back country areas. In
18 the application that we turned in, there is a color map
19 that shows all of the routes that were being used out
20 there.

21 And so we think that the score on number one
22 should be moved from zero, which the state had given
23 us, up to a 32. On number two, we would like to see it
24 moved from 10 points up to 15, based on the fact that
25 the forest has been a pioneer in using specialized

283

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 equipment, erosion control methods, native seed

2 collection, propagation, fertilization formulas, and
3 strategic cross slope tree falling and area came to try
4 to disguise the use out there so that others won't come
5 and continue to use that.

6 We developed innovative no dig fencing and even
7 sandy -- the Forest Service San Demas Research Center
8 has come up to look at some of the restoration projects
9 we've done to try to give direction to other Forest
10 Service offices to help them. We've got many partners
11 that we use out there. That's why we think the points
12 should be up to 14 in that area.

13 Also, I like to recommend number three changing
14 the score from five up to 12 out of 20. The
15 application identifies signs, barriers, restoration,
16 and LE patrols and monitoring that will be implemented
17 with our land management plan direction that we already
18 have, that says it will be a back country prescription
19 area.

20 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Please, summarize.

21 JACK HORNER: Okay. Number four, we'd like to
22 see it at eight points, instead of the zero that was
23 given.

24 (Audio equipment interference.)

25 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Can you translate the Morse
284

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 code for us?

2 JACK HORNER: That was a good one. I'm not too
3 good at Morse code.

4 The last one, 25, the Mendocino has already

5 received 56 grants from the state, and I guess because
6 we didn't list all of those 56 grants out on the
7 application, we got very few points for that, eight
8 points instead of the 14 or 15, like I'd like to see us
9 get. And so my plea to you would be to look at
10 increasing the scores. We have had 56 grants over a
11 24-year period for a total of about \$11 million. We've
12 done a very good job of using that money on the ground
13 to provide opportunities for the public and protect the
14 environment. So thank you for your consideration.

15 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Thank you. Don't you get
16 fewer points for the more money you get; isn't that it?
17 That doesn't explain it.

18 BRENT SCHORADT: Good morning, I'm Brent
19 Schoradt with the California Wilderness Coalition, and
20 we'd like to just support the good comment made by the
21 Mendocino National Forest. I think in category one, we
22 heard about the Lake Successional Reserves, which we
23 commonly refer to as old-growth forest, and something
24 that wasn't mentioned is the fact that Thomas Creek is
25 a tributary to the Sacramento River, which is an

285

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 important salmon fishery for the State of California.
2 And so I think they definitely deserve full points, 40
3 out of 40, for category one, which is the project which
4 provides critical environmental benefits.

5 And under category two, for efficient use of
6 funds, we've been sort of following up with the
7 Mendocino National Forest, and I can say of the forests

8 that we work with across the state, there are 18
9 national forests, that Mendocino National Forest is
10 leading the way in terms of good restoration work. And
11 I think they are using efficient use of funds, so they
12 deserve 15 out of 15.

13 And for monitoring, which I believe is category
14 four -- yes, category four, I can attest to the fact
15 that these guys are really leading the way in
16 monitoring. I have a PowerPoint presentation on my
17 computer that has six or seven restoration projects
18 that these guys have been following since the mid
19 1980s, so 20 years, the last 20 years you can see the
20 impacts of this restoration work. And, you know, I've
21 heard the restoration program be criticized in saying
22 giving money to federal agencies is like pouring money
23 down a hole, but really I think this forest is leading
24 the way in terms of showing the critical benefits that
25 restoration provides. And you can see it by seeing the
286

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 photos that they've provided to the public really on
2 quick notice because they're proud of the work that
3 they do, and we're proud to be partners with them. So
4 we encourage as high of a score as we can possibly
5 grant in terms of that monitoring category. Thank you.

6 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Thank you.

7 KAREN SCHAMBACH: Karen Schambach, Center for
8 Sierra Nevada Conservation and PEER. I would just echo
9 Mr. Schoradt's comments, and I'm glad that the
10 Division, that the agency has straightened out the

11 confusion over these grants, and I would like to see
12 this particular one, as Mr. Schoradt said, Mendocino is
13 not only leading the way on providing opportunity and
14 maintenance and good management, but also on
15 restoration. I would like to see them funded. Thank
16 you.

17 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Thank you. The comment in
18 the middle of that reminds me to remind everyone to
19 turn their cell phones off, please.

20 JOHN STEWART: Good morning, Commissioners, John
21 Stewart, California Association of 4-Wheel Drive Clubs,
22 United 4-Wheel Drive, and Tierra de Sol 4-Wheel Drive
23 Club. I've got to go on record with the community here
24 in saying that we believe the original scores reflected
25 are accurate. When you hear this, you hear a lot of

287

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 words such as suitable, probable, there is nothing that
2 really designates factual information. It's just all
3 highly questionable that something is being done;
4 therefore, this grant looks like it's based on a flawed
5 process with nothing definitive that will benefit. So
6 thank you.

7 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Any further comments?
8 Commissioners?

9 COMMISSIONER PRIZMICH: I have a question I
10 guess. I don't remember who made the comment, I
11 believe it was the first presenter, but there was a
12 question as to whether this was a planning or
13 restoration grant. And I've heard the same commentary

14 come up in the past, confusion from the applicants over
15 whether their application should be placed in planning
16 or restoration. Can I have staff maybe make some
17 comments on how these categories are decided?

18 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: I think there can be planning
19 within restoration grants.

20 COMMISSIONER PRIZMICH: I understand. There
21 seems to be some confusion, and the confusion ends up
22 affecting the applicants' process if they put it in
23 there.

24 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: So John or Phil, whoever,
25 would like to respond to that.

288

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 CHIEF JENKINS: I'll try to be as concise as I
2 can on an admittedly confusing issue. First point is
3 that the projects are in planning or restoration based
4 on the criteria that the applicant has filled out. So
5 these two projects, the applicants filled out the
6 restoration criteria, and so that's why they are placed
7 in this bucket, this category.

8 The question that arose during the course of the
9 last meeting was does the work that's proposed to be
10 done, the deliverables, if you will, the activities to
11 be performed, qualify as actual restoration eligible
12 costs. And where planning fits together with
13 restoration, what we've tried to make clear in the
14 regulations, clearly something that we're trying to be
15 much better on next year with the applicants themselves
16 to remove this confusion, is that difference between if

17 there is actual work to be done and you need to have
18 some planning associated with that. So the planning
19 will definitely lead to restoration work to be
20 accomplished, then that is qualifying. If it is
21 planning that is much more general in nature where you
22 need to do some analysis of a project and there may or
23 may not at the end of the planning project be actual
24 restoration work occurring, then that would be looked
25 at as just a pure planning process because you don't

289

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 know that that's going to actually result in any
2 restoration work to be done.

3 If the planning is a necessary first step in an
4 actual restoration effort moving forward, then that's
5 tied directly to some restoration activities, and
6 that's where these two projects, hopefully with the
7 information you're receiving from the applicants,
8 you'll be able to determine whether or not these two
9 projects are leading to actual -- you know, as a result
10 of these projects, restoration will be occurring. And
11 that's why they would qualify as planning for
12 restoration here.

13 I know that that is difficult concept, because
14 it's that line between what is and what isn't.
15 Perhaps, counselor.

16 COUNSEL LaFRANCHI: If I could just add, I think
17 if you -- the way I've been looking at it is you need
18 to look at the work product, the deliverable, what is
19 it that the project is going to produce. If it's going

20 to produce, for example, an engineer of grading plans
21 specific to the area that shows how the earth is going
22 to be moved, if it's going to develop a landscape plan
23 to show what plants are going to be planted and
24 replaced, it's going to develop an engineering plan to
25 show what barriers are going to be placed, those sorts
290

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 of things, or it's going to do some project specific
2 CEQA or NEPA, which is maybe for that 20 acres of
3 restoration, they need to go out and do a few surveys
4 to be sure they know what species are there and what
5 needs to be done as they're going through the project,
6 that would be a project specific restoration planning
7 type work product or output deliverable.

8 If, however -- and as I look through some of
9 these applications, if, however, they've gone in and
10 this was closed in 1995, but they haven't yet decided
11 which routes are actually going to be restored, which
12 routes are going to be kept for a red -- a mention in
13 one of the applications, they hadn't decided which were
14 going to be motorized versus non-motorized, they
15 haven't finished that decision process, that is the
16 work output then would be some sort of a decision
17 document or a planning document that says these trails
18 we're going to keep for some purpose, hiking or
19 equestrian, these trails we're going to close and
20 restore, that would be the work output, and there would
21 be general planning as opposed to the more project
22 specific and engineering site plan or design.

23 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Mike, does that get to where
24 you needed to be in terms of explanation?

25 COMMISSIONER PRIZMICH: Yes, I thank the staff
291

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 for that. It just seems that this commentary comes up
2 often, and I guess what I'd like for us to get to,
3 particularly in this area, if an applicant seems to be
4 misguided in terms of their application, I don't know
5 if the staff -- and I'm assuming they do, but there
6 seems to be a disconnect, to straighten that misguided
7 approach to their application out prior to submission.

8 We're going through all of this, and perhaps it
9 could have been corrected earlier in the process. I'm
10 assuming that does occur with staff, but it seems to me
11 it comes up pretty regularly that there is a disconnect
12 between planning and restoration applications, and
13 they're placed in the wrong box. They're put in the
14 wrong hand, and I don't know if there is a way of
15 straightening that out.

16 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Well, I think Phil's
17 explanation at the front end of this conversation
18 probably should have been taped for the criteria
19 workshop for the applicants.

20 COMMISSIONER PRIZMICH: And we've gone over that
21 before. It seems it continues to come up. I'm just
22 trying to smooth the process out.

23 CHIEF JENKINS: And what we're doing, we have
24 heard that loud and clear from the applicants and the
25 Commission and the public that we need to get a better

1 process in for that. So as we've been looking through
2 how we're going to do the intake process next year,
3 first of all, we're going to back up and spend quite a
4 bit of time on this at our workshops, as we work with
5 the applicants before they ever put their projects
6 together. And we're building in some check-off
7 procedures so that when things come through the door,
8 we spend a lot more time right at the front end really
9 evaluating to make sure that a project is in the
10 correct category so that we don't end up at this point
11 next year.

12 COMMISSIONER PRIZMICH: I think when we started
13 this whole process, we really took a pretty
14 conservative approach to the competitive process, and I
15 think that got in our way at times. And I'm not laying
16 any blame. I think it sometimes gets in the way of the
17 process, if you haven't put this in the right box and
18 we're not going to look at it. And I'm glad to hear
19 that, you know, there are some efforts.

20 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: I think the flexibility is
21 real important to make sure this stuff gets on the
22 ground in the right way.

23 So are there comments from Commissioner Thomas?

24 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: I am concerned about the
25 statement about the distinction between planning and

293

1 restoration that's been proposed by staff, in that if
2 what you're saying is that segregating the decision to
3 proceed or not is planning, and restoration is the
4 actual act after you've decided to proceed, that runs
5 counter to NEPA. Because NEPA is inherently part of
6 the decision to act, it's the decision to either
7 evaluate an act in one way or evaluate an act in
8 another way, or a variant of a third way. But that all
9 precedes and is part of the decision to act, this
10 analysis. And if we put the analysis in a planning box
11 and not in the acting box, we really contradict NEPA,
12 and we make it impossible to fund the NEPA decision
13 making it as part of our restoration program. And I
14 don't think we want to do that because that analysis is
15 the core part of the act.

16 So I would ask the staff to kind of reconsider
17 the distinction of the boxes that you've outlined.

18 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: What I was hearing from the
19 chief was that there was flexibility now being put in
20 the process. Am I not hearing that correctly?

21 CHIEF JENKINS: I think we're all driving at the
22 same point. It's that thing -- it is that issue of --
23 very difficult to discuss these things sometimes in the
24 abstract because there are so many iterations of how
25 all of the different thoughts and issues can fit

294

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 together. It's much clearer when you're looking at an
2 actual -- on this project, where are we, what would be
3 the result of the planning process. And so some of the

4 difficulty as we struggle forth, getting our heads
5 wrapped around where we're going with this stuff.

6 But just on the broadest terms, I hear what
7 you're saying. I understand that point. But on the
8 broadest terms, is this a planning for planning's sake,
9 in other words, what do we want to do in this area
10 generally or here's where we are going, now we need to
11 look at all of the alternatives and how to get there.
12 I mean it is a line there that we have to spend a lot
13 of time making sure that we're all talking about the
14 same thing. I know that is just a confusing concept
15 for I would imagine everybody in the room. It
16 certainly is for me.

17 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: My point was that you
18 can't make the decision to proceed until NEPA is
19 complete. I know as a practical matter people ignore
20 that on a regular basis. They say I want to do X, and
21 now let's go do NEPA, and they do it as a procedure
22 thing on the way to doing X. But that's not the way
23 the law is written, and that's not the way it's
24 intended, and that's why environmental groups spend
25 their lives litigating that issue because you can't

295

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 decide first, and then analyze second, and then fund.
2 You have to do the analysis and decision as part of the
3 same act, and that's why our restoration grants need to
4 give money to enable that act. And if you push the
5 decision into another box, I call it planning, we
6 disable the ability to restore, and that's my point.

7 COUNSEL LaFRANCHI: I would just like to add, I
8 understand, Commissioner Thomas, what you are saying,
9 and that's something that we're kind of struggling
10 with, how do we really fix that in a way that makes
11 some sense. And I think it goes back to how the
12 applicants are defining their project for NEPA or CEQA
13 purposes. This is just my current state of thinking.
14 If they define that as a restoration project, you know,
15 we've got all of these trails out there that need to be
16 closed or restored, and we need to do NEPA on that,
17 then we are defining the project as a restoration
18 project. As you know, as well as I do, both CEQA and
19 NEPA require the agencies to define their project in a
20 fairly good manner.

21 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: First, right.

22 COUNSEL LaFRANCHI: So the public knows what it
23 is that's being analyzed. If, however, as Phil was
24 saying, like on the route designation, they haven't
25 quite figured it out what they're going to do with that

296

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 and their NEPA project for that purpose is we're going
2 out looking at trails, some we are going to close, some
3 we are going to keep open, and that's the project that
4 we're planning for, that could be something else.

5 And then you've got the hybrid, you could have a
6 little bit of both within a route designation project.
7 So we're struggling with that. So I think that's what
8 Phil and we've all been talking about is how do we get
9 that sorted out so that it makes some sense.

10 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: Thank you. You're on top
11 of it. Thank you.

12 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: That was a compliment. That
13 was good. Unless you have something more to add to
14 this, I think this dialogue probably needs to keep
15 going through the next round of requests, and sort as
16 we go. And I'm sure they'll be little instances from
17 time to time that will crop up, and we will still
18 scratch our heads.

19 So I'm bringing it back to the Commission with
20 regards to how to proceed with this particular grant.

21 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: Mr. Chairman, I would take
22 what is an excellent staff report from the forest and
23 adopt their numbers and rationale in its entirety. My
24 motion would adopt their numbers, and with the comments
25 from -- I think it was the Wilderness Coalition of

297

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 increasing the criteria number one to 40 points,
2 criteria number two to 15 points, criteria number four
3 to nine points, criteria number five to 15 points,
4 which gives us a total of 90 points, and that would be
5 my motion.

6 VICE-CHAIR ANDERSON: Second that.

7 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: It's been moved and seconded
8 to approve this grant at level of 90 points, which I
9 don't know what that translates to dollars.

10 OHMVR STAFF PEREZ: Commissioner Thomas, could
11 you repeat the numbers, please?

12 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: Criteria number one, 40;
Page 33

13 criteria number two, 15; criteria number four, nine.

14 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: You missed three.

15 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: I didn't increase.

16 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: It should remain at five.

17 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: I'm sorry, criteria number
18 three is 12, which is the staff report from the forest.

19 Criteria number four is nine. Criteria number five is
20 a total of 15. And that gets us to 90.

21 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Did you capture that, Aaron?

22 So there is a motion and second on the floor.

23 Any discussion? All those in favor?

24 (Commissioners simultaneously voted.)

25 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Opposed?

298

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 COMMISSIONER McMILLIN: No.

2 COMMISSIONER PRIZMICH: No.

3 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: For the record, the
4 rationale shown in the forest staff report is part of
5 my motion. I think that was clear, but I wanted it
6 clear in the record.

7 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: That was clear in the motion.

8 So moving along to number 27.

9 OHMVR STAFF PELONIO: I have number 27, U.S.
10 Forest Service Eldorado National Forest, Restoration.
11 Requested amount \$162,186; score of 18 for zero percent
12 funding.

13 LESTER LUBETKIN: Good morning, Commissioners.
14 Thank you very much for allowing us to present on this
15 grant application. My name is Lester Lubetkin,

16 Recreation Officer on the Eldorado National Forest.

17 This project is for NEPA compliance for
18 restoration. The product that we will produce would be
19 an environmental document and decision to specifically
20 describe how the restoration would be done on specific
21 trails. We're in the process of completing our route
22 designation process. That is not a part of this
23 proposal. This project would be for those routes that
24 are identified as unauthorized and not for motor
25 vehicle use, public motor vehicle use, how those would
299

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 be restored, and that motor vehicle use restricted.
2 That's the reason that we felt that it was a
3 restoration project. That complies with the
4 regulations which specify that NEPA compliance is an
5 appropriate cost, an eligible cost for restoration
6 projects.

7 Specifically, I handed out some recommended
8 scores. We feel strongly that the evaluation criteria,
9 as the project was looked at, they were very heavily
10 weighted against actually on-the-ground restoration
11 being accomplished. If you look at the staff scoring
12 and comments, it specifically says, "No actual
13 restoration work would occur under multiple items."

14 And so we recommend the score, and feel that
15 it's documented through the application, on criterion
16 one, a score of 40; criterion two, would be a score of
17 15; criterion 3, a score of 20; criterion four, a score
18 of 10; and then criterion 5, a score of 15. The reason

19 this project was submitted was based on input and
20 information we were hearing from the public and a
21 desire for to us be moving forward once we complete the
22 route designation to address unauthorized routes.

23 Thank you very much.

24 COMMISSIONER SPITLER: Question. Can you talk
25 some about the critical environmental resources that

300

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 the project will protect?

2 LESTER LUBETKIN: In particular, in various
3 areas obviously it would be reducing sedimentation and
4 erosion from specific areas. Since the route
5 designation decision has at this point not been
6 completed, we were not identifying the individual
7 routes; however, across the forest there are a number
8 of areas of -- variety of areas of critical
9 environmental resources, water quality, wildlife
10 habitat, sensitivity species such as spotted owl. We
11 have a significant issue with threatened and endangered
12 red-legged frog habitat across the lower portion of the
13 forest, a number of those items would be addressed
14 through the restoration of those unauthorized routes.

15 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Thank you.

16 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: Question for the forest
17 staff. Could you point to where in your application --
18 and I believe it's around page 87 -- and detail exactly
19 what areas in the ranger districts you intend to
20 restore and what process you intend to engage in in
21 that restoration to finalize the documentation for the

22 restoration; in other words, give us some facts so we
23 can...

24 LESTER LUBETKIN: I thought it was also
25 included. I'll try to keep my comments very brief.

301

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 That's why I handed out the data sheet. But
2 specifically in the application, in the maps following
3 page 92, it shows for each of the ranger districts some
4 of the key areas what we're been doing -- where we
5 would be focusing anyway some of the efforts. In the
6 past we have identified various watersheds that have an
7 emphasis, and that we would probably -- because this
8 would not be restoration of all unauthorized routes
9 across the forest. It would be focused in those areas
10 that are -- have the highest concern, and that's stated
11 on page 86 where we talked to specific watersheds that
12 would be analyzed. Page 87, the second paragraph down,
13 under the Georgetown Ranger District, for instance,
14 spoke specifically to the South Fork American Chilli Bar
15 watershed and portions of the Rubicon watershed. Same
16 page 87, under Pacific District, Rubicon and Silver
17 Creek watersheds; and under Placerville, it would be
18 north of Middle Fork Cosumnes watersheds spots that
19 have been identified as areas that we've had
20 assessments and identified specific areas.

21 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: In the Placerville
22 District, will there be analysis of the Strawberry
23 Canyon areas to the north and south of Strawberry
24 Canyon where there are adverse impacts currently being

25 seen on the ground?

302

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 LESTER LUBETKIN: The intention is to identify
2 across the forest those locations, once the route
3 designation decision is made, of the highest priority
4 in those areas and the greatest need. Part of that
5 would come out of the analysis itself, the EIS for the
6 route designation, which would be identifying why we
7 wouldn't be designating certain routes, why they would
8 be unauthorized. And through that specifying under
9 which ones would be the highest priorities needing to
10 be addressed. And I thought that statement is in here,
11 and that's why I was just looking for it.

12 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: The reason I ask is that
13 while you have a general statement, I'm specifically
14 asking about an area that your route designation is
15 indicating will be closed, but it's not within the
16 North and Middle Fork Cosumnes. And so I'm saying
17 would you include within your application a priority on
18 route designation, closed areas post designation of the
19 areas within the Strawberry Canyon watershed?

20 LESTER LUBETKIN: Yes, we could.

21 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: Would you? Is that a yes
22 you will?

23 LESTER LUBETKIN: I'm trying to make sure I
24 understand both the question and make sure that I'm not
25 making the commitments beyond the existing decisions

303

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax
Page 38

1 that we would be...

2 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: My comments are
3 conditional on the decision-making process.

4 LESTER LUBETKIN: Yes, we would be looking in
5 the Strawberry area, the Sails Canyon area, and again
6 across the forest to identify those highest priority
7 areas to try to address first for the restoration to be
8 accomplished.

9 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: So if I move approval of
10 some of this funding, it's our understanding that you
11 are amending your priority list in the Placerville
12 District to include the Strawberry Canyon, as well as
13 the North and Middle Fork; is that my understanding?

14 LESTER LUBETKIN: Procedurally, I have no idea
15 if I can actually amend the application of the
16 proposal, but within the authority of a Commission, as
17 far as putting in control language that it include that
18 area that that be emphasized, that could be done. I
19 don't know that I can at this point change the
20 application.

21 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: Okay. We'll go ahead with
22 the understanding.

23 LESTER LUBETKIN: Thank you.

24 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Commissioner Pri zmi ch.

25 COMMISSIONER PRI ZMI CH: I'm hearing a lot of

304

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 identifying areas and not a lot of restoring areas, and

2 I'm wondering -- I'm right back into this planning
3 versus restoration. This sounds more like a planning
4 grant to me, so thus far, there is a lot of coaching
5 going on here trying to extract from you --

6 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: I'm not coaching. I'm not
7 coaching. I'm saying. I'm asking --

8 COMMISSIONER PRIZMICH: I understand what you
9 want, and you're asking a series of questions that is
10 intended to get what you want out of that, which is
11 fine. That's what I call coaching. You don't have to
12 call it coaching, but you're not getting the answers.
13 It sounds more to me like planning, than restoration.

14 LESTER LUBETKIN: The application -- thank you
15 Commissioner, for the opportunity to speak to that.
16 The application is for the NEPA compliance and the
17 decision of the specific restoration work that will be
18 accomplished on individual routes. The route
19 designation process and the decision of which routes
20 would be designated for future use and which would be
21 unauthorized is a separate project that will be
22 accomplished. When the proposal was submitted last
23 summer, we expected actually the decision on that to be
24 completed by now.

25 At this point it looks like it will be

305

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 accomplished in August or so is what our expectation
2 is. Once that decision is made, we will have a list of
3 all of the unauthorized routes across the forest. This
4 funding is not to then sort those, it is -- we will be

5 through the work that we're doing, separate from this
6 grant, identifying the routes that we would feel have
7 the highest priority that need to be addressed
8 immediately and restored or closed to motor vehicle
9 use. And this funding would be solely for that
10 environmental analysis and the completion of the
11 decision documents to identify the actual work to close
12 individual routes. I can't specify the routes at this
13 point.

14 The other option was to submit this after the
15 route designation decision was complete; however, that
16 would have delayed the environmental analysis and
17 subsequent closure for another year and a half to two
18 years, and what we were hearing from the public was a
19 desire for us to both move quickly on completing the
20 route designation, putting out the maps and all of the
21 route designation elements, but also dealing with the
22 unauthorized routes that come out of that route
23 designation decision.

24 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Thank you. If there is
25 further clarification, I would like to go to public

306

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 comment on this and come back to discussion.

2 So those who wish to comment on this grant,
3 please come forward.

4 KAREN SCHAMBACH: Karen Schambach, Center for
5 Sierra Nevada Conservation and PEER. We certainly
6 support the increases requested by the Eldorado
7 National Forest for the reasons that they gave. We

8 also believe that the -- you know, the comments
9 throughout criteria one that no actual restoration work
10 would occur is -- you know, shows to me a
11 misunderstanding by the staff of what I believe is the
12 intent of the category for restoration.

13 The regs say planning for restoration is
14 legitimate use of restoration funds. Now, the
15 confusion regarding the grants for restoration planning
16 arose after the grants were submitted by the applicants
17 that submitted grants in the belief that they were
18 submitted according to the existing regulations. It's
19 unfair to penalize applicants now for lack of clarity
20 or omission of intent in the regs. The regs say
21 planning is legitimate use.

22 If staff wants to qualify those allowed uses,
23 then they should do so by changing the regs, but the
24 way that they read right now is planning. This doesn't
25 say planning with the qualifiers that we've heard from
307

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 Mr. LaFranchi, and, you know, maybe that was what was
2 intended, but it's not spelled out in the regs. And
3 the applicants can only go by what's in the regs.
4 There were no clarifications in the workshops about
5 this. So I would submit that the -- that planning for
6 restoration is legitimate. As I said at the last
7 meeting, nobody wants to see the funding for these
8 projects coming out of non-CESA.

9 So I don't see what purpose this served by
10 trying to take these out of the restoration category,

11 and that would go for the previous grant and this one
12 but also for the Pacific Southwest Region Agency
13 Planning grant. As Mr. Thomas said, you know, it's
14 NEPA, and they have to start at some point. At what
15 point do you -- well, I guess I won't go any further.
16 I just say that the regs say planning for restoration
17 is legitimate use, and if they want to refine that
18 definition, they need to change the regs.

19 COMMISSIONER SPITLER: Ms. Schambach, do you
20 have any comments on this specific grant?

21 KAREN SCHAMBACH: Yes, I support it with the
22 increases proposed by the forest.

23 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: She said that at the front
24 end. It would be helpful I think for Commissioner
25 Prizmich and myself to have those regulations where it
308

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 specifies under restoration that planning is indeed a
2 qualified expenditures of funds. It seems that what
3 has just been pointed out, this confusion seems to be
4 brought about by thin air.

5 CHIEF JENKINS: While counsel is going to dig
6 those up for you here in just a moment, but just in
7 general format. So in chapter three of the manual,
8 which incorporated by reference as part of the
9 regulations we talk about, both planning and
10 restoration are described there. And while he's
11 looking that up, one is described as general planning.
12 The other described as more project specific.

13 The question also arose during the application

14 process, a number of people called us up and we had
15 frequently asked questions posted on the internet. And
16 that very question was posed by a number of people
17 about I have a project, I don't know whether to put it
18 in planning or restoration. And we were much more
19 clear on those answers. We said if it's a planning
20 project, then it needs to go over into planning. So
21 the clarification that was sought, you know, we tried
22 to accomplish that through that frequently asked
23 question board which was posted on the internet.

24 COMMISSIONER SPITLER: Excuse me, could I just
25 interject. We had a long discussion about this issue
309

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 at the last meeting. We had a discussion before we
2 started hearing these two grants. Now, we're in the
3 middle of public comment on one of the grants. I think
4 it's really inappropriate to have this discussion again
5 now. I think it's an important discussion. I think we
6 should have it. Maybe we need to agendize it in the
7 future or have it at some other point in today's
8 meeting, but I feel like the applicant has gotten up
9 and spoke, the public is here to speak. We've reached
10 a decision after much deliberation. We need to move
11 forward with this grant and get on with our day.

12 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: Let's hear the testimony.

13 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Off-line, Mr. LaFranchi, if
14 you could bring those specific documents, that would be
15 great.

16 BRENT SCHORADT: My name is Brent Schoradt with

17 the California Wilderness Coalition, and I just want to
18 second the comments made by both the National Forest
19 Service, Eldorado National Forest and by the previous
20 speaker.

21 In some of the research that we've done, on page
22 seven of chapter three of the Off-Highway Motor Vehicle
23 Recreation Division Grants and Cooperative Agreement
24 Project Administration Procedures, it says, quote,
25 "Eligible costs for restoration projects may include,

310

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 but are not limited, to the following," and there is a
2 whole list. And among them it says, "CEQA or NEPA
3 compliance requirements for the restoration project."

4 So I think with that in mind, I'd like to make
5 some specific comments on this grant in particular.
6 The Eldorado National Forest under the scope of this
7 project are going to be looking to restore illegal
8 routes that have been created through the designation
9 of the Mokelumne wilderness. And I think that qualifies
10 as critical environmental benefits. And in and of
11 itself, just having the wilderness there, aside from
12 the fact that we heard the habitat of the red-legged
13 frog, which as many of us, you know, protecting our
14 habitat for endangered species in our national forest
15 is a critical policy that we should all be trying
16 pursue. So I think 40 out of 40 is appropriate for the
17 category one, critical environmental benefits.

18 And I think in terms of efficient use of OHV
19 funds, they've done excellent restoration projects in

20 the past, and, you know, we think this project is going
21 to continue in that fashion. And I think what we
22 really like about this grant is the fact that the
23 Eldorado National Forest is getting ahead of the curve
24 in terms of looking at what routes currently exist on
25 the ground that are not going to be designated through

311

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 the route designation process because, A, they either
2 violate existing laws like the wilderness, the
3 designation of the Mokelumne wilderness or, B, they
4 violate the Forest Plan whether they're in riparian
5 areas or in semi-primitive non-motorized areas. So I
6 think there is a whole slough of routes in all of the
7 national forests that are violating the current Forest
8 Plan that won't be designated through the route
9 designation process. So there is no reason why the
10 forest should be waiting until that process is
11 complete. They are planning through the Forest Plan
12 process which already states that motorized use is not
13 appropriate in certain areas, and they're just simply
14 going forward and restoring those routes where their
15 planning has already stated that motorized use is
16 inappropriate. And I think doing NEPA for this project
17 is clearly laid out in the regulations, so we hope that
18 you can fund this project. Thank you.

19 TOM TAMMONE: Tom Tammone. I'm not very
20 familiar with this grant, but I have spent considerable
21 time with the staff people on this forest, and as
22 somebody that supports OHV recreation, I trust their

2007-01-25 OHV C1 x
23 judgment if they need this money and it's a legitimate
24 use and support the scoring increase. I also would
25 like to echo concerns about the inability to expend the
312

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 CESA fund of the restoration category whenever we could
2 to get the funding grants for restoration under the
3 Restoration category should be done. There is a bad
4 precedence being stated here, if we can't get it
5 anywhere else it goes under non-CESA, so that needs to
6 be looked at. Thank you.

7 DON KLUSMAN: Don Klusman, California 4-Wheel
8 Drive Association. The grant itself doesn't bother me
9 as much as what we are talking about here, in that we
10 are putting money out there in a pot to do something
11 that has not been decided of what's going to be done.
12 The forest is going through route designation, along
13 with 17 other forests in this state, and they're asking
14 for money to do rehabilitation, or whatever you want to
15 call it at the present time, on routes that yet are to
16 be determined if they are going to be designated or
17 not. They did not specifically say which routes in the
18 wilderness areas. They did not say which routes.
19 They're using watersheds as part of what their
20 description is. Well, you do that, you're talking
21 about the whole State of California, one part or
22 another is a watershed for something. I just really
23 have a problem with putting this money out there, the
24 cart in front of the horse.

25 If we're going to do that, if we're going to
313

1 fund planning, you know, I hate to agree with some of
2 the people that have spoke earlier, but then we need to
3 do planning for all of these. Planning is planning one
4 way or the other. However we slice it or how you slice
5 it as a Commission, is going to affect how these
6 Restoration funds are going to be used from now until
7 whenever. You can't have it both ways. We can't say,
8 no, we can't fund planning on this forest, but, oh yes,
9 we can fund it on this forest. Sorry, I don't think it
10 works that way.

11 NICK HARRIS: Nick Harris, American Motorcyclist
12 Association. I guess, number one, I do think that this
13 grant application was in the wrong category, but more
14 importantly, it seems like with the previous grant the
15 discussion was not to preplan and let NEPA tell you the
16 decision. On this one it seems like the decision is
17 made, and we're trying to figure out how to pay for the
18 NEPA to get to that point. I just find that rather
19 disturbing. Thank you.

20 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Thank you. Any other
21 comments? Back to the Commission.

22 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: All right. I'll make a
23 motion. I would move approval of the following
24 criteria and scoring. Criteria one, 38 points, and I'm
25 relying upon the testimony and pages 87 and 88 of the

314

1 application -- actually, 87 through 90 of the
2 application, specifically the environmental resources
3 that were identified in terms of a habitat wilderness
4 areas, page 88 lists the wilderness areas; and the
5 elimination of routes inside of those wilderness areas.
6 Those are important environmental resources, and
7 resource damage that I am aware of on the Silver Lake
8 Pacific -- I'm sorry, on the Amador Ranger District,
9 there is an extensive amount of route damage on
10 designated four-wheel drive and two-wheel drive routes.
11 And we need to get that area restored so that the
12 existing designated routes are actually used because
13 they're eroding away. I walked out on there this
14 summer, and it was like walking in a stream bed. So I
15 know those routes are in bad shape and some of this
16 money will be able to assist in that effort.

17 So 38 out of 40 in criteria one; criteria two,
18 13 out of 15; criteria three, 18 out of 20; criteria
19 four, eight out of 10; criteria five, 13 out of 15 for
20 a total of 90.

21 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: There is a motion on the
22 floor. Do I have a second?

23 COMMISSIONER SPITLER: Second.

24 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: It's been moved and second.
25 Under discussion. Commissioner Anderson.

315

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 VICE-CHAIR ANDERSON: I was particularly
2 persuaded by the context provided by the Forest
3 Service, that they were, in fact, thinking ahead, that

4 they had anticipated that the decision would have been
5 made at this time, and that they could or shortly
6 thereafter, and that they were thinking about moving
7 forward when the decision was made on these specific
8 routes.

9 I do see that there are some items that can be
10 done before that decision is made. Anticipating the
11 areas that Commissioner Thomas mentioned, for example,
12 restoration inside wilderness areas, and so it seems to
13 me that there are some obvious directions where the
14 decision is there, not only -- if not legally. I think
15 it probably is legally, as well.

16 So I see this as some forward thinking by the
17 forest, and I am inclined to encourage it. And as
18 Mr. Klusman was saying, I guess I would disagree that
19 these are planning, but I would encourage other forests
20 and agencies, as they're moving forward with route
21 designation, to not leave a gap between the finishing
22 of their route designation and decision-making on it in
23 an application for restoration funds to proceed. So I
24 would hope that other forests would be similarly
25 forward thinking in their application process.

316

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: Mr. Chairman, just to
2 clarify my motion as to criteria five, there are
3 actually three subcriteria, each of which must be
4 ranked according to the restoration project rules that
5 I asked for and was given this morning. So I will do
6 so at this moment.

7 5(a) I would provide -- I would suggest a
8 ranking of five, that's completion of prior projects
9 within the time frame provided -- I'm sorry, with a
10 ranking of three for completion of prior projects.
11 History of fiscal accountability, I would do five; and
12 applicant proven track record, five. That gets to 13.
13 And that would be included in my motion if the second
14 will accept that.

15 COMMISSIONER SPITLER: I will.

16 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: So it's been moved and
17 seconded. Just as a comment, I would endorse
18 Commissioner Anderson's thoughtful comments as well for
19 direction to all of the forests for the future.
20 Commissioner Prizmich.

21 COMMISSIONER PRIZMICH: While I appreciate the
22 commentary for the U.S. Forest Service, it did help in
23 my evaluation. I don't agree with the total score. I
24 think there still needs to be more work done, so while
25 I would like to obviously help out here, I don't

317

 SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 believe the score is appropriate here.

2 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Any further comments?

3 COMMISSIONER SPITLER: I won't read it all, but
4 I will note that the agency has provided information on
5 each of the categories to us which addresses each of
6 the criteria, which I won't read into the record, but
7 just mention it in the record.

8 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: And I'll look to our staff
9 technician and mathematician. Are we correct in our

10 scoring? So we have a score of 90. All those in
11 favor?

12 (Commissioners simultaneously voted.)

13 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Opposed?

14 COMMISSIONER PRIZMICH: No.

15 COMMISSIONER McMILLIN: I'm going to abstain.

16 I'm confused.

17 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: That's fair. We've all been
18 there before.

19 COMMISSIONER McMILLIN: I'm very confused, and I
20 think we have a lot of smart people both up here and
21 out there, to my left, to my right. And I think
22 everybody is crying for clarity on what the process is
23 here, and this is just my first year, but I'm confused
24 on what the right thing is to do. But spending the
25 money is the right thing to do, that's for sure, but.

318

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: That's an eye in spirit.

2 COMMISSIONER McMILLIN: An eye in spirit.

3 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: We do have one housekeeping
4 item other than the audio here. Aaron pointed out in
5 the previous scoring, we actually have a 91 rather than
6 a 90 on OR-2-ME-58. It does not affect the funding
7 level. I'm not certain whether our counsel will tell
8 me to go back and revisit that motion and make sure the
9 scores correctly reflect it. We had a 90 on the motion
10 from Commissioner Thomas, and I'm being told we have a
11 91 on the actual scoring.

12 COUNSEL LaFRANCHI: If it was just an adding

13 issue, I think whatever it is is correct.

14 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: So the housekeeping item has
15 been dealt with, and we'll go forward.

16 I'm going to take -- it's 10:35. There are a
17 couple of things. We're having real problems with our
18 audio, which is compounding problems here. We'll take
19 about a 15-minute break to see if they can address
20 that.

21 And while we're breaking, if you can get all of
22 your conversations outside so Cheryl can clearly hear
23 what's going on, that would be very helpful. We will
24 come back and get the ground rules for the -- how many
25 grants are we going to review -- 50 some grants, and

319

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 then go to public forum. So come back about ten to
2 11:00, please.

3 (Break taken in proceedings.)

4 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: I've been reminded to tell
5 everyone again that the transcriber cannot hear when
6 there are side conversations out in the audience. And
7 I'm also told she has a novel that she's going to be
8 selling of Commissioners' remarks that are being shared
9 that they think is not being shared will be shared with
10 the public. So if you want to be incognito, you may
11 need to remove yourself from the dais to not be heard
12 by these very sensitive microphones. Is that clear
13 enough.

14 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: So what do we have to do
15 to clean the record?

16 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: I think Cheryl has a little
17 college fund for somebody out there.

18 So Larry is back. What we will do is about an
19 eight-minute sketch of how we're going to go through
20 this, the non-CESA, maybe we'll get into one, and then
21 go into public forum; is that fair? It's been two
22 months since we've done these, and we're a little rusty
23 here.

24 OHMVR STAFF BELLUCCI: As I understand it, we're
25 going to be discussing those non-CESA items which have
320

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 been pulled from Consent, and hopefully I took good
2 notes, and they're broken down into the project types,
3 starting with acquisition and development equipment and
4 so forth. And so at this point, I'll do as John did,
5 and read the grant number, the funding amount scores
6 and so forth.

7 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: There was one commissioner
8 who off-line suggested we start with trail maintenance,
9 and I don't know if there is any agreement or
10 disagreement on that suggestion from the Commission.

11 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: Are we all in one pot?
12 There is no benefit to or detriment to anybody?

13 CHIEF JENKINS: That's correct. Everybody that
14 will be heard for the rest of today and tomorrow are
15 all going to be coming from the non-CESA pot, so
16 they're all in the common.

17 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: So one person's gain is
18 another person's loss; is that what you're telling me?

19 CHIEF JENKINS: That would be one way of saying
20 it, yes.

21 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: So, Commissioner Spittler, do
22 you want to comment on the procedure here?

23 COMMISSIONER SPITTLER: I made the suggestion we
24 start with trail maintenance simply because I know
25 that's an area where a number of people are interested
321

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 and a number of people are probably here specifically
2 for that, so it seemed prudent to me to do that one
3 first and address the concerns of the public.

4 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: So hearing no argument with
5 that thoughtful suggestion for those keenly interested
6 in trail maintenance, Larry, you want to back up and we
7 will.

8 OHMVR STAFF BELLUCCI: Sure, I was reminded by
9 one of my colleagues, I didn't state my name. Larry
10 Bellucci, grant administrator.

11 And if we start with trail maintenance, I
12 believe Kenny Glaspie is going to be taking us through
13 that.

14 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: You're off the hook.

15 OHMVR STAFF BELLUCCI: For now.

16 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: And I say again publicly,
17 thank for coming back to help us out here.

18 So, Kenny, do you want to walk us through one,
19 and then we'll probably go to public forum.

20 OHMVR STAFF GLASPIE: Good morning, Kenny
21 Glaspie, grant administrator. We will be starting off

22 trail maintenance, 82-OR-2-A-70, Angeles National
23 Forest, trail maintenance. They requested \$69,522.
24 They received a Division determination of 56 points,
25 for 50 percent score, resulting in a \$34,761

322

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 determination.

2 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Comment from the agency, then
3 we will go to public comment.

4 TOM KAULCHER: Tom Kaulcher, Angeles National
5 Forest, OHV Manager. I previously submitted a change
6 in scoring criteria, as for criteria one, I would
7 really like to emphasize the use of our hardener for
8 our trail maintenance. This use of controlling the
9 rolling dips from breakdown has been very successful.
10 This has actually reduced our maintenance cost about
11 \$20,000 in the last three submittals of our grants from
12 \$90,000 to approximately \$70,000. Also, going to
13 criteria three, as another applicant came up here
14 earlier, we do have a history of a number of grants
15 over the last 20 years. These grants have been very
16 successful in maintaining our ability to complete the
17 projects on time, requesting full funding in that
18 category there. Any questions with our submittal?

19 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Any questions of the
20 applicant? We'll go to public comment, otherwise. Any
21 public comment on this? Commissioners, your pleasure.

22 COMMISSIONER PRIZMICH: I'll move staff
23 recommendations.

24 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Been moved.

25 COMMISSIONER McMILLIN: Second.

323

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Mr. McMillin seconded. All
2 those in favor?

3 (Commissioners simultaneously voted.)

4 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Opposed? Motion carries.

5 Shall we try and squeak another one in in three
6 minutes?

7 OHMVR STAFF GLASPIE: Second grant, line 83,
8 OR-1-N0-67, Arcata Field Office, Trail maintenance.
9 The request amount was \$13,500. The Division score was
10 57, for 50 percent funding determination of \$6,775.
11 This was another grant that a lot of new information
12 was added on there that was not in the original grant
13 at the subcommittee meeting.

14 BRUCE CANN: My name is Bruce Cann with BLM
15 Arcata Field Office, and I think the clarification, the
16 handout is being passed out right now.

17 I'm requesting a score of 71 from the previous
18 score of -- I think it was 57. That's Item No. One, I
19 think the score should be 35 instead of 30, based on
20 information on pages 28 and 38. And that's A.

21 And then on B, there is new information that I
22 added on there. And on page 32, there's more
23 information.

24 Item No. C, maintain safe riding conditions. I
25 added new information on that, too. And then on page

324

1 53, the park provides information on that.

2 On D, there's a clarification. Page 40 explains
3 why that score should be up from seven to eight. Item
4 No. 2, efficient use of funds, I requested 18 out of 30
5 instead of 14. There is new information on that and
6 old information on page 26. And just to keep this
7 short, Item No. 3 on history of projects, I added new
8 information about the -- I have several examples and
9 then stated in there when we started work and when we
10 completed work, so they're all within the time frames,
11 so. Are there any questions?

12 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Thank you. Any public
13 comment? Commissioners?

14 COMMISSIONER SPITLER: I think the rationale --
15 I'm just looking over the rationale provided here by
16 the field office, and I think it looks pretty solid to
17 me. So I would move the BLM suggested score of 71 in
18 the categories suggested by BLM, and I'll second that.

19 OHMVR STAFF PEREZ: Could you state them for the
20 record, please?

21 COMMISSIONER SPITLER: For the record, it's a
22 score of 35 in the first category; second category,
23 score of nine; third category, score of eight; fourth
24 category, score of 10. I think that's it.

25 OHMVR STAFF FREITAS: I think that's only three
325

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 categories.

2 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: You did one, and then
3 subsets.

4 COMMISSIONER SPITLER: For category one, score
5 of 35; category two, score of 18; category three, score
6 of 18.

7 VICE-CHAIR ANDERSON: I'll concur on that.

8 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: So there's a motion and
9 second on concurrence, Judith Anderson for the record
10 seconded. You need to get a little closer to your
11 microphone.

12 VICE-CHAIR ANDERSON: Okay. I concur.

13 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: All those in favor?

14 (Commissioners simultaneously voted.)

15 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Opposed? Motion carries.

16 We are at 11:01, so we will go to public forum
17 at this time. And I have a few cards. If you didn't
18 get an opportunity to submit a blue card, this is for
19 items that are not on agenda, basically not asking for
20 money. We will begin with Karen McKinley, who's
21 responding to Commissioner Spitler's request for
22 information in December of '06, followed by Don Amador,
23 who was asking to talk on everything.

24 KAREN MCKINLEY: I'll be short then. I'm Karen
25 McKinley from Los Padres National Forest. And just as
326

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 a matter of record, we have our response to your
2 request for information on how our monitoring has
3 affected a change in our management actions on the
4 ground.

5 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: That's very helpful. Thank
6 you.
7 COMMISSIONER SPITLER: Thank for providing that.
8 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Mr. Amador, oh, you added the
9 proviso, if needed. So you don't have to talk on
10 everything.
11 DON AMADOR: Don Amador, Blue Ribbon Coalition.
12 I just wanted to alert the Commission and the public
13 and thank the Division for helping support a sound
14 training session out at Prairie City. We had
15 approximately 50 various AME District 36 club officers
16 come and get certified in sound testing, so I just
17 wanted to let you know we're out there working hard on
18 that particular issue and thank the Division for their
19 support. Thank you.
20 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Thank you. Tom Kaulcher,
21 followed by Karen Schambach.
22 TOM KAULCHER: Yes, also a matter of record,
23 this is in response to the question asked by the
24 Commission in reference to the changes to management
25 having to do with the monitoring.

327

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: So you're submitting
2 something in writing?
3 TOM KAULCHER: Yes.
4 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Thank you. Karen Schambach
5 will pass. John Stewart, followed by Roxie Trost, and
6 lastly Dave Pickett.
7 JOHN STEWART: Good morning, Commissioners, John

8 Stewart, California Association of 4-Wheel Drive Clubs,
9 United 4-Wheel Drive Associations, and the Tierra del
10 Sol 4-Wheel Drive Association.

11 Good morning, I would like to thank Deputy
12 Director Daphne Greene and Phil Jenkins and their staff
13 for the excellent work that they have accomplished in
14 moving through to acquire the Freeman properties in the
15 Truckhaven area with the use of the OHMVR Trust funds
16 for expansion of the recreation opportunity for the
17 public of California. Thank you, Daphne and staff for
18 your excellent work in doing that.

19 And within that, we do know that there is going
20 to be challenges as we move forward to establish a
21 management plan in the area. And on behalf of Tierra
22 Del Sol, who has hosted an event in that area for the
23 past 44 years, and this year will be the 45th, is
24 recognizing the issues involved in getting the
25 management plans in order. We are in the process of

328

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 moving our event into the Ocotillo Wells SVRA area in
2 order to be completely in compliance with the
3 regulations and in order to provide the recreation
4 opportunity and event opportunity for the public of
5 California.

6 I'd like to note that the recreation growth is
7 phenomenal. In the early 1980s, Forest Service did not
8 even recognize OHV recreation as an opportunity. Today
9 the Forest Service, with their statistical analysis and
10 studies, have shown that over 25 percent of the

11 American population has driven off of a paved or gravel
12 rode at least once in the past year. And this is on a
13 basis of 300 million people. When you look at a
14 population of California approaching 30 million people,
15 this is a phenomenal number of people looking for
16 recreation opportunity.

17 We know that with the recent release of the gas
18 tax study that funding available from the gas tax to
19 support OHV opportunity is going to take a significant
20 hit. We realize there will be significant challenges
21 as we move forward. We look to working with the
22 Commission, with the Division, with the agencies in
23 order to maintain the recreation opportunity that the
24 public of California is demanding. Thank you.

25 COMMISSIONER SPITLER: Mr. Stewart, just a quick
329

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 question. I can't quite catch the names of all of the
2 organizations that you're representing. I'm not
3 familiar with some of them. Could you tell us a little
4 bit about each organization?

5 JOHN STEWART: The California Association of
6 4-Wheel Drive Clubs is an organization based in
7 California that represents four-wheel drive clubs and
8 individuals within the State of California.

9 The United 4-Wheel Drive Associations is an
10 international association along the same structures.
11 We have members throughout the world, South Africa,
12 New Zealand, Australia, Mexico, Canada, but primarily
13 we represent the interests of four-wheel drive

14 recreationists within the United States. Now, within
15 the United States, California Association of 4-Wheel
16 Drive Clubs is a member of United, so we have a lot of
17 members like this throughout the different states.

18 Now, the Tierra Del Sol 4-Wheel Drive Club is a
19 club of 50 family members based out of San Diego,
20 California. TDS has been in existence for 48 years,
21 and we are primarily, like I said, just family members
22 and our passion is four-wheel drive recreation in the
23 desert and the back country areas.

24 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Thank you. Roxie Trost.

25 ROXIE TROST: Good morning, Commissioners, my 330

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 name is Roxie Trost. I'm the field manager from the
2 BLM Barstow Field Office, and I just have a couple of
3 items that I'd like to share with you this morning.

4 The first thing being handed out to you is a
5 list of our current volunteer opportunities that we
6 have going on in Barstow, and one of the big items is
7 the Calico event. We have three off-highway vehicle
8 groups that have pulled together over 400 volunteers.
9 They have \$10,000 worth of prize money that they will
10 be raffling off, and this is over President's weekend.
11 There are several other smaller opportunities on the
12 list, too. So I just wanted to share that.

13 The other item that is also being handed out is
14 just a list of our current so far off-highway vehicle
15 events scheduled for this year. So that's it. Thanks.

16 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Thank you. I have Dave

17 Pickett, followed by Brent Schoradt.

18 DAVE PICKETT: Good morning, Commissioners, Dave

19 Pickett, AMA District 36, Motorcycle Sports Committee.

20 My comment this morning is generic on the funding pots,

21 specifically law enforcement, this go-round. After a

22 lot of review of the whole program and that particular

23 funding pot set at \$4 million per year, and the fact

24 that law enforcement had asked for \$10 million, that

25 works out to about 34 cents per OHV per month for law

331

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 enforcement, woefully inadequate. And I believe some

2 of the restoration issues that we're facing that are

3 caused by illegal activity could decrease if there was

4 a higher allocation in that funding pot for law

5 enforcement. We've got to give them the tools that

6 they need. Thank you very much.

7 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Thank you. Just a reminder

8 we will have public input on Saturday where we'll be

9 discussing some of those issues.

10 BRENT SCHORADT: I'm Brent Schoradt with the

11 California Wilderness Coalition, and I just wanted to

12 bring up one issue that is sort of troubling to us as

13 we look at the grants this year. There was the issue

14 we discussed earlier with the fact of basically what to

15 do with planning for restoration. And I think from our

16 standpoint, there are three grants that had this issue.

17 Two of them that we heard earlier were Mendocino and

18 Eldorado National Forest. The third grant is the

19 Pacific Southwest Region grant, which was a sizeable

20 grant, to look across the region at the 18 million
21 acres that are managed by the National Forest Service,
22 and specifically at the routes that are not going to be
23 designated through the OHV process, the route
24 designation process because it's already been
25 determined that they're not going to be suitable for

332

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 motorized use because they've already gone through
2 planning processes, whether that be wilderness acts
3 that have made them off limits to motorized vehicles or
4 wild and scenic corridors or semi-primitive
5 non-motorized areas. So I think it's only appropriate
6 that if the other two grants were funded under the
7 restoration category, that this third grant, which is
8 essentially the same category, should be funded under
9 the restoration category, as well.

10 And I think we hear constantly around the State
11 Capitol that there is not enough demand for
12 restoration, and I think it's convenient that the same
13 folks who are saying that there's not enough demand for
14 restoration are encouraging people to apply planning
15 for restoration under the non-CESA category, so they
16 can say, hey look, there's not enough applications in
17 the restoration category.

18 If this grant were placed in its proper spot, in
19 the restoration category, and I realize that the
20 applicant was told to apply under restoration, but if
21 it was -- I'm sorry, the applicant was told to apply
22 under non-CESA, but if the applicant would have

2007-01-25 OHV C1 x
23 submitted under restoration, we would then see the pot
24 of requests for restoration dollars be larger than the
25 amount of requests for law enforcement. And I think 333

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 that underscores the fact that there is demand for
2 restoration, that California -- you know, the State of
3 California benefits from restoration, and we need to
4 continue this program as we move forward. Thank you.

5 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Thank you. Any others? So
6 back to you, Kenny.

7 Tom, were you just wandering through?

8 TOM TAMMONE: No. Tom Tammone, I wanted to make
9 one statement on the last comment. That is a very
10 large grant, and I believe it's some \$5 million, is the
11 one he's talking about. And I understand that it looks
12 as far as three years into the future. I would only be
13 able to support taking projects that would be for stuff
14 that's going to be for this cycle out of that
15 \$5 million as far as consideration. Thank you.

16 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Thank you. Oh, you did have
17 a brief announcement, Mr. Keeler, is that correct?

18 JIM KEELER: No, I'm waiting for the next.

19 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: All right. So back to trail
20 maintenance. Kenny.

21 OHMVR STAFF GLASPIE: Next grant is line 88,
22 OR-1-H-25, Hollister Field Office, Trail Maintenance.
23 They requested \$177,800. They received a score of 50,
24 for a 50 percent funding determination of \$88,900.
25 We'd like to say that they submitted a lot of new

334

1 information, and a lot of it was very good information.
2 It was factual and specific where their one before had
3 been very conclusory and very general.

4 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Thank you.

5 JIM KEELER: I'm Jim Keeler, BLM California
6 State Office. I did bring Jim Weigand along in case
7 there are other questions. The Hollister staff
8 couldn't make it today. I went ahead and passed out
9 the score increase request that we did after the south
10 grant hearings.

11 Hollister, if you remember, did not get any
12 funding last year. They completed their route
13 designation for the Clear Creek area, so they are
14 hoping to get a little more support out of this grant.
15 I'm available for questions. Here are our
16 recommendations, I don't want to take your time going
17 through them all item by item.

18 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Commissioner Anderson, you
19 have a question?

20 VICE-CHAIR ANDERSON: Yes. Would you talk to me
21 a little bit more about graveling.

22 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Graveling?

23 VICE-CHAIR ANDERSON: Graveling.

24 JIM KEELER: Groveling?

25 VICE-CHAIR ANDERSON: Graveling is what I meant.
335

1 This is in box number -- column two, line two of the
2 supplementary material, it says -- the first word is
3 graveling. And I want to know how extensive this is.
4 I understand you're doing it to reduce erosion. There
5 are other problems with graveling, I would think.

6 JIM WEIGAND: I'm Jim Weigand, the Ecologist for
7 the Bureau of Land Management in the California State
8 Office. Graveling helps to stabilize the tread of the
9 roadbed, and as such, that is very critical for the
10 Clear Creek Management Area because of the recreation
11 traffic volume, and we wanted to be minimizing the
12 erosion and any resulting damage to the surrounding
13 slopes. It's relatively steep country, and so by
14 graveling the trails, we're able to stabilize any flow
15 across the trails, and then minimize any input of ultra
16 matrix soil types into the creeks.

17 VICE-CHAIR ANDERSON: Is this continuous or is
18 it intermittent, where there are problems where you
19 have cross flow or?

20 JIM WEIGAND: It would be intermittent, and it
21 would be -- again, there are places where the soils are
22 highly -- very much a mosaic in the area, so it would
23 be just for those problem areas that crop up, so it
24 stabilizes the site to minimize erosion off and down
25 slope, and that's quite critical in this area because

336

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 there is what's called a total daily minimum load for
2 mercury in part of the area.

3 VICE-CHAIR ANDERSON: Mercury?
Page 68

4 JIM WEIGAND: Yes.

5 VICE-CHAIR ANDERSON: I'm almost sorry I asked
6 the question. I'm thinking about strings of riders and
7 how wheels can kick up gravel and wondering about
8 safety concerns.

9 JIM WEIGAND: Well, again, there are a number of
10 things going on at the same time. It helps to also
11 reduce dust lie as well, so the gravel would be in
12 relatively key small areas. So it's not something
13 that's going to be a problem for riders across the
14 whole area, but it's in part a safety and erosion
15 concern here.

16 VICE-CHAIR ANDERSON: This will be on the
17 surface. You're not talking about an underlying gravel
18 layer?

19 JIM WEIGAND: No, this is surface application of
20 gravel.

21 VICE-CHAIR ANDERSON: Thank you.

22 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Other questions or comments?

23 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: I have a question. How
24 did you handle the asbestos issue that we used to hear
25 every meeting in the seven years I've been here, the

337

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 gentleman, the engineer who brought the science to us
2 each meeting, and he apparently got too old and hasn't
3 come back.

4 COMMISSIONER SPITLER: Gene Cunningham.

5 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: Gene Cunningham, a very
6 good scientist, by the way.

7 JIM WEIGAND: Asbestos concerns are ongoing and
8 currently we're designing, with the help of the USPA,
9 ways to reduce any dust fly from OHV routes and part of
10 that is having seasonal closure for the Clear Creek
11 Management Area so that during the dry season, there
12 will be much lower dust emissions from the soils.

13 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: Do you do that now?

14 JIM KEELER: Last two years, I think it's
15 June 1st through the end of August, I believe,
16 something like that, October. It's all summer it's
17 closed at this point.

18 JIM WEIGAND: Right.

19 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: Do you do any testing,
20 too?

21 JIM KEELER: Yes.

22 JIM WEIGAND: That's right. The U.S. EPA is
23 conducting a study which should be completed in June of
24 this year to get highly reliable data on the quantity
25 and aerosolization of asbestos in the ecosystem there.

338

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: There are serpentine soils
2 in this area.

3 VICE-CHAIR ANDERSON: I have another question.
4 I'm sorry we're taking a lot of time with this, but
5 this is my educational phase here.

6 Geo blankets and helmet-mounted cameras, which
7 are on page two of your information, can you describe?
8 Those certainly seem to be innovative. I'm trying to
9 find out if they're efficient.

10 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: Or useful.

11 JIM KEELER: I can speak to the helmet-mounted
12 camera. One of the things they are trying to do with
13 this grant is actually to improve their monitoring
14 program for all of the trail system out there, as well
15 as using that information then to continue additional
16 work on the trails.

17 VICE-CHAIR ANDERSON: This is not an effect --
18 you're not trying to do law enforcement with these
19 helmet-mounted cameras?

20 JIM KEELER: This is for the monitoring program.

21 VICE-CHAIR ANDERSON: For the monitoring
22 program, okay. And geo blankets, is that for the
23 asbestos soil stabilization?

24 JIM WEIGAND: It certainly has a role. It's geo
25 textiles used to reduce sediment flow onto trails.

339

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 VICE-CHAIR ANDERSON: Sort of slope
2 stabilization?

3 JIM WEIGAND: And then reduction of any sediment
4 flowing onto trails that then might be dispersed into
5 the air.

6 VICE-CHAIR ANDERSON: And geo blankets, does
7 that mean that they're mineral rather than vegetative,
8 which a lot of soil blankets tend to be?

9 JIM WEIGAND: In general, the materials that
10 we've been using are decomposable. The general
11 categorization of them is geotextiles, meaning that
12 they're put on the ground, not that they're necessarily

13 made out of a petroleum product, for example. They may
14 be made out of something like jute, for example.

15 VICE-CHAIR ANDERSON: So it's the usual material
16 for slope stabilization?

17 JIM WEIGAND: Yes.

18 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Any other questions,
19 comments? Public comments on this?

20 Monitoring with the camera on the helmet, is
21 that surreptitiously slapped on them before they go out
22 so you know where they go? There is a gentleman that
23 would like to speak to this issue, I believe
24 Mr. Pickett.

25 DAVE PICKETT: Thank you. District 36,

340

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 Motorcycle Sports Committee, Incorporated. Good sign,
2 I like this reminder. As you heard in the past, this
3 is one of the top ten OHV recreation destinations in
4 the country. Desert day use continues to go up, and
5 because of that increased use, trails wear. These
6 folks need this funding to meet the needs of that
7 demand. We don't want to see the trails continue to
8 erode. With no funding last year, as was said before,
9 there is desperate need for this area to continue trail
10 maintenance. And that's what the program is all about
11 is long-term sustainability of our trails. So I ask
12 for full support on this at the new requested amount.
13 Thank you.

14 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Comments, or do I hear a
15 motion? Commisioners?

16 VICE-CHAIR ANDERSON: I'll move the applicant's
17 suggested score in the first category 34 out of 40; the
18 second one, 25 out of 30; and let's see, the last
19 category 20, out of 30. Although I have heard less in
20 the public comments and less about the applicant's
21 history, I'm personally familiar with their history.

22 COMMISSIONER PRIZMICH: Second that.

23 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: It's been moved and seconded.
24 Just as a comment, you didn't go through all of the
25 contortions that others have to come up with criteria

341

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 to substantiate those.

2 VICE-CHAIR ANDERSON: I found -- do you want me
3 to go back and go through it?

4 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: I think it would be fair.

5 VICE-CHAIR ANDERSON: I'm working from off the
6 suggestions of the material that was submitted this
7 morning. If you want me to include that by reference,
8 I can do that.

9 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Why don't we do it that way,
10 saving time.

11 VICE-CHAIR ANDERSON: And as I said, in the last
12 category, although there was less in the public record
13 about their history of implementing similar projects, I
14 am personally familiar with that, okay.

15 COMMISSIONER PRIZMICH: If I can just add, since
16 I was the second, staff, themselves, acknowledge that
17 there was some -- right at the beginning of this, that
18 there was some new pertinent information that changed

19 in their minds the scoring. So I think that lends even
20 more credence to the comments on the part of BLM for
21 increased numbers.

22 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Okay. So without further
23 ado, all those in favor?

24 (Commissioners simultaneously voted.)

25 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Opposed?

342

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: No.

2 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Motion carries.

3 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: Mr. Chairman, my no vote
4 is consistent with the prior seven years of no votes on
5 this because of the liability associated with asbestos
6 and the liability to the State ultimately will come
7 home to roost and we should be aware of that and not
8 support things that bring us liability for damaging
9 human beings.

10 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Thank you.

11 OHMVR STAFF GLASPIE: Next application, line 90,
12 OR-2-LP-105, Los Padres National Forest, Trail
13 Maintenance. They requested \$279,233. They received a
14 funding score of 50 points, for 50 percent
15 determination funding of \$139,617. This one also
16 submitted some new information, but most of it was
17 still pretty conclusory, general statements, didn't
18 really back it up with facts.

19 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Thank you.

20 JEFF BENSON: Jeff Benson, with the Los Padres
21 National Forest, and we did submit the information up

22 there where I'll concentrate on Items No. 2 and 3. And
23 that in Item No. 2, I would like to point out, you
24 know, efficient use of funds, we do match -- we do
25 provide \$186,000 of other funds towards -- of the trail
343

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 maintenance. We do use a lot of volunteers to
2 coordinate with our programs. There is quite a
3 volunteer effort. So what I'm asking for is an
4 additional five points in that category to go from 19
5 points to 24 points.

6 And then in Item 3, we've got history of
7 successful implementation of projects. Over the years,
8 last 20 years, we've probably had 40 plus grants, all
9 our grants have been on time. We've had good
10 recommendation, good management of those grants, and so
11 I think nine points on that is considerably lower than
12 what we deserved, and I'm asking for another ten points
13 on that category for a total additional 15 points for a
14 total score of 65. That's our request.

15 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Any questions from
16 Commissioners? If not we will go to public comment.

17 JOHN STEWART: Good morning, Commissioners, John
18 Stewart, California Association of 4-Wheel Drive Clubs
19 and United 4-Wheel Drive Associations. I'd like to add
20 a comment on this that from our perspective, we highly
21 support the increased scoring on the volunteer
22 categories, especially as we have a lot of our club
23 members that do participate in a lot of the volunteer
24 activities in order to maintain and help keep these

25 areas as a viable recreation opportunity.

344

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 I'd like to note that the Los Padres Forest sits
2 on the border of one of the largest metropolitan areas
3 in the nation, and as such it is a destination
4 recreation within a few hours' drive for most people;
5 therefore, it is an extremely popular area and it is an
6 extremely important recreation destination.

7 This past summer they had the major fire that
8 went through and there was severe damage throughout the
9 entire forest area, all of these have an impact that
10 the recreation volunteers are out there trying to help
11 and work with the forest in order to get the trails
12 back into condition. They desperately need this money
13 in order to continue those operations. Thank you.

14 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Thank you. Other comments?
15 Commissioners? Do I have a motion?

16 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: It's trail maintenance,
17 it's your area.

18 COMMISSIONER McMILLIN: I'll make a motion that
19 we support this most recent submitted, which I don't
20 have in front of me, the new numbers.

21 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: So did staff make note of
22 those?

23 COMMISSIONER McMILLIN: The total is 65.

24 OHMVR STAFF PEREZ: Would you state it for the
25 record, please.

345

1 COMMISSIONER McMILLIN: I don't have the
2 categories. I don't have the new.

3 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Could the presenter come
4 back?

5 JEFF BENSON: Item No. 2 was an increase of five
6 points, with a score of 24; Item No. 3, an increase of
7 ten points to a score 19 for a total of what we're
8 asking of 65 points.

9 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: So your motion wants to
10 reference the letter that you have in front of you with
11 the rationale?

12 COMMISSIONER McMILLIN: Correct.

13 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: So that's your motion?

14 COMMISSIONER McMILLIN: That's my motion.

15 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Do we have a second?

16 COMMISSIONER PRIZMICH: Second that.

17 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: It's been moved and seconded.

18 All those in favor?

19 (Commissioner Spittler absent.)

20 (Commissioners simultaneously voted.)

21 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Opposed? Motion carries.

22 OHMVR STAFF GLASPIE: The next application, line

23 91, OR-2-ME-60, the Mendocino National Forest, Trail

24 Maintenance. They requested \$289,163. They received a

25 score of 66 points, for a 66 funding determination of
346

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 \$173,498. They also included additional information,

2 quite a lot of it was, once again, general statements.
3 There are some specifics in there.

4 MIKE BURMANN: Good morning, Commissioners, Mike
5 Burmann, Mendocino National Forest. We would like you
6 to consider raising our score from 66 out of a 100 to
7 94 out of a 100. The justification for that, we will
8 start with criteria 1(a), we would like to increase
9 that one by four points, based on the fact that the
10 forest has undertaken an aggressive monitoring program
11 designed to identify and correct resource problems as
12 they occur. The corrective measures used to mitigate
13 and identify these problems are outlined in our annual
14 monitoring report that we submit to the Division
15 annually.

16 For criteria 1(b), we are requesting that the
17 scoring for the criteria be increased by four points
18 based on the fact that the forest annually implements a
19 trail maintenance action plan that identifies those
20 trails that may not be in compliance with soil loss
21 standards and guidelines. Those trails are identified,
22 receive the highest priority when we implement our
23 action plan.

24 For criteria 1(c), we are requesting that the
25 scoring for this criteria be increased by two points

347

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 based on the fact that all 252 of our designated routes
2 have an assigned difficulty rating that accurately
3 reflects the skill level needed to safely negotiate a
4 particular trail that is consistent with the OHV

5 Visitor Guide that we provide to the public.

6 For criteria, 1(d), we are requesting that the
7 scoring for this criteria be increased by one point,
8 based on the fact that all forest entry roads have
9 large reflective signing explaining the operating
10 restrictions of where the trailheads and access roads
11 are also well signed to prevent illegal motorized
12 trespass access, and also the forest works closely with
13 private property owners to ensure the effectiveness of
14 measures implemented to prevent OHV access.

15 For criteria 3(a) we are requesting that the
16 scoring for this criteria be increased by four points
17 based on the fact that since 1982, the Mendocino has
18 competed for and successfully received 56 state OHV
19 Assistance Grants in support of the forest OHV program.

20 For criteria 3(b), we are requesting that the
21 scoring for this criteria be increased by seven points
22 based on the fact that budget and finance personnel
23 have worked closely with the OHMRV Division during our
24 sustained partnership to develop physical protocol and
25 reporting requirements.

348

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 For criteria 3(c), we are requesting that the
2 scoring for this criteria be increased by four points
3 based on the fact that skilled operators maintain all
4 routes in compliance with state soil loss standards.
5 The forest also has recognized experts in OHV
6 management totaling 121 years. Thank you for your
7 consideration.

8 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Thank you. Public comment?
9 DON AMADOR: Don Amador, Blue Ribbon Coalition.
10 I just ask the Commission to consider the revised
11 scores and also want to make the commitment to work
12 with Commissioner Brissenden to try to find some
13 additional appropriated monies and other funding
14 sources for the Forest Service in future funding cycles
15 for recreation, enforcement, and conservation. Thank
16 you.
17 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Thank you. Thanks for the
18 offer.
19 DAVE PICKETT: Dave Pickett, District 36,
20 Motorcycle Sports Committee. Funding levels
21 recommended by the Division in this high-use area is
22 endorsed. This is an awesome facility for OHV
23 recreation. They've got a long-term track record.
24 Let's keep this area open and moving, help them out
25 with this grant. Thank you.

349

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 VICE-CHAIR ANDERSON: Mr. Pickett, did you mean
2 to say you were supporting the Division's scoring?
3 DAVE PICKETT: Yes. Excuse me, I believe it was
4 the counts were changed, but I had left my notes, and I
5 just had down here Division, so the higher of the two
6 for clarification.
7 COMMISSIONER McMILLIN: You mean the applicant's
8 adjusted scoring?
9 DAVE PICKETT: Yes, that's what I meant to say.
10 I'm sorry, thank you.

11 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Other public comments? None.
12 Questions, comments, or motion from the Commissioners?

13 COMMISSIONER McMILLIN: I have a question for
14 Kenny. All of this stuff that this gentleman brought
15 up, was that all part of his original application or is
16 it all new information?

17 OHMVR STAFF GLASPIE: Some of both. There was a
18 lot of new information. There was some old information
19 in there. And I can't agree on a lot of the specifics.
20 It was still -- but I did agree with some of the
21 information that he's presented again is good.

22 COMMISSIONER PRIZMICH: I guess the question
23 then is the new information, is that new information in
24 your opinion valid information or just new information?
25 Does it go to the benefit of the grant?

350

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 OHMVR STAFF GLASPIE: It's not information that
2 we could have scored because we just had no opportunity
3 to even see it. Some of it is very valid information.
4 Some of it I can't -- if you want me to break it down
5 which ones I think are good, which ones I think are --

6 COMMISSIONER PRIZMICH: No, I'm just trying to
7 get a definition. Information is information. There's
8 good information and bad information. Merely because
9 information comes in, there's some that assists the
10 standing of the grant better than others. So I was
11 just trying to get from you if you felt that some of
12 that information was valid, and had it been originally
13 submitted, you would have scored it differently?

14 OHMVR STAFF GLASPIE: Just for instance on the
15 maintaining authorized OHV recreation roads and trails,
16 they don't say how they monitor it. They don't say how
17 the monitoring is used to improve anything on this. So
18 it's still a conclusory statement and wouldn't have
19 increased any score.

20 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: Mr. Priznich, perhaps I
21 can help. How about if I move an additional ten points
22 at criterion three, which is the successful
23 implementation, and we know that that's accurate.
24 We've been here a long time. We've heard the evidence
25 of the successful implementation on the Mendocino. So
351

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 move it from nine to 18. That gives them a 76, gives
2 them 70 percent funding. If that's acceptable to you,
3 then that would move the issue.

4 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: I don't think that answers
5 your question.

6 COMMISSIONER McMILLIN: I'm okay with that.

7 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: If you want to make that
8 motion?

9 COMMISSIONER McMILLIN: I'll make that motion.

10 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: I'll second.

11 COMMISSIONER McMILLIN: Meet somewhere in the
12 middle.

13 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Moved and seconded with the
14 rationale supplied by Commissioner Thomas. The total
15 number again is?

16 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: 76, I've added ten points

17 to their existing Division score of nine on their
18 criteria three.

19 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: So it's been moved and
20 seconded. All those in favor?

21 (Commissioner Spittler absent.)

22 (Commissioners simultaneously voted.)

23 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Opposed? Motion carries.

24 We're reflecting obviously increases in three or
25 four of these. The bubble is rising.

352

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: Inflation, welcome to
2 inflation.

3 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: I know, but that's going to
4 mean some are going to get dropped off at the bottom,
5 but we will get to that at some point. So how many
6 more do we have under trail maintenance, Kenny?

7 OHMVR STAFF GLASPIE: Seven.

8 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Seven more to review. I
9 think we can try and squeeze that out and do a lunch
10 break after we finish those seven if we can move right
11 along. So next.

12 OHMVR STAFF GLASPIE: The next application is
13 line number 93. It's OR-2-P-85, the Plumas National
14 Forest. They requested \$245,000. They received a
15 score of 30, for zero percent funding determination.
16 Their new material, while it's probably all in the
17 original application, the original application was just
18 written very vaguely. It didn't address any item.
19 This, they did address some more, but there is still a

20 lot of generalities and really not explaining why what
21 they're saying is going to happen will.

22 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Will what, Ken?

23 OHMVR STAFF GLASPIE: Will accomplish what they
24 saying it's going to.

25 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: Is there a document that
353

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 was associated with this application, the new
2 information?

3 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: You're referencing new
4 information, which we don't have, unless they came at
5 the last meeting.

6 OHMVR STAFF STALLCOP: It's in your large
7 binders. It's number 10 on the trail maintenance tag.

8 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Thank you.

9 FRED KRUEGER: Thank you, Mardi.

10 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: So while he's looking for
11 that, if you want to make any brief remarks to add to
12 what you've already submitted.

13 FRED KRUEGER: I'll do that, Chairman
14 Brissenden. Thank you very much, Commissioners, for
15 your time. The Plumas National Forest would ask for
16 your reconsideration.

17 OHMVR STAFF PEREZ: Please state your name for
18 the record.

19 FRED KRUEGER: Thank you very much. I'm Fred
20 Krueger. I'm the Public Service Staff Officer. I'm in
21 charge of recreation, engineering, lands, and minerals
22 for the Plumas National Forest. Again, thank you for

23 this opportunity.

24 We would like to request some consideration for
25 increasing the score. Yes, it was noted, my grant

354

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 writer, this was her first opportunity to work with the
2 Commission, did work with those and noted the
3 generalities. We did submit more specifics for the
4 second round, which we appreciate. It's noted that we
5 on the Plumas National Forest have implemented our
6 Forest Order that restricts OHV activities to current
7 roads, routes, trails and areas, even those created by
8 the users. That gives you 5,282 total miles of routes,
9 trails, and areas that are open for riding
10 opportunities.

11 We also note in the new information, past
12 performance, the Plumas National Forest has enjoyed 26
13 grants in the past, all have been successfully
14 performed on for the program deliverables, and we've
15 billed those on time with very, very few difficulties.

16 We would like to request for 1(a) an increase of
17 ten points to fix storm damage that occurred during
18 last winter and the wet winters that occurred on those
19 number of miles of roads.

20 We'd also like to have a score of plus ten for
21 1(b), which deals with continued maintenance that
22 prevents further damage from occurring which relates to
23 that category. 2(c) and 2(d), a plus six, use of our
24 volunteers. We have a very active volunteer effort
25 that is maintained by our recreation OHV technicians.

355

1 Without those folks, it's tough to continue the
2 volunteer programs.

3 I've noted the grants completed to date which is
4 3(b) for ten points, and then 3(c), the use of staff,
5 or qualified staff, again I direct the engineers and
6 our road crews, and I can direct the work very
7 specifically. I'm engaged with that effort, and we've
8 gotten that work done in the past. So I would
9 sincerely appreciate your consideration of this
10 information, and I'd be more than glad to answer any
11 questions you'd have.

12 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Thank you.

13 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: Staff gave you a zero
14 rating for criteria three; is that correct?

15 FRED KRUEGER: That's correct.

16 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: And perhaps we can get an
17 explanation of that. That's pretty draconian.

18 OHMVR STAFF GLASPIE: For (a) they didn't
19 address time frames, which is specifically what it asks
20 for. For (b), they just -- this is -- I'm quoting
21 their new information, it says it has a history from
22 earlier grants of fiscal accountability, but there is
23 no description of what it is. They just say -- they're
24 repeating the question back. Yes, we have a good
25 history. And for (c), they didn't discuss the

356

1 qualifications or the availability of the staff.

2 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: All right. I understand
3 your point. Now, in the interest of equity, can you
4 tell me, do they have a history of bad grants or good
5 grants? What is the history? You said --

6 OHMVR STAFF GLASPIE: I'm too new to the
7 Division, and that's not grants I normally would
8 handle. I handle RTP grants, I really can't go on
9 their history. All we can go by is, the five of us
10 that do the scoring, can go by what the pages are in
11 front of us. It would not be fair to any of the other
12 applicants if we brought in our history with each
13 individual applicant.

14 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: I understand. I'm not
15 asking you in your -- I'm not asking you to redo your
16 rating. I'm asking you an independent question.

17 Do you have any personal knowledge of a history
18 of bad grant behavior for this applicant?

19 OHMVR STAFF GLASPIE: I have no knowledge of a
20 history of bad grant behavior.

21 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: Do you have a history of
22 successful grant completion?

23 OHMVR STAFF GLASPIE: I do not know.

24 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: Does anybody on the staff
25 know?

357

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 OHMVR STAFF BELLUCCI: Yes, Larry Bellucci,
2 grants administrator. I've worked with the Plumas and
3 as well as Dave Quijada, who is no longer staff, but I

4 have no recollection of any negativity in that respect.
5 They've been a good agency to work with.

6 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: So your recollection is
7 you've had a positive experience with this forest.

8 OHMVR STAFF BELLUCCI: Yes, that's correct.

9 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: On trail maintenance?

10 OHMVR STAFF BELLUCCI: Correct.

11 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: I appreciate you answering
12 the question, but I know it's outside the rating
13 system, but I'm trying to exercise my independent
14 judgment. Thank you.

15 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: So we will go to public
16 comment on this grant.

17 SYLVIA MILLIGAN: Sylvia Milligan with
18 Recreation Outdoors Coalition, and I have a cold, so
19 I'm sorry. I've worked with the Plumas for a number of
20 years, and I can tell from your user standpoint they
21 are excellent to work with. They do an excellent job
22 with volunteers, and I would like to see something done
23 with this score also because if they don't have any
24 money for trail maintenance, they have the opportunity
25 of matching funds from ERFO and also matching from

358

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 volunteers. And if they can't get out there to do
2 trail maintenance, they're not going to have any
3 volunteers out there working. This is a good way to
4 leverage their money. They do an excellent job doing
5 that. I would really like to see, if you've got the
6 pencils sharpened, keep them writing. Do us some good.

7 Thank you.

8 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Thank you.

9 DON KLUSMAN: Don Klusman, California 4-Wheel
10 Drive Association. I too have worked with the Plumas
11 for more years than I probably want to admit. This
12 forest has always done an excellent job of its
13 volunteer work and keeping the trails maintained. The
14 California 4-Wheel Drive Association has five Adopt a
15 Trails in its forest, three of them being in a wild and
16 scenic corridor that these were all cherry stemmed by
17 Congress. We have worked in partnership with the
18 forest to keep those trails opened and maintained in a
19 fashion that they do not have erosion that's going into
20 this wild and scenic river. We've had an excellent
21 rapport with them. I cannot stress the urgency of
22 having some money so that the volunteers can keep
23 working with the forest because, as you know, federal
24 regulations and so forth, when you go out there to do
25 trail maintenance, you need to have someone there from
359

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 the Forest Service or at least somebody advising you of
2 the proper criteria of how to move that tree from there
3 to there without causing erosion. So I would ask that
4 you, as Sylvia asked, sharpen the pencil a little bit,
5 bring their score up so they at least get some money to
6 help with the volunteer effort that's out there. Thank
7 you.

8 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Thank you. Commissioners?

9 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: I'm ready for a motion.

10 Okay. Let's increase the successful implementation
11 based on the testimony to 30 out of 30; increase the
12 use of volunteer and low cost labor based on the
13 testimony of Mr. Klusman, five. And I have an
14 additional --

15 VICE-CHAIR ANDERSON: I'm suggesting five more
16 points under category one to try to keep up with storm
17 damage.

18 OHMVR STAFF FREITAS: Can you give us a total
19 score?

20 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: That would be an
21 additional 40 from the 30 that exists in the staff
22 recommendation, so it would be a total of 70.

23 VICE-CHAIR ANDERSON: Those are five and five,
24 so that would be 22.

25 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: 30 points in the

360

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 successful completion, five points in the use of
2 volunteer labor increase, and five points on the other.
3 That's a total of 40 additional points, plus a base
4 score of 30 is 70, so that gives them 70 points.

5 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: I have a motion.

6 COMMISSIONER McMILLIN: I'll second that.

7 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: It's been moved and seconded
8 a score of 70 based on the rationale that was provided
9 by the motioner. So those in favor?

10 (Commissioner Spittler absent.)

11 (Commissioners simultaneously voted.)

12 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Opposed? Motion carries.

13 OHMVR STAFF GLASPIE: Next application, line 94,
14 OR-1-N0-71, Redding Field Office, Trail Maintenance.
15 They requested \$54,660. They received a score of 54
16 points for a 50 percent funding determination of
17 \$27,300. They also submitted additional information,
18 and some of it was pretty good, but there was a lot of
19 nonspecifics on time frames and just how they were
20 going to actually accomplish what they were doing.

21 SKY ZAFFARANO: Sky Zaffarano, Redding BLM.
22 Just as far as new information, in addition to what we
23 submitted in the score increase rationale, on
24 January 1st of this year, we hosted the annual Poker
25 Run event in that area and participation was 360 riders
361

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 came out to use the area. And that took place after
2 the grant was submitted. So we're having a lot of use
3 during events. There are three to four events annually
4 hosted in this area. Also, we have two staging areas
5 within Chappie Shasta, and the most popular of which is
6 located 15 minutes from Redding, so we get a lot of use
7 in that area.

8 Specific to increase scoring, on category
9 evaluation criteria one, in general, we felt that the
10 application clearly and concisely answered each
11 category, and we would like to see an increased score
12 in that criteria to 30 out of 40. Criteria two, we
13 just left it the same, it was a score of 22 out of 30,
14 and we feel like that's fair.

15 In evaluation criteria category three, page five
Page 91

16 of the application clearly details the applicant's
17 history of successful implementing similar projects.
18 Factual information included specific grant numbers
19 with dollar amounts allocated for trail maintenance and
20 work completed using those funds. And we'd like to see
21 an increased score in that criteria from nine out of 30
22 to 18 out of 30, which would give us an overall score
23 of 70. Thank you.

24 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Public comments.

25 DON AMADOR: Don Amador, Blue Ribbon Coalition.

362

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 I just wanted to touch on the one area I think that is
2 at least worthy of some consideration, and that's the
3 history of the grant program. As far as I'm aware,
4 they have an excellent history with grants and
5 completing their projects and feel that at least going
6 from the nine up to 18 out of 30 is at least worthy of
7 some consideration. Thank you.

8 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Thank you.

9 SYLVIA MILLIGAN: Sylvia Milligan, Recreation
10 Outdoors Coalition. And here again, Sky has done an
11 incredible job with this area, and I work with the
12 Shasta County Board of Supervisors. And let me tell
13 you, they're very concerned that trail maintenance is
14 kept up in this area because of the people then that
15 are out in the community riding. So we need to keep
16 this area as a good solid riding area. Gosh, I lost my
17 train of thought, I'm sorry.

18 They do an excellent job. They also work very

19 hard with the volunteers, and they leverage their money
20 very, very well by working with the volunteers. So I
21 would hope that you look kindly and raise their scores
22 somewhat. Thank you.

23 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Thank you. Do I have a
24 motion?

25 COMMISSIONER McMILLIN: I would make a motion we
363

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 accept staff's recommendation.

2 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: Second.

3 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Been moved and seconded at
4 staff level. All those in favor?

5 (Commissioner Spittler absent.)

6 (Commissioners simultaneously voted.)

7 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Opposed? Motion carries.
8 Thank you.

9 VICE-CHAIR ANDERSON: Before we go to the next
10 one, I'm going to ask the question of the Chair where I
11 might put some comments and questions that I have for
12 the staff in general about the problem of history of
13 applicants?

14 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Reflecting the history on
15 their application and their evaluations, is that it?

16 VICE-CHAIR ANDERSON: Yes.

17 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: I think we may want to have
18 an overview at the end of the granting meeting to kind
19 of say where we went right and where we need a little
20 help.

21 VICE-CHAIR ANDERSON: So you want that at the
Page 93

22 end. Thank you.

23 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Hold it until -- I sense the
24 way we're going through these, that we might have a
25 little time tomorrow to kind of evaluate the process,
364

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 give guidance to staff, applicants might even be able
2 to chime in and hone this process a bit more.

3 VICE-CHAIR ANDERSON: Thank you.

4 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Ken.

5 OHMVR STAFF GLASPIE: The next application is
6 line 95, OR-1-CD-360, Ridgecrest Field Office, Trail
7 Maintenance. They requested \$386,514. They received a
8 score of 58, for a 50 percent funding determination of
9 \$193,257. Their additional information was, in my
10 opinion, split about 50/50 with some new evidence and
11 some conclusory, general broad statements.

12 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Is the applicant here?

13 BRUCE BRAZIL: I'm the one that initially
14 requested that be pulled. The applicants are here.

15 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: I think we want to continue
16 with protocol. We will let the applicant, and then let
17 you comment on their behalf. Thank you.

18 HECTOR VILLALOBOS: I'm not sure why this was
19 pulled from the Consent Calendar. BLM was prepared to
20 accept the staff recommendation and go forward under
21 the Consent Calendar. So without knowing why it was
22 pulled off the Consent Calendar, I reserve my comments.

23 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: State your name.

24 HECTOR VILLALOBOS: My name is Hector

25 Villalobos. I'm the field manager for the Ridgecrest 365

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 Field Office, BLM.

2 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Thank you.

3 BRUCE BRAZIL: Bruce Brazil, California Enduro
4 Riders Association. And the reason I requested that
5 this one be pulled, first, let me kind of throw out a
6 reminder to the Commission that one of the tools that
7 they have is to make adjustments to the cost
8 deliverables, not just overall scoring, but they can
9 make a line item adjustment to the cost deliverables.

10 And on this one, the project cost deliverables
11 sheet has staff entries for an archeologist, wildlife
12 biologist, natural resource specialist for a total of
13 \$109,807. According to the California Code of
14 Regulations No. 4970.55 and 4970.64, these positions
15 should be funded from the conservation account, not
16 trail maintenance account.

17 I would request that the Commissioners have
18 those items removed from the deliverables. And like
19 the Chairman has stated, the bubble is getting bigger.
20 Here is a legitimate way to make a little reduction.
21 The rest of their request, I'm in favor of.

22 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: I wish the bubble was getting
23 bigger. That means more cash, but the bubble is going
24 up in terms of who is getting funded and who's not.
25 But I think there are other things going on here today 366

1 that I'm not fully aware of. So I'll reserve other
2 comments. Staff, can you comment on that?

3 CHIEF JENKINS: I'm thinking of that as I'm
4 standing here.

5 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Well, you're sitting, by the
6 way.

7 CHIEF JENKINS: Sitting, there you go. Shows
8 you how quickly my mind is working this morning.

9 I think I understand what Mr. Brazil was getting
10 at; however, I'm not sure that it is completely
11 accurate. So in the trail maintenance category what we
12 are trying to base -- what we are basing how the funds
13 and deliverables are allocated is based on what actual
14 work is going to be performed, so the deliverables.
15 Which staff on any given agency performs those duties,
16 I don't know that that really comes into play. For
17 instance, I don't remember specifically, Mr. Brazil,
18 which -- if you could just remind me which
19 classifications you were specifically mentioning.

20 BRUCE BRAZIL: Okay. The staff that they're
21 talking about was an archeologist, wildlife biologist,
22 and natural resource specialist.

23 CHIEF JENKINS: Okay, thank you. Then I think
24 perhaps the question then to send back to the agency is
25 specifically what are they going to have those people

367

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 doing, not necessarily what is their duty statement per

2 the agency's duty statement, but in a lot of these
3 different classifications, you can have them do a wide
4 range of different activities, not always in a
5 straitjacket of only what's in that general duty
6 statement. There is always that broad category of you
7 do what you do to get that job done. So perhaps the
8 best course is we need to hear from the applicant about
9 how they're going to use those positions to achieve
10 trail maintenance deliverables.

11 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Okay. Could the applicant
12 respond, please?

13 CRAIG BECK: Craig Beck with the Ridgecrest BLM,
14 Recreation Branch Chief. Those, the archeologist,
15 wildlife biologist, natural resource specialist, my
16 numbers that I'm looking at are a little different
17 price wise, but what they're going to do is implement
18 our wildlife protection plan, which requires monitoring
19 to ensure that our activities are not impacting on
20 endangered species or critical species of concern. So
21 they're basically guaranteeing that our actions are
22 appropriate and preventative in nature as required by
23 the regulations.

24 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Would you say those
25 activities would then appropriately maintain those

368

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 trails so that they could be used?

2 CRAIG BECK: That would be a correct statement
3 or interpretation of what we're doing. Their objective
4 is to ensure that recreational opportunities continue

5 without -- and we can do the maintenance to maintain
6 those opportunities, without impacting their
7 specialists.

8 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Commissioners, do you have
9 any of questions of the applicant?

10 HECTOR VILLALOBOS: If I may add?

11 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: State your name for the
12 record.

13 HECTOR VILLALOBOS: Hector Villalobos, Field
14 Manager for the Ridgecrest Field Office. The areas
15 that we do a lot of maintenance in consist of the Rands
16 area of critical environmental concern and also the
17 Jawbone Dove Springs area of critical environmental
18 concern. The types of species that we worry about in
19 those areas are, for example, includes Robber's Roost,
20 an area that's protected for birds of prey; the Mojave
21 ground squirrel, the desert tortoise. We have springs
22 and riparian areas that are important habitat in those
23 areas. When we do maintenance, we want to make sure
24 that we don't disturb those habitats and resources
25 within those habitats. The Jawbone Dove Springs area

369

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 has a number of archeological sites. When we do our
2 maintenance, we want to make sure that we don't disturb
3 those archeological sites. That's all I have to add.
4 Thank you.

5 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Thank you. Mr. Prizmich.

6 COMMISSIONER PRIZMICH: After staff has heard
7 what the commentary was here, if they could give us

8 their opinion as to whether this, as described here,
9 falls under trail maintenance or should be in another
10 category?

11 CHIEF JENKINS: From what I've heard, and the
12 discussion that's gone on, given that in order to do
13 trail maintenance projects you have to keep your WHPPs
14 and HPPs up to date and up to speed, to that degree,
15 you would be performing those WHPPs, doing the
16 qualifying tasks to keep the WHPPs in line so you can
17 do the trail maintenance. Yes, I would have to say
18 with what I have in front of me right now, without
19 giving a lot more analysis, my quick read is that they
20 would be qualifying expenses.

21 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: I would imagine you do not
22 want to run over tortoises with your machinery, and so
23 thereby taking species in violation of the law and
24 closing your operation down, I think that's probably
25 the thinking behind having a biologist so that you

370

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 don't get your federal tape permit revoked.

2 VICE-CHAIR ANDERSON: I have a question for the
3 applicant. Would any of this relate to the newly
4 identified problems in the Red Mountains with hazardous
5 waste?

6 CRAIG BECK: No, this is outside of the Red
7 Mountain area that you're referring to.

8 COMMISSIONER PRIZMICH: Okay. Thank you.

9 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Pleasure of the Commission?

10 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: Staff Consent item as

11 recommended by the applicant.

12 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: So with staff
13 recommendations? You're moving staff recommendations?

14 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: I am moving staff
15 recommendations.

16 COMMISSIONER PRIZMICH: Second.

17 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: It's been moved and seconded,
18 all those in favor?

19 (Commissioners simultaneously voted.)

20 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Opposed?

21 COMMISSIONER SPITLER: No.

22 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Motion carried. So that
23 leaves us with four more to go. Yes, four more. Okay.
24 Let's push on.

25 OHMVR STAFF GLASPIE: Next application is line
371

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 96, OR-2-SV-94, San Bernardino National Forest. They
2 asked \$96,750. They received a score of 48, for a 40
3 percent funding determination of \$38,700. Once again,
4 they submitted substantial new information and some of
5 it was very good, but a lot of it was still continuing
6 along the same line of general descriptions.

7 CHRIS EVANS: Good morning, Chris Evans, the
8 Forest Trails Program Manager for the San Bernardino
9 National Forest. We submitted prior to the last
10 meeting, comments and clarification on many of the
11 categories. And collectively we felt that the scores
12 should have reflected a 72 out of the 100 available,
13 specifically in category one, we felt that we merited

14 an increase of 10 points. And in category two, we felt
15 that it merited an increase of seven points to a 22 out
16 of 30. In category three, we felt that it merited an
17 increase of seven points to a total of 20 out of 30.

18 Specifically in category one, under criteria
19 (b), we felt an additional four points to a score of
20 seven was merited due to our original application --
21 and I apologize, my page numbers are not going to
22 correlate with the binders that were put together. But
23 we felt that in our original, application page number
24 52, paragraph three, described maintenance to the trail
25 systems. And as far as reducing the need for

372

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 restoration in the future, there was a discussion about
2 how a lack of maintenance will create a hazard to
3 public health and also the requirement for future
4 maintenance.

5 Under section (c), maintaining safe riding
6 conditions, there was considerable discussion on page
7 50, paragraph three, indicated maintenance was used to
8 maintain a desired level of difficulty, also described
9 entrance strategies for more and more difficult trails.
10 It would prevent novice riders from being tempted to
11 access those trails, described brushing and clearing of
12 sidelines in order to improve rider safety.

13 Criteria two, more efficient use of funds,
14 specifically under (b), use of partnerships to reduce
15 reliance on OHV Trust funds, there is a considerable
16 discussion about our partnership with the Forest

17 Adopt-a-Trail program, which involves many partners and
18 their contribution to the trail maintenance program on
19 the forest.

20 Moving on to number three, history of successful
21 implementation, we felt that merited an increase in
22 section (a), an increase of two points to a score of
23 eight. Our original application, page 53, paragraph
24 two, there is a detailed discussion about our past two
25 agreements OR--2-SB-80 and OR--2-SB-82 that did

373

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 indicate time frames, completion dates, and percentages
2 complete.

3 On history of fiscal accountability, there was a
4 discussion of a past audit that actually that went back
5 to agreements dating back to 1985, a discussion
6 indicating there were some findings by the State that
7 we may have owed some past money. We were able to do
8 the research on the forest and document that, in fact,
9 where it was necessary, those funds had been repaid,
10 and, in fact, there was not a balance due to the State
11 from those audits dating back to '85.

12 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Please summarize.

13 CHRIS EVANS: I would like to introduce one
14 piece of new information, if I may, relating this back
15 to our OHV route designation process that's ongoing; we
16 have recently kind of completed our schedule for that,
17 and we anticipate to be through our NEPA process for
18 redesignation and designation of routes on the forest
19 around July of this year and publishing your new motor

20 2007-01-25 OHV C1 x
vehicle use map at that time. I can't really say for
21 sure exactly what the net change in OHV opportunity is
22 going to be, but I do expect that there will be some
23 changes to our designated system of routes. As a
24 result of that, any new routes that we take on are
25 going to require considerable maintenance to bring

374

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 those up to standard. And that was new information we
2 didn't anticipate was going to be happening in this
3 cycle, but we've kind of accelerated that process, and
4 it will be happening this year.

5 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Public comment?

6 BENJAMIN von DIELINGEN: Good morning,
7 Commissioners, my name is Ben von Dielingen. I manage
8 the OHV program in the San Bernardino National Forest
9 Association. We are partners with the Forest Service.
10 Just a little update that you may not have had a chance
11 to really go through, our volunteers put in nearly
12 25,000 volunteers hours last year in partnering with
13 the Forest Service, and a chunk of that was for trail
14 maintenance. That's in addition to 8,000 Adopt-a-Trail
15 hours that was donated to the Forest Service, which is
16 a very substantial part of the contribution which
17 helped leverage the money from the grant. The catch
18 being, the monies from this grant do help support
19 Forest Service staff, Adopt-a-Trail coordinators and
20 liaisons, without whom it's hard to coordinate
21 volunteers and have this good work come about.

22 So based upon the good work of the volunteer

2007-01-25 OHV C1 x
23 Adopt-a-Trail clubs have done, we need the Forest
24 Service staff to help guide and form the direction for
25 that work, so we would like to support the rescore of
375

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 72. Thank you.
2 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Any other comments?
3 TOM TAMMONE: Tom Tammone, Sound Level
4 Monitoring Coordinator, San Bernardino National Forest
5 Association. I definitely do not agree with what I
6 heard from Division that Chris Evans didn't supply
7 enough specifics on his request for a score increase.
8 I honestly don't understand how more specific he's
9 supposed to get with this. He's been very specific.
10 I've been with the program for years, since 1994, and
11 all of their audits, and they come through clean every
12 year. So I'm not understanding what the issue is.
13 Definitely see the 72 points that he's asking for is
14 definitely justified. And it was really kind of
15 strange last year, I was up here having to explain to a
16 previous Commissioner that -- just complaining they
17 weren't asking for enough trail maintenance money. So
18 they definitely need the money, and 72 points is
19 definitely justified. Thank you.

20 JOHN STEWART: Good morning, Commissioners, John
21 Stewart, California Association of 4-Wheel Drive Clubs,
22 United 4-Wheel Drive Associations. In general, I can
23 support San Bernardino's request. I do, however, think
24 they're being a little bit modest when they are only
25 requesting a seven point increase in category number

376

1 two. My view of that particular request itself should
2 be -- you know, dealing with the partnerships with
3 other groups, that score itself should be a 30 out of a
4 30. The San Bernardino Volunteer Association is a
5 topnotch association. It is recognized by the
6 Washington office as being a leading example of the
7 partnerships that the forest is trying to implement
8 nationwide. In fact, the San Bernardino is receiving
9 calls from other forests to figure out how they can
10 establish the same kind of a deal.

11 You heard them talk about the number of
12 volunteer hours, and that's not an exaggeration. In
13 fact, if anything, that's an underrepresentation of the
14 amount of work the volunteers are actually doing to
15 preserve the recreation opportunities and preserve the
16 resources of that forest. This is an important area,
17 and this is one of four forests that sits in the middle
18 of one of the largest metropolitan areas. Yes, it
19 receives a lot of visitor days, a lot of people are
20 interested in this area, so there are a large number of
21 volunteers that are actually there helping them. So I
22 would support the extra -- you know, what they're
23 asking for, plus the extra -- in fact, category number
24 two should be a full 30. Thank you.

25 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Thank you. Commis sioners?

377

1 VICE-CHAIR ANDERSON: I want to thank you
2 Mr. Stewart, I was about to say the same thing about
3 their volunteer program. I've been familiar with it
4 for more than 20 years, and when I was suggesting to
5 the BLM that they ought to establish some kind of a
6 volunteer force to support what was going on on the BLM
7 lands, a lot of the ideas about what could be done came
8 out of the San Bernardino Forest Association, and their
9 guidance was used by Angeles National Forest in trying
10 to set up a volunteer program within the Angeles
11 National Forest, so it's really been exemplary.

12 I'm less familiar with the work that they've
13 done with OHV than they have with other environmental
14 issues, but I'm sure that they're fully plugged into
15 trail maintenance. So I would support 30 out of 30 in
16 that category, unless -- I'm less comfortable with
17 changes in the other areas.

18 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Is that a motion?

19 VICE-CHAIR ANDERSON: If you want, yes.

20 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: Second.

21 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: So we've increased their
22 score by 15; is that what I'm hearing?

23 VICE-CHAIR ANDERSON: I believe so, yes.

24 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: I've seconded.

25 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: So we have a total score of
378

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 63. We have a motion and second. Under discussion?

2 COMMISSIONER McMILLIN: I'd like to get them up
3 to 70, and I'm not as smooth yet.

4 VICE-CHAIR ANDERSON: What are you suggesting?

5 COMMISSIONER McMILLIN: What was your request on
6 the third category? I was doodling here, but I was
7 very impressed with the entourage they brought to the
8 south grants meeting of volunteers.

9 CHRIS EVANS: In the third category, as chance
10 would have it, we were increasing an increase of seven
11 points.

12 COMMISSIONER McMILLIN: That was the one I
13 missed.

14 CHRIS EVANS: That was based upon detailed
15 discussion under section (a) about past grants
16 completed, including grant numbers, completion dates,
17 and percentages completed. And I can recite those to
18 you, if you'd like.

19 COMMISSIONER McMILLIN: Well, I'd like to ask if
20 the maker of the motion could by chance add seven
21 there?

22 VICE-CHAIR ANDERSON: Okay.

23 CHRIS EVANS: There was also additional
24 clarification provided under section (b) and section
25 (c) of that category, as well. History of fiscal

379

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 accountability, under section (b), we asked for an
2 additional two points based on the discussion of the
3 audit findings dating back to 1985 and our ability to
4 clarify all of that.

5 VICE-CHAIR ANDERSON: Thank you. I think that
6 we have enough here.

7 CHRIS EVANS: Okay. Thank you.

8 VICE-CHAIR ANDERSON: I'll move category three
9 to 20.

10 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Does your second concur with
11 your adjustments?

12 VICE-CHAIR ANDERSON: I don't know.

13 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: Well, barely.

14 CHRIS EVANS: We will take it.

15 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: Barely, and I know that's
16 an affirmative. There you are.

17 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: It's been moved and seconded
18 with those adjustments and amendments to a total score
19 of 70. All those in favor?

20 (Commissioners simultaneously voted.)

21 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Opposed? Motion carries.

22 I have a question for the transcriber Cheryl,
23 how are your hands? Getting tired. We have three more
24 to go. If it's anything like this one, it might be
25 another 30 minutes.

380

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 OHMVR STAFF GLASPIE: The next application is on
2 line 97.

3 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: I realize that. Let's hold
4 for a moment on that thought. I'm going to call for a
5 break for about an hour. Come back at 1:20.

6 (Lunch break taken in proceedings.)

7 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: So we have three trail
8 maintenance still to go, Kenny? Am I counting right?

9 OHMVR STAFF GLASPIE: Yes, and I believe

10 Director Greene wanted to talk to you about another.

11 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: We did discuss the oversight
12 of the Sequoia not pulling theirs off of Consent, and I
13 have to have concurrence from the rest of the
14 Commission to rehear that and bring it back. So I will
15 do that after we do three. Okay.

16 OHMVR STAFF GLASPIE: Next application is on
17 line 97, OR-808, Santa Clara County Parks and
18 Recreation requested \$235,048. They received a score
19 of 46 points for a funding determination of 40 percent,
20 or \$94,019. Their new information that was submitted,
21 some of it was very good and specific, particularly on
22 the history.

23 LISA KILLOUGH: My name is Lisa Killough. I am
24 Director of Santa Clara County Parks, and we're here to
25 ask for a higher score under Item No. 1, 1(b), when you
381

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 talk about avoiding future maintenance increases due to
2 deferred maintenance, we give a lot of information in
3 the grant application, which you can read, about the
4 standard of care for trail maintenance, which is
5 extremely high for this park, especially if you compare
6 us to other parks around the state. So I won't go into
7 that.

8 But one area that we are requesting in this
9 grant is for a full-time employment operator, rather
10 than the part-time person that we that currently have.
11 And we will be able to maintain an even higher standard
12 with a full-time person. One of the things that we

13 have learned in our outreach through the surveys that
14 we do on an annual basis, is that the riders are asking
15 for a higher level of care in all of our tracks and our
16 trails. Obviously, the equipment operator would help
17 to that end.

18 We also have a dedicated volunteer group. We
19 have about 500 volunteers who help on a regular basis;
20 they meet monthly, and they do a lot of work. They are
21 our eyes and ears on the trails to report problem areas
22 as they occur. They also help with the corrective
23 work.

24 Related to our resource management program,
25 we've gone to a new program of out-sloping our trails.

382

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 This is new information to you. We have out-sloped our
2 trails, and we've installed water bars at regular
3 intervals to help keep the water off the trails and to
4 keep the erosion to a minimum. That certainly helps
5 with deferred maintenance. And then in consultation
6 with our resource manager, we do water testing in the
7 creek on a regular basis so that we don't add
8 sedimentation as a result of any of our trail
9 maintenance, so that certainly has an environmental
10 impact, as well as a beneficial one. So for that
11 category we would like a scoring of eight out of ten.

12 Under Item 1(c), maintaining safe riding
13 conditions, in addition to all of the things that we've
14 noted in our application and in our information
15 submitted separately, we also maintain a pretty unique

16 one-way trail riding system. When you come into this
17 park, you have to ride in one direction for the whole
18 park, all of the trails are a one-way system, and you
19 don't see that kind of a system everywhere. That
20 really encourages a safe maintained surface. One of
21 the other benefits of the one-way system is that with a
22 reduced trail width, you have a beneficial impact on
23 maintenance. Since the upkeep is a lot less for a
24 smaller tread, and that obviously has a beneficial
25 impact on the resources, too.

383

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 So I'm going to turn it over Dave Pierce. I'm
2 going to ask Dave Pierce to come forward and speak to
3 you on the other items for this related to categories
4 three. Dave.

5 DAVE PIERCE: Thanks, Dave Pierce with Santa
6 Clara County Parks and Recreation Department. I'm the
7 Grants Programs Manager for the department. I wanted
8 to address two questions to you. These are questions
9 for number three in your evaluation criteria.

10 Number 3(a), which is concerning prior projects
11 being completed within the time frame provided, we did
12 note that the department has provided a response that
13 states the fact that we have completed all our prior
14 OHV grant projects within the grant performance period
15 that were granted to us. We never have asked for any
16 extension for any project that we have ever done
17 through OHV grant funds. Specifically the last three
18 grants, OR-698, 620 and 580 were all completed on time.

19 And we believe that this fact clearly denotes that
20 we're fully capable of completing our projects on time.
21 So we're requesting a score of ten out of ten on that
22 for that particular question.

23 For question 3(b), our history of fiscal
24 accountability with similar grants and projects, we
25 would note that in our response, we included the fact ³⁸⁴

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 that audits of grant funds have never revealed any
2 exceptions requiring the return of grant funds,
3 specifically OHV grants OR-341, 372, 371, 372, 384,
4 none of those revealed any exceptions. I might add,
5 too, that any other grants that we received in our
6 department outside of OHV grant funds have never
7 required that we have returned any funds to grant funds
8 that we've received. So with that, we're requesting a
9 score of ten out of ten points for that question.
10 Thank you.

11 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Thank you. Any other public
12 comments?

13 BRUCE BRAZIL: Bruce Brazil, California Enduro
14 Riders Association. The previous two speakers have
15 mentioned what's going on within the confines of the
16 park. Keeping the park operational, keeping it where
17 the people want to go there, also affects the areas
18 outside the park. If you take a drive down there, take
19 the rode up to the park, you're not going to see a
20 bunch of extra trails, user-created illegal trails.
21 You don't hear any grants here from, I guess, would be

22 Santa Clara law enforcement, asking for grants for OHV
23 usage. That's because this place has provided a place
24 for the inhabitants of the South Bay to go and recreate
25 up with their OHVs. So primarily for, number one up

385

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 there, a higher score is definitely a good job -- you
2 know, it shows that they're doing their job and how it
3 affects their community, as well as just the local
4 park. Thank you.

5 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Thank you.

6 DAVE PICKETT: Hi, Dave Pickett, District 36,
7 Motorcycle Sports Committee. I agree with the grant
8 applicant on the scoring that they have requested. If
9 you remember the last go-round, Commissioner Willard
10 had done a site tour of this facility and raved about
11 it. I concur with that. It's a well-run facility.
12 It's desperately needed down there in the Silicon
13 Valley. It does take the overflow from Hollister on
14 certain weekends, and I ask you to give this some
15 strong reconsideration. It's a well-run facility.
16 Thank you.

17 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Thank you. Commissioners?

18 VICE-CHAIR ANDERSON: I have a question for the
19 applicant. I'm confused about the number you said of
20 volunteers. In the staff evaluation it said, 500 hours
21 of volunteer service. I thought you said 500
22 volunteers, which is it?

23 MIKE RUITSTORFEN: We have 500 hours documented.
24 Mike Ruitstorfen, Park Ranger for Metcalf Motorcycle

25 Park. It's 500 hours we have documented. Just

386

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 probably like a lot of parks, we don't document all of
2 the volunteer effort out there. We are working on
3 trying to make sure we get all volunteer hours
4 documented. But it's probably closer to a little over
5 500 hours. And, you know, just like what they were
6 saying, all of the single-track trails, they are single
7 track. Foot trail tread is about a foot to two feet
8 wide. It's not wide enough for a Sweco so basically
9 all of those trails are maintained by volunteers.
10 Staff does not have time. So pretty much the OHV
11 riders like that. They need to maintain it, they help
12 us out. We give them education on how to maintain the
13 trails. We give them the equipment. Hopefully that
14 helps you.

15 VICE-CHAIR ANDERSON: Okay. Thank you.

16 COMMISSIONER McMILLIN: I'll make a motion we
17 accept staff's recommendation.

18 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: A lot of enthusiastic
19 support.

20 COMMISSIONER PRIZMICH: I'll second that.

21 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: It's been moved and seconded
22 for staff recommendation. The question has been
23 called. All those in favor?

24 (Commissioners simultaneously voted.)

25 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Opposed?

387

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax
Page 114

1 VICE-CHAIR ANDERSON: I'm going to abstain.

2 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: I'm going to abstain.

3 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Motion carries.

4 OHMVR STAFF GLASPIE: Next application is on
5 line 101, it's OR-2-SR-35, Six Rivers National Forest,
6 Trail Maintenance. They requested \$31,477. They
7 received a score of 56, for 50 percent funding
8 determination of \$15,739. And I do have to say that
9 their additional information touched just about all of
10 our concerns. They did a pretty good job. I concur
11 with what they said on their request.

12 RAY McCRAY: Chairman, Commissioner, Ray McCray,
13 Six Rivers National Forest. Our forest believes that
14 our application should merit a higher score. I won't
15 necessarily go through everything, but the rationale
16 was based on a comparison of the Division's comments on
17 the higher scored other trail maintenance grants and --

18 VICE-CHAIR ANDERSON: Did you provide us with
19 any written?

20 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: It's coming around right now.
21 Go forward.

22 RAY McCRAY: So, therefore, we were hoping to
23 increase the score of item 1(a) and (b) and (c) for a
24 total of 25 out of 40. Item two would stay the same.
25 And item three recommended score change would be 12 out
388

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

2 I'd also like to make a point that with this
3 increase, primarily all of it goes to another worthy
4 cause. It would go to a CCC crew to do the trail
5 maintenance, and I'm also able to benefit from their 25
6 percent match that they provide through our
7 partnership.

8 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Any public comment on this
9 grant? Commissioners.

10 COMMISSIONER PRIZMICH: Mr. Chairman, I would
11 like to make the following recommendations based upon
12 the information that was just handed out and also based
13 upon the comments by staff that virtually all of the
14 information that we just received here was valid and
15 pertinent to the grant, so that essentially they were
16 in agreement with I assume the new recommendations.
17 And I can go through these specifically, or I can just
18 provide you with the numbers, if you don't mind.

19 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: You can reference, as others
20 have referenced the letter, and just give us the
21 numbers.

22 COMMISSIONER PRIZMICH: In Item No. 1, there was
23 a 19 out of 40, and I would like to recommend a 25 out
24 of 40. In Item No. 2, there was a recommendation of 26
25 out of 30, and that recommendation it looks like it

389

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 stays the same. In Item No. 3, the recommendation was
2 11 out of 30 and with what they're requesting, and I
3 agree with is 12 out of 30. For a total of I think 63
4 out of a 100 score; that's my motion.

2007-01-25 OHV C1 x
5 COMMISSIONER McMILLIN: Second.
6 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Thank you for seconding.
7 Under discussion.
8 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: The evidence here is
9 pretty thin. For example, 1(a), the new information is
10 the statement that funding is critical to meet
11 environmental standards. I think that goes for
12 everybody. 1(b), you're increasing 1(a), does the
13 motion increase 1(a)?
14 COMMISSIONER PRIZMICH: Correct.
15 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: And 1(b), does it
16 increase?
17 COMMISSIONER PRIZMICH: 1(b), I don't think it
18 increases.
19 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: Tell me again, two you
20 increased?
21 COMMISSIONER PRIZMICH: Two is not increased.
22 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: And three is increased
23 what?
24 COMMISSIONER PRIZMICH: By one point.
25 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: I'm interested in at least

390

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 the fig leaf of following the rules. We don't seem to
2 have enough evidence here to justify it, so anyway.

3 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Any other comments under
4 discussion? All those in favor of the motion?

5 (Commissioners simultaneously voted.)

6 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Those opposed?

7 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: No.

8 2007-01-25 OHV C1 x
COMMISSIONER SPITLER: No.
9 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Motion passes.
10 OHMVR STAFF GLASPIE: Next application is on
11 line 102, OR-2-T-101, Tahoe National Forest, Trail
12 Maintenance. They requested \$149,800. They received a
13 score of 43 points, for a 40 percent funding
14 determination of \$59,920. They did submit additional
15 information, and I'm not sure how I'd address it.

16 DAVID MICHAEL: David Michael, Tahoe National
17 Forest, OHV Program Manager. Tahoe National Forest
18 would like to have the Commission consider raising the
19 scores of this grant application. We scored zero in
20 three of the areas, and we would like to address those.

21 In criteria 1(b), we'd like to increase that
22 from zero to eight points. The forest maintains that
23 we did address the 1(b) question in its response by
24 referencing funding levels. There's a direct
25 correlation between adequate funding and maintenance.

391

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 And so we would ask that -- and the continued success
2 of the program depends on using funding levels to
3 leverage volunteers and other funds to be able to
4 complete the project. And that's the way we addressed
5 that, so we would like to go from zero to eight.

6 Criteria 1(d), we were at zero, we'd like to
7 increase that to eight. And we'd likewise respectfully
8 disagree with the Division's score of zero because we
9 mention law enforcement and its relationship to trail
10 maintenance. We feel that law enforcement activities

11 such as signing, and barriers, and education, our
12 experience has shown us this has a direct effect on
13 maintenance and, therefore, feel we should have an
14 increased score because of that.

15 On criteria two, we'd like to raise that from 23
16 to 26 points. The forest affirms that we have really
17 an exemplary program of expending these funds. We have
18 over \$300,000 of contributed time and dollars, and
19 almost 3,000 hours of volunteers. And especially in
20 the last few years, as funds have gotten harder to come
21 by, we've even more effectively used these, and we
22 think the record shows that. We don't feel that the
23 score that we were given reflects that.

24 Criteria 3(a) was another one of those areas
25 where we received a zero score. This dealt with the

392

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 timeliness and so forth. And we stated in there that we
2 consistently have met timeliness. We started our first
3 grant here 26 years ago with OR-2-T-01, and now we are
4 at OR-2-T-101. We've had over 100 grant applications,
5 and we believe that the record certainly shows that we
6 have met within time frames our obligations.

7 Criteria 3(b), up from two points to 10 points.
8 And this deals with fiscal accountability and likewise
9 our records show that. And if audits are any examples
10 of fiscal accountability, our history of good audits
11 that have come out of forest certainly warrants a
12 higher score.

13 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Please summarize.

14 DAVID MICHAEL: And then the final one in
15 question, 3(c), deals with pertinent information, and
16 we have in our program costs and deliverables on page
17 eight to 11; we indicate the quality of the skilled
18 labor that we're using and other pertinent information.
19 So we were asking for a score of 83. Thank you.

20 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Public comment.

21 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: Question for the
22 applicant: Do you have some testimony as to why the
23 Division's graded you as a four in the third area, if,
24 in fact, you have all of the good fiscal accountability
25 records and completion records that you indicate?

393

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 DAVID MICHAEL: Yes, because we did not list out
2 the 100 applications that we put, we did not list
3 OR-2-T such and such, and then give them a spreadsheet
4 that they required. So it was interpretation of what
5 they were actually looking for.

6 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: All right. Thank you.

7 DON KLUSMAN: Don Klusman, California 4-Wheel
8 Drive Association. While I understand and totally
9 appreciate staff's hard work on these grants, there are
10 a couple of them that I can't go along with. This is
11 one of them. Last year before this Commission, this
12 forest had a grant, it received the highest score of
13 all grants. This year the grant is basically the same,
14 and yet it's down to 43. I understand that a few
15 things change, but not that dramatically. I understand
16 there were different eyes looking at things this year

17 than last year, but that shouldn't make a difference
18 when you're talking regulations and you're talking
19 grant history and so forth.

20 This forest has done an excellent job. Of any
21 time the Division, the Commission, even the users have
22 asked, what are you spending this money on, they are
23 glad to show you, and the accountability has been
24 there. Volunteer efforts on this forest, here again
25 the California 4-Wheel Drive Association has worked

394

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 with this forest not only on motorized projects, but
2 non-motorized projects. One of those grants that we
3 were talking about several years was for the wheelchair
4 trails just outside of Grass Valley. And we as
5 four-wheel drive enthusiasts and others worked on with
6 the forest. We've worked on equestrian trails in the
7 Tahoe Forest. This is not just a motorized issue on
8 the Tahoe. They've got equestrian trails,
9 non-motorized trails. The PCT trail goes through the
10 Tahoe Forest, which we've rerouted the OHV trail to
11 keep it away from the PCT. This forest has done
12 everything we have asked. I would totally agree. I
13 would say give them a 100 if it was up to me, but I
14 totally agree with what they're asking for on the 83 or
15 whatever it was that was just mentioned. Thank you.

16 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: So you'll come up with the
17 extra \$90,000, Don, out of your own pocket?

18 DON KLUSMAN: Out of volunteer labor we will.

19 DAVE PICKETT: Dave Pickett, District 36,

20 Motorcycle Sports Committee. I mirror the comments by
21 Mr. Klusman. Certain parts of the Tahoe extend way
22 down, so there's actual opportunity that's going on
23 right now in the forest because of this dry winter.
24 Did a tour up there recently, and there's some trail
25 work that needs to be done. The history is there, and
395

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 definitely ask for you to do a reconsideration based on
2 the information that has been supplied to you. Thank
3 you.

4 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Thank you.

5 OHMVR STAFF BELLUCCI: Excuse me, Larry
6 Bellucci, grants staff. I would like to address two
7 statements made a moment ago if I could.

8 Mr. Michael stated with regard to the history of
9 previous grants, previous applications that a
10 spreadsheet was required for this criteria. It was
11 never mentioned in the criteria. It was never
12 required, a spreadsheet was never asked for.

13 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Let's not get into a he said/
14 she said. That's enough of a clarification.

15 COMMISSIONER SPITLER: Let's address this, since
16 you're asking to respond. Because this issue has come
17 up in a number of the grants where I don't think it was
18 ever stated explicitly in the application instructions
19 or anywhere else in the regulations that to receive a
20 full score under past history, you need to actually
21 list specific grants and timelines and completions.
22 I'm noticing just about every application getting

23 knocked off in that category, even applicants that have
24 over decades of successful experience implementing
25 grants. That's the problem, right?

396

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 OHMVR STAFF BELLUCCI: You're correct, and I
2 believe that's one of the criteria that are being
3 worked on. As you know, it's kind of a progressive
4 thing that we're hoping to improve upon the criteria
5 each year. And it has been an issue with the number of
6 applicants; however I think where -- I can say with
7 regard to the applications that I've scored, that where
8 the applicants weren't specific and just made a general
9 statement that they have a good previous history,
10 that's where they lost points. We can't require any
11 specific number, but we did look for something
12 specific.

13 COMMISSIONER SPITLER: I don't want to get into
14 a long back and forth here. I'm just saying I think
15 there is some element of hide the ball going on where,
16 you know, the specific way that these grants were going
17 to be scored wasn't ever disclosed to the applicants up
18 front, and there was in fact specific things that the
19 staff was looking for that applicants could have
20 provided had they known that, and they simply didn't
21 know to include that information.

22 CHIEF JENKINS: Let me take that. It's the
23 difference between -- and we were very specific in the
24 manual and the process that we were looking for factual
25 data. You guys have heard us say factual data over and

397

1 over and over. So it basically comes down to the
2 difference of a conclusory statement versus a
3 factual statement. So when they say we've done real
4 well on our grants in the past, that's a conclusory
5 statement. We looking for more factual data.

6 COMMISSIONER SPITLER: I think everyone in the
7 room understands that at this point in the process.
8 That obviously wasn't clear to many applicants going
9 into the process.

10 OHMVR STAFF BELLUCCI: One other clarification I
11 would like to make, if I could. Mr. Klusman stated
12 that the application this year was essentially the same
13 as one last year. I don't know whether that's true or
14 not; however, we were scoring under a completely
15 different set of criteria this year.

16 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Thank you. Other questions,
17 comments from the Commissioners. Do I have a motion?

18 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: Well, I would move
19 approval by adding 26 points to the third criteria, I
20 guess, in equal increments, so it would be 10, 10, 10
21 would be my recommendation based on the evidence that
22 was provided that, A, there was completion within time
23 frames; B, that there was an adequate -- or successful
24 is a better word, history of fiscal accountability; and
25 the qualifications and availability of the staff to

398

1 carry out the project was sufficient. That's my
2 motion. I want to address the motion when appropriate.

3 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: So you've raised it to 30?

4 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: Yes, on the third criteria
5 3(a), (b), and (c), three subcriteria that you have to
6 assign each 10 points in order to raise it. So that's
7 what I would do.

8 COMMISSIONER SPITLER: And leave the other two
9 the same?

10 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: At this stage, unless
11 somebody has other ideas. The bulk of the evidence
12 that I focused in on and heard in the testimony was
13 related to three, but.

14 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Okay. So it's 30, number 3,
15 23 and 16.

16 VICE-CHAIR ANDERSON: I'll second that.

17 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: It would be 69, so that is
18 your motion, Commissioner Thomas?

19 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: That's my motion.

20 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Do we have a second?

21 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: Commissioner Anderson
22 seconded.

23 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: I have a motion and a second.

24 All those in favor?

25 (Commissioners simultaneously voted.)

399

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Opposed? Motion carries.

2 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: My thought is that we have
3 trouble in analyzing whether somebody has, in fact, a

4 successful history or not. One, quote, fact that you
5 can take across the table, is I have a successful
6 history and I have no prior violations on my record,
7 which is the kind of statements we're hearing. The
8 other sort of higher requirement that seems to be
9 imposed is, please detail all grants, prior grants, and
10 explain why you have a prior successful history. It
11 seems to me that it should be sufficient if somebody
12 stands in front of us and says I have an unblemished
13 record that that's a fact. It's unblemished. Now it
14 may be controverted. It may be not accurate, and
15 somebody can correct it if it's wrong, but that's a
16 fact we can make a decision based on. And it's that
17 fact that I relied on in trying to raise these scores.

18 And the reason I bring it up is that it's a bit
19 imprecise as to what we are being asked to justify,
20 what facts we're supposed to be relying upon to justify
21 a change. And as the staff goes through this iteration
22 the next year, perhaps they can be more specific about
23 what kinds of facts we need to be listening for so that
24 the applicants can come up and give us those facts
25 because.

400

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Commissioner Thomas, before
2 you go forward, I had deferred this discussion until
3 the afternoon tomorrow per Commissioner Anderson's
4 request to review these.

5 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: Thank you.

6 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: So we do have a special

7 request, that was number three, right? Do we have
8 another one to go through? It's the reconsideration of
9 the Sequoi a, correct.

10 OHMVR STAFF GLASPIE: That was the final, unless
11 you want to reconsider the Sequoi a.

12 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: So I have to defer to my
13 fellow Commi ssi oners. The Sequoi a representative
14 wasn't clearly aware that he needed to pull his item
15 off of the Consent, according to Deputy Di rector
16 Greene, and wondered if we wanted to reconsider that
17 one item on Consent to bring it back for review.

18 DEPUTY DIR. GREENE: Chai rman Bri ssenden, if I
19 may. I was just approached during the lunch hour by
20 the individual from the Sequoi a, who was not the
21 individual who wrote the appli cation, who was what
22 seems to appear to be a brand new recruit and who's
23 never been to one of these meetings before and was not
24 sure of the process. So you are correct. I simply
25 said to him that it might be the appropriate thing to

401

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 do is go to the Commission, but I just wanted to make
2 sure that you know that this representative here today
3 is brand new.

4 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: So I heard one sorry, two
5 sorries. I'm not certain. Tim, help me here? I'm not
6 sure what you need for reconsideration.

7 COUNSEL LaFRANCHI: I think all you need is a
8 motion by almost any of the Commi ssi oners who voted on
9 the winning side and then a second, and it could then

10 be in a majority to bring it back.

11 VICE-CHAIR ANDERSON: We're talking about 98,
12 right?

13 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Yes, we are.

14 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: Here is my thinking, this
15 is somebody that was rated at 16 points, which is a
16 very low rating. Their ability to master the process
17 is evident by their failure to even object to being
18 passed on Consent. Based on both the application and
19 the familiarity with the process, one would question
20 what the implementation would look like. So I'm not
21 interested in reconsidering it on those thoughts.

22 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Other thoughts?

23 COMMISSIONER PRIZMICH: I understand that, but
24 if I heard Deputy Director Greene, this was a new group
25 that was making the effort, and I really don't see any
402

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 downside to hearing them out and voting whatever way
2 we're going to vote. So if you need a motion, I'll
3 make that motion to take it off Consent and have us
4 hear it.

5 VICE-CHAIR ANDERSON: I'll second that. I don't
6 mind hearing them again.

7 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Under discussion.

8 COMMISSIONER SPITLER: My only concern is I just
9 think it's bad form to -- after we've already approved
10 a grant to start taking out individual grants and
11 taking them off a list we've already approved and go
12 back and revisit those. I think it sets a very bad

13 example and really says to anyone if you've got
14 approved on Consent and don't like it, you can come
15 back at any time during the meeting ask the Commission
16 to reconsider. I mean I think after we hear a grant,
17 we've decided on it, we voted on it, the public had an
18 opportunity to comment, I think we should move forward.
19 We've have a lot of people here who are waiting to have
20 their grants heard. I just don't think it's right to
21 revote on things that we've already considered.

22 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Okay. So we have a motion
23 and a second on the floor. Any other discussion? All
24 those in favor?

25 (Commissioners simultaneously voted.)

403

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Those opposed?

2 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: No.

3 COMMISSIONER SPITLER: No.

4 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: No. Fails.

5 I have had a request to look for consideration
6 of several different staff that have to go back to
7 their various respective agencies to look at -- and I
8 want to throw this out for discussion to look at
9 planning and safety. I'm hearing an huh-uh over here.
10 So to take it out of order would require some
11 rejiggering. So do you want say that a little louder?

12 COMMISSIONER SPITLER: I think we should take it
13 from the top at this point. We took trail maintenance
14 out of order because there's a lot of people interested
15 in trail maintenance. I think we should just start

16 with the top and go through the list as best we can.

17 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: So that would be Item No. 1,
18 OR-1-NO-68. Do we have staff available and ready to
19 start the parade?

20 OHMVR STAFF BELLUCCI: OR-1-NO-68, BLM Redding,
21 is an Acquisition project. They asked \$537,300;
22 received a score of 43 for 40 percent funding, for
23 \$214,920. And I would like to state for the record
24 that in their supplemental application or their
25 resubmittal, it did state in at least two separate

404

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 places that the information they're providing was not
2 provided in the original application, and the
3 supplemental information was still somewhat vague and
4 ambiguous and may possibly may not merit more points.

5 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: That was rather diplomatic
6 for some guy that's not even working here anymore.

7 OHMVR STAFF BELLUCCI: I was told to be.

8 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Told to be diplomatic.

9 SKY ZAFFARANO: All right. Then my name is Sky
10 Zaffarano. I'm with the Redding BLM Field Office. We
11 have submitted a score increase rationale for an
12 increase from 43 to 64 overall points. I believe you
13 have that. To briefly go through that, it includes --
14 do you have that one?

15 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: We may not have that one.

16 OHMVR STAFF STALLCOP: Yes, you do.

17 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: Go ahead, I've got it.

18 SKY ZAFFARANO: It includes a description under
Page 130

19 each evaluation criteria for slight increases to the
20 score that was given by the Division. I'll just go
21 through each of those scores, and if there are any
22 questions specifically to the criteria, we can discuss
23 why.

24 But under evaluation criteria one, it would be
25 an increase from 22 to 25. Under two, it would be an
405

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 increase from five to eight. Under three, it would be
2 an increase from eight to ten. And under four, an
3 increase from four to nine, for the overall increase of
4 64 out of a hundred.

5 I'd just like to take a little bit of my
6 remaining time to give you the overall picture here.
7 You know, the Redding area is a growing area like many
8 throughout California. And many of the people
9 moving into this area are looking for this kind of
10 outdoor recreation opportunity in their backyard. And
11 the Redding BLM, in an effort to meet that desired
12 recreation opportunity, over the course of the last 16
13 years has acquired approximately 14.5 thousand acres
14 within the designated off-highway vehicle area to
15 provide a managed OHV opportunity. Most recently we've
16 used two separate acquisition grants funded through
17 this Commission, OHV funds to acquire 400 acres over
18 the course of the last three years, all of which have
19 either existing OHV opportunity or are optimal for
20 building new opportunity or expanding the area.

21 We're also looking at other ways to secure

22 long-term opportunities in this area. We're currently
23 working with a private landowner on a donated easement
24 on a critical road in the area. And the bottom line is
25 we'd like to continue the success we've been able to

406

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 have out there, and the key part of that is the funds
2 provided through these acquisition grants. And we do
3 have interested sellers at this time, and we continue
4 to have interest in this area. Thank you.

5 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Thank you. Public comment.

6 BRUCE BRAZIL: Bruce Brazil, California Enduro
7 Riders Association. And in the past, I've supported
8 the purchases requested by the Redding BLM. But let me
9 start by saying that this should not be funded by the
10 OHV grant process, because they've got state money that
11 would be used to purchase land for ownership by the
12 federal government, so our state really doesn't get
13 that much out of that part of it. The OHV program has
14 already funded several years of property purchases, and
15 it looks like the Redding BLM will be requesting
16 funding for additional property purchases.

17 However, if we get creative, it can be done in a
18 win/win situation. I'd like to suggest that the OHV
19 Division, with Consent from the Commission, purchase
20 the properties through major capital outlays, and then
21 give the BLM a five-year lease with option to purchase
22 the properties. The BLM would be responsible for the
23 properties. The BLM presently holds 15 million acres
24 of land in California. Somewhere in those holdings,

25 there should be some property that would be appropriate
407

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 for state vehicle recreation area.

2 Now, if that property could be traded for the
3 leased properties in the Chappie Shasta OHV area, I
4 think it would be a great idea. Other properties in
5 the Chappie Shasta OHV area have been acquired through
6 exchanges according to their grants request. A partial
7 precedence on this is the California Code of
8 Regulations 4970.57 which describes equipment process
9 for our OHV program. In there it says any single
10 equipment purchase that has a total cost equal to or
11 greater than \$50,000, with at least half of the
12 purchase cost paid by the OHV Trust fund shall be
13 registered in the Division's name and used in the
14 grantees OHV program through the normal life of the
15 equipment and then returned to the discretion of the
16 Division for disposal or sale; therefore, it would seem
17 very reasonable to extend that general concept to
18 acquisitions. I think it could be a win/win, just got
19 to start thinking outside of the box on some of these
20 things, folks. Thank you.

21 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Thank you.

22 COMMISSIONER SPITLER: I had a question
23 actually. Do you have opposition to using state funds
24 to provide OHV opportunities on federal lands?

25 BRUCE BRAZIL: No, I don't. It's the purchase
408

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax
Page 133

1 of the property and then the state not owning the
2 property anymore. I think this could be a good way for
3 the state to acquire OHV properties from the federal
4 government on an exchange basis.

5 COMMISSIONER SPITLER: So you just have a
6 philosophical opposition to buying lands with state tax
7 dollars and handing it over to the state government?

8 BRUCE BRAZIL: That is correct.

9 COMMISSIONER SPITLER: Why is that?

10 BRUCE BRAZIL: The federal government takes
11 plenty of my tax money. They can pay for it.

12 COMMISSIONER SPITLER: Okay. Thanks.

13 SYLVIA MILLIGAN: I'm Sylvia Milligan with
14 Recreation Outdoors Coalition. And I'm also a party
15 that does not believe in buying private lands and
16 putting it in government hands and taking it off the
17 tax rolls because I do pay taxes; however, we have an
18 entirely different situation here. I know that most of
19 your interest is in the southern part of the state
20 where we have many more things going on; however, we
21 have a unique situation here. And I brought a map to
22 show those of you that have not been up there what our
23 situation is here.

24 This is the Chappie OHV area. The white areas
25 are privately owned lands. We have been trying to

409

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 acquire those to keep a continuous area here for

2 recreation. And if we don't have funds available to
3 acquire those when they become available, we can
4 actually get a gridlock like we had on 9/11. We can
5 have a buyer come in and say, you know, I don't like
6 OHV and shut it down. And that could be a major artery
7 through this area.

8 So they need to have funds available so that
9 when we have an opportunity to get these pieces, these
10 parcels that help complement and complete this OHV
11 area, we need to have those funds available because
12 people are not going to say, well, my property is for
13 sale today, and it's tomorrow after guys have said no
14 money, and they have to wait a year, maybe two years.
15 It doesn't happen. We need to be ready to move on
16 these pieces of land. And you know that we can get
17 them much cheaper also if we can be ready move, have
18 the cash money available. So I hope you look really
19 closely and provide funds for us to complete this
20 incredible opportunity we have here.

21 DON KLUSMAN: Don Klusman, California 4-Wheel
22 Drive Association. I've been involved in this project
23 since the inception of it. At the time all of us, the
24 environmental community, the motorized community, the
25 Commission, the Division, BLM and several others, water
410

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 agencies and so forth, agreed that the Inner Lakes
2 plan, which is part of this plan, was the best thing
3 for the area. And, true, there are some parcels that
4 are privately owned, and these only are being sold by

5 willing sellers. And we need the funds to help get
6 these properties. Here again, I know I'll probably be
7 chastised by the Division again, but this is very
8 similar, if not the same, application that was put in
9 last year for acquisition. At that time it got 97
10 points. This time it gets 43. Maybe the criteria did
11 change that much. I don't quite understand that, but
12 this is the only acquisition grant in this whole grants
13 process. This is the only time we're going to make it
14 legal to ride on this area by putting it in ownership
15 of the federal government with help from state money to
16 make this a bona fide OHV area that it already has been
17 signed off as. I don't understand what Mr. Brazil's
18 question is here other than philosophy that he doesn't
19 want to spend state money for federal dollars or
20 whatever. But this is a very much needed project, and
21 I would ask you that you reconsider the scoring. Thank
22 you.

23 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Thank you.

24 DAVE PICKETT: Dave Pickett, District 36,
25 Motorcycle Sports Committee. I mirror the comments of
411

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 Don and Sylvia there, and I concur with the score
2 request increase to 64 that Sky had talked about. This
3 is an expansion of opportunity in a fast growth area.
4 The next riding opportunity that's close is going to be
5 Stony Ford and Clay Pit, Oroville, places like that,
6 but it does not have the unique characteristics that
7 this particular riding area does.

8 We've got an opportunity to pick something up
9 that will expand the program and pretty much brings it
10 back to the intent of the program, which is to provide
11 opportunity to meet the growth. I don't have to sit
12 here and tell you how much this sport has grown in the
13 last five, ten years, but we've got an opportunity to
14 buy here. We've got a willing partner that can manage
15 it, has a history of managing it correctly. And it
16 seems to me we have not had a new facility in, what, 25
17 years, and here's an opportunity to expand one that's
18 got a long history. I urge you support this
19 acquisition. Thank you.

20 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Thank you. Commissioners.

21 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: The question to the riding
22 community, has there been any effort to -- maybe Don
23 Klusman can answer this. Has there been any effort to
24 have the Governor's budget include acquisition for this
25 piece of property? We've seen these checkerboard

412

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 acquisitions for as long as I've been on the
2 Commission, and it seems like we just approved in
3 record time an acquisition of a very large area in
4 Bakersfield, which we now are informed we will not
5 acquire, but if we can acquire an entire Bakersfield
6 facility and disencumber, why can't we just put it in
7 the budget?

8 DON KLUSMAN: Don Klusman. That's a very good
9 question, Mr. Thomas. That question you asked of us
10 several years ago, and we went and spoke with finance,

11 spoke with the Governor's office at that time, and was
12 told because these are separate little parcels, that
13 they're not a large area, such as what you're talking
14 in Bakersfield or new SVRA area, that would be very
15 difficult for finance to write this up as you're going
16 to buy this particular parcel when that parcel may not
17 be on the market yet. And we ran into -- we ran into
18 bureaucracy, to be honest. We were told don't waste
19 your time spinning your wheels here.

20 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: That's the answer. WCB
21 buys scraps of land all over California on a continuing
22 basis. It doesn't seem too complicated. That would be
23 the Wild Conservation Board, which is the home of a lot
24 of the resource agency acquisition programs.

25 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Other comments? Do I have a
413

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 motion?

2 COMMISSIONER SPITLER: I think it's an important
3 project. I supported it in the past, and I'm moved by
4 the testimony here, so I'm not sure I can go all the
5 way to the score the BLM suggested, but I'll move a
6 score of 25 out of 40 on the first criteria based on
7 the information that I'm looking at here from the BLM;
8 eight out of 15 on the second criteria, also based on
9 that information; 10 out of 15 on the third; four out
10 of 15 on the fourth; and I'll support 12 out of 15 on
11 the last criteria for a score of 64, and that's my
12 motion.

13 OHMVR STAFF BELLUCCI: Excuse me, I think there

14 may be a mistake. I don't think that's a 64.
15 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: I saw 57. I saw 14 go up.
16 COMMISSIONER SPITLER: 25, eight, ten, nine and
17 12.
18 COMMISSIONER PRIZMICH: Missed the nine.
19 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Okay. For 64.
20 COMMISSIONER SPITLER: That's my motion.
21 COMMISSIONER McMILLIN: Second.
22 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: It's been moved and seconded.
23 All those in favor?
24 (Commissioners simultaneously voted.)
25 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Opposed? Motion carries.

414

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 OHMVR STAFF BELLUCCI: Next project is line
2 number nine, OR-816, California City Police
3 Department -- and the rest of these are equipment
4 grants, by the way, that I'm going to be addressing.
5 They requested \$62,544, received a score of 38 for zero
6 percent funding.
7 ERIC HURTADO: Eric Hurtado, California City
8 Police and Jack Craig, California City Police also here
9 with me.
10 We previously submitted information packets
11 clarifying the additional scoring criteria. I believe
12 the additional information made it more clear than the
13 original grant that was submitted, hopefully you'll
14 take that into consideration in the rescore.
15 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: Where is that information?
16 We're looking for that.

17 ERIC HURTADO: I think that was in volume three.

18 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: The new information?

19 You're saying additional information that was outside
20 the original application.

21 ERIC HURTADO: Right, it would have been, I
22 believe, earmarked tab three.

23 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: One of the tabbed items.
24 It's very complicated here for us.

25 OHMVR STAFF ROACH: Commissioner, if I may, it's
415

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 in your supplemental information binder in equipment
2 tab number two.

3 ERIC HURTADO: I'll just give a quick overview
4 of the grant. California City's become a high-use
5 area, where before we've experienced maybe 65,000
6 visitors a year, now we're experiencing over 300,000.
7 We're a small agency, usually just field two or three
8 patrol officers. And with your visitors making the
9 city sometimes swell up to ten times the original
10 population over three or four days, it does get a
11 little trying. Our grant is for equipment. Right now
12 we don't have adequate equipment to respond to
13 emergency calls for service. We're using existing
14 street patrol cars, and also the personnel and
15 volunteers are using their own vehicles to respond to
16 some of these areas.

17 Going over the criteria, we're requesting a
18 rescore for item one of 30 to 40. California City has
19 hosted off-highway vehicle events for the last 30

20 years, and we continue to do so. Our law enforcement
21 has looked into areas to be more efficient. We've
22 expanded our volunteer program. Many of our volunteers
23 are now becoming reserve police officers and helping
24 with law enforcement and our rescue operations in the
25 desert.

416

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 In criteria number two, request a rescore of 18.
2 Again, we have personnel that are using their own
3 equipment responding to the emergencies, and we feel
4 that this is efficient use. If we were able to attract
5 more personnel, more volunteers by not having them use
6 their own vehicle, not use their own fuel, we feel we
7 can expand the program and be more efficient in the
8 long run, but we need to reach that first step of
9 having some type of basic equipment there so we can
10 draw and make it more appealing for volunteers to come
11 in. We do have a small volunteer group of about 15.
12 With the growing amount of population, we just need
13 more. Thank you.

14 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Thank you. Public comments?
15 Do you have questions for the applicant?

16 OHMVR STAFF BELLUCCI: Chair Brissenden, I was
17 remiss in not bringing something to your attention that
18 I think is important. There are at least three
19 instances in the supplemental information provided by
20 the applicant that referenced information that was
21 included in their law enforcement application, not this
22 equipment application.

23 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: What is the impact of
24 that?

25 OHMVR STAFF BELLUCCI: The impact is that

417

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 they're looking for credit and subsequent points for
2 information that had nothing to do with this
3 application, rather than -- they're two separate
4 applications.

5 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: Are you saying that the
6 information was not relevant to this application
7 because it was located somewhere else, or it wasn't
8 accepted because it wasn't relevant?

9 OHMVR STAFF BELLUCCI: I'm not saying it was not
10 relevant to this application because it was a separate
11 application altogether, it was scored separate from
12 this one.

13 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: Did it answer the question
14 that was posed to it by your criteria?

15 OHMVR STAFF BELLUCCI: I believe it did, yes.

16 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: So the defect was it was
17 located in the wrong spot?

18 OHMVR STAFF BELLUCCI: Yes.

19 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: The content of the
20 information was relevant, it was just found in the
21 wrong spot?

22 OHMVR STAFF BELLUCCI: Correct. Excuse me, it
23 was not that it was found in the wrong place. It was
24 that it was placed in the wrong spot.

25 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: Placed in the wrong spot.

418

1 Thank you. I got it. I understand.

2 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Commissioner Pri zmi ch, you
3 have a question for the applicant?

4 COMMISSIONER PRI ZMI CH: On criteria number two,
5 you mentioned that you had 15 volunteers. Could you
6 describe what those volunteers do and what their
7 functions are for us, please?

8 ERIC HURTADO: Yes, we have evolved from
9 initially all civilian volunteers doing non-enforcement
10 status to -- we completed training with four of them
11 and they're now part-time reserve officers, and we're
12 hoping with expanding the program to get more of the
13 civilian volunteers over into a reserve program to help
14 the law enforcement officers.

15 COMMISSIONER PRI ZMI CH: So originally you had 15
16 volunteers, and out of all of those that were there for
17 eyes and ears, I assume, for the regulars that were at
18 the site; is that accurate?

19 ERIC HURTADO: Correct.

20 COMMISSIONER PRI ZMI CH: And you've transformed
21 those guys at your own cost to -- four of them are
22 reserves, which are actually eyes and ears for you
23 guys, as well, in addition to those volunteers?

24 ERIC HURTADO: Right, and they have peace
25 officers powers.

419

1 COMMISSIONER PRIZMICH: Now, I understand those
2 volunteers augment the law enforcement officers that
3 you have out there dealing with this situation?

4 ERIC HURTADO: Yes.

5 COMMISSIONER PRIZMICH: Is that a weekly basis
6 or how often are they utilized?

7 ERIC HURTADO: They're utilized a lot. They're
8 from Labor Day until Memorial Day. If there isn't a
9 set of volunteers out on the weekend, that's a rarity.
10 They'll spend 24 hours a day for three- or four-day
11 holiday weekend responding.

12 COMMISSIONER PRIZMICH: This is all free of
13 charge to you and to the OHV Division and to the people
14 out there, correct?

15 ERIC HURTADO: Correct.

16 COMMISSIONER PRIZMICH: And what kind of
17 equipment do they utilize at this point? I mean how is
18 it that they are assisting you, and how is it that
19 you're enforcing the laws out there again? You briefly
20 touched on it, but I would like you to expand on it a
21 little bit more.

22 ERIC HURTADO: We responded to about 800 calls
23 last year. I have really two four-wheel drive units.
24 One is a 1980 something Dodge truck, and one's on loan
25 from Kia we have to return. It's on a test program.

420

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 They're responding in their own personal vehicles to
2 emergency calls because our patrol cars won't make it
3 to some of these trails.

4 COMMISSIONER PRIZMICH: What kind of vehicles
5 are you --

6 ERIC HURTADO: Motorcycle, quads, and their own
7 four-wheel drives.

8 COMMISSIONER PRIZMICH: Okay. So your
9 antiquated four-wheel drives are attempting to overtake
10 motorcycles, quads, and other four-wheel drives that
11 are set up for off-road, right?

12 ERIC HURTADO: We're trying to do just the basic
13 of just saving lives right now and getting to the
14 scenes of some of these calls. And in between we'll do
15 enforcement contacts, arrests. We're overwhelmed right
16 now.

17 COMMISSIONER PRIZMICH: Okay. I think based on
18 that information that we could easily move -- or at
19 least I would make a recommendation we can move
20 criteria number two from 20 to 18 based on information
21 we just heard here.

22 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: 20 to 18, you're suggesting
23 item?

24 COMMISSIONER McMILLIN: Five to 18.

25 COMMISSIONER PRIZMICH: Five to 18, I'm sorry, 421

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 the total score would be 20. I would like to move that
2 to 18.

3 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: Item two had a possible of
4 20. Staff gave it a five, and you're saying 18?

5 COMMISSIONER PRIZMICH: Correct. Could you move
6 that back up to number one there, still looking.

7 So right now your operational costs are being
8 covered by two older pieces of equipment that the city
9 has, that are owned by the city?

10 ERIC HURTADO: One that is owned by the city,
11 one is that on a test program that we're going to have
12 to return soon.

13 COMMISSIONER PRIZMICH: You basically have one
14 piece of equipment that you're trying to deal with
15 this? The rest are provided by volunteers?

16 ERIC HURTADO: Right. We did receive four quads
17 from the County of Kern I think about four years ago,
18 but when you're on the average --

19 COMMISSIONER PRIZMICH: Of course, they gave you
20 brand new quads, correct?

21 ERIC HURTADO: Yes. But when your average
22 response is about 100 to 150 miles a day, riding on the
23 quad gets a little tiring. Some of the inclement
24 weather isn't very pleasing right now to our
25 volunteers.

422

 SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 COMMISSIONER PRIZMICH: I'd like to, just based
2 on that testimony, increase the Division's score by
3 four more points to make that 20 Commission score. And
4 I'd also like to increase Item No. 3 based on the
5 testimony we've had thus far to 15. And I'd like to
6 give the final score an additional three points based
7 on the volunteers and the effort that they're putting
8 out of such a small department. I think they're making
9 a great effort. I'm not sure what that adds up to.

10 OHMVR STAFF FREITAS: 58.

11 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: I was looking at the prior
12 history section, we're shifting criteria now. Prior
13 history is in what category?

14 OHMVR STAFF BELLUCCI: Excuse me, I believe that
15 score is wrong, also. I believe that would be a 63.

16 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: I was just adding it up,
17 63.

18 OHMVR STAFF FREITAS: 18 for the criteria, I
19 heard 13. You're correct.

20 COMMISSIONER PRIZMICH: I would like to make
21 that motion.

22 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: Second.

23 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: It's been moved and seconded.
24 Under discussion?

25 VICE-CHAIR ANDERSON: I just have a question. 423

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 The information that you provided in the supplementary
2 material, I was particularly struck with the mention of
3 being able to buy used equipment.

4 ERIC HURTADO: Correct.

5 VICE-CHAIR ANDERSON: Have you had any real time
6 success with that?

7 ERIC HURTADO: No, we felt that if we would try
8 to get used federal four-wheel drive vehicles, better
9 chance of making them last rather than buying a used --
10 I'm sorry, a new vehicle for desert patrol. We feel if
11 we buy a used vehicle that only has three years on one
12 of their programs, that they'll sell to other law

13 enforcement agencies, make the vehicles last at least
14 five years.

15 VICE-CHAIR ANDERSON: Okay. Thank you.

16 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: So it's been moved and
17 seconded. Under discussion? Any comments?

18 Just one advisory, and that is that just
19 guesstimating, we've stolen about two or \$300,000 from
20 other grants, so those numbers are going to be floating
21 here. I presume since we haven't taken any away from
22 any grants yet, so just be...

23 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: Not relevant. It's that
24 competitive process that gets you every time.

25 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: I know, but there's some

424

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 people out there thinking they might have gotten away
2 with something. That won't be after the end of the
3 day.

4 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: Equity is moving and
5 shifting in this business.

6 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Okay. Just a little yellow
7 flag. All those in favor?

8 (Commissioners simultaneously voted.)

9 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Opposed? Aye.

10 The motion carries.

11 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: Mr. Chairman, may I ask
12 the staff -- I pulled the application out looking for
13 that law enforcement material that was miscategorized
14 in the wrong category. Could you tell me what page the
15 absent material was, so I can see what you were

16 referring to?

17 OHMVR STAFF BELLUCCI: On the supplemental
18 application, the supplemental information I don't have
19 any page numbers.

20 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: It was in the original.

21 OHMVR STAFF BELLUCCI: It was in both, I
22 believe. They recited some information that was
23 provided originally; however, we looked back and found
24 that it was, in fact, in their LE application, and I
25 apologize, but I don't have reference to the page

425

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 numbers. I can get that for you.

2 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: It may be 126 of 312, that
3 shows all of the various hours. I'm wondering if
4 that's what you're referring to the same data was used
5 in two applications and, therefore, it's disqualified?

6 OHMVR STAFF BELLUCCI: I don't recall. At the
7 time I wrote my notes, I don't believe that was the
8 case; however, I would have to go back and look at the
9 application to clarify that. I'd be happy to do that
10 for you.

11 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: It would be appreciated,
12 so that we can understand why you analyze things the
13 way you do, and it's not intended as a critique. It's
14 really to help understand.

15 OHMVR STAFF BELLUCCI: Sure, I'll be glad to do
16 that.

17 Next application is line 16, OR-2 Mendocino
18 National Park requested \$62,750; received a score of 79
Page 149

19 for 78 percent funding or \$48,125. And I need to draw
20 to your attention that under supplemental application,
21 the revised scores add up to 91, rather than 86 that
22 they wrote down.

23 MIKE BURMANN: Good afternoon, Commissioners,
24 Mike Burmann, Mendocino National Forest. For this
25 particular grant, we originally scored 79 out of a 100,
426

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 and we're requesting that you consider raising that
2 score to 84 out of a 100. The justification for that
3 would be criteria 3(c). We would like to have two
4 points increased in that criteria based on the fact
5 that this new piece of equipment will enable the
6 district to meet our commitment to complete all of the
7 restoration projects that you have so graciously funded
8 us in the past two grant cycles, in addition to meeting
9 the current state law standards that we have to
10 maintain for our designated trail systems.

11 For criteria 3(d) we are requesting that you up
12 the score on that one by one point based on the fact
13 that we had an unusual wet winter last year on the west
14 side of the forest, and this contributed significantly
15 to accelerated soil erosion on many of our motorized
16 trails, in addition to our maintenance level two roads.

17 And for criteria number four, and this is some
18 new information, we are requesting that you up the
19 score by two points because, as I speak right now, our
20 primary equipment operator for this piece of equipment
21 that we're asking for, is currently getting certified

22 by Cam Lockwood of Trails Unlimited down in Gorman at
23 Hungry Valley. He's a Forest Service Enterprise Team
24 entrepreneur who has been acknowledged by many people
25 as an expert in the development, operation, maintenance
427

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 of Sweco trail tractors. Any questions? Thank you.

2 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Public comments?

3 BRENT SCHORADT: Brent Schoradt, with the
4 California Wilderness Coalition. We would like to
5 express our support for this grant, and again reiterate
6 the equipment for this grant, the Sweco equipment, is
7 really going to help implement some of the restoration
8 projects that were funded both earlier today and in the
9 meeting back in December. So these folk are doing
10 excellent work. They're really the poster child for
11 successful restoration work in our national forests.
12 And I think investing in the proper equipment for them
13 to do their own work more effectively and more
14 specifically is really worth our investment, so thanks.

15 DON AMADOR: Don Amador, Blue Ribbon Coalition,
16 would like to agree with the statements from the
17 California Wilderness Coalition with regard to the need
18 for at least one additional point on this grant. Thank
19 you.

20 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Commissioners?

21 VICE-CHAIR ANDERSON: I have a question. I'm
22 not quite sure how to address it, maybe Ms. Mick. My
23 question has to do with do you have any sense of how
24 many of these tractors are available for the various

25 forests throughout the state.

428

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 KATHLEEN MICK: Kathleen Mick, U.S. Forest
2 Service. No, I do not. I could probably get you
3 something pretty quickly.

4 VICE-CHAIR ANDERSON: Two, eight, 20?

5 KATHLEEN MICK: I think at least half the
6 forests that have OHV programs have Swecos. The
7 Sequoia doesn't use a Sweco, they use a mini excavator,
8 but I know the LP has one, the Mendocino, the Tahoe, I
9 believe the Angeles, San Bernardino. I don't think the
10 Cleveland has one. The Eldorado has one. So probably
11 of the 19 national forests, maybe half of them have
12 Swecos.

13 VICE-CHAIR ANDERSON: I'm trying to address
14 need, relative need. Would it be your goal to have one
15 on each forest or will each forest accept there is
16 other equipment to use.

17 KATHLEEN MICK: If there is a trained operator,
18 and the operator has one, been through Cam Lockwood's
19 beginning and advanced operator training, and then
20 thirdly is following our regional Sweco guidelines that
21 were produced a few years ago by Roger Poff, who is a
22 soil scientist. Then our ultimate goal would be to
23 have one on every district that has a major OHV
24 program, for sure on every forest.

25 And the reason I say that is because I used to
429

1 work on the Mendocino, and we used to have one. And
2 the window for opportunity -- you think you can just
3 run those things all over the place and do good work,
4 and it just doesn't work that way. The soil and the
5 moisture has to be just right to do proper work. So
6 when you get into that moisture window, if one person
7 has the tractor, but you need it, you've got to wait,
8 and then you're in a position where you might actually
9 be pushing soil when it's a little bit too dry, you
10 don't get proper compaction, and you're actually doing
11 more harm than good.

12 VICE-CHAIR ANDERSON: Okay. I understand. So
13 down the road, we're expecting more applications for
14 Swecos.

15 KATHLEEN MICK: No, I wouldn't expect that
16 because a lot of forests, for instance the Cleveland
17 and others, take advantage of Cam Lockwood, who is an
18 enterprise team, and he contracts his services out.
19 And so we do the best that we can to keep him in
20 California. He's highly popular around the whole
21 United States, and not just for Forest Service but for
22 other agencies, as well. He's done work in Alaska, all
23 over the country, and he's known for his trail building
24 techniques. As a matter of fact, I think he either is
25 or may be or has finished doing work for the state at

430

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 Carnegie. He's done work at other SVRAs. He's trained

2 the Division staff in maintenance.

3 VICE-CHAIR ANDERSON: So what percentage in the
4 future would you expect you might contract work and for
5 what extent would you get your own equipment?

6 KATHLEEN MICK: To some extent, it's up to the
7 forest. And I know the reason the Mendocino is asking
8 for a tractor is because theirs is quite old, it's out
9 of date, if that's what they're asking for, and it's
10 time for replacement. And so there's the replacement
11 factor of those that have them to keep them in good
12 working order, and then I wouldn't anticipate anybody
13 asking for a new one that maybe doesn't have because we
14 are trying to contract, to the best of our ability,
15 because sometimes we don't actually have the people to
16 do the work that are properly trained. So we're trying
17 to mix and match. I know that's not your perfect
18 answer you're looking for, but that's what we're doing.

19 VICE-CHAIR ANDERSON: No, I'm trying to find out
20 what you're doing.

21 KATHLEEN MICK: Okay.

22 VICE-CHAIR ANDERSON: Thank you.

23 KATHLEEN MICK: You're welcome.

24 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: The pleasure?

25 COMMISSIONER SPITLER: I think this is a real

431

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 good application, and I think it does have some holes
2 in it, unfortunately. I think 79 is a good score, so
3 I'll move the staff recommendation.

4 COMMISSIONER McMILLIN: Second.

5 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Moved and seconded. All
6 those in favor?

7 (Commissioners simultaneously voted.)

8 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Opposed? Motion carries.
9 Next, Larry.

10 OHMVR STAFF BELLUCCI: Chair Brissenden, I think
11 I found the information that Commissioner Thomas is
12 looking for regarding California City.

13 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: We are going to take a break
14 in about 15 minutes. If you don't mind, you can share
15 it with him then.

16 OHMVR STAFF BELLUCCI: Okay.

17 The next grant we'll be taking up is line 23,
18 OR-795, San Bernardino County Sheriff, Victor Valley
19 requested \$165,741; received a score of 52 for 50
20 percent funding.

21 COMMISSIONER SPITLER: Excuse me, I think you
22 might have missed one, OR-1-CD-373 Palm Springs.

23 OHMVR STAFF BELLUCCI: Excuse me, line 18,
24 OR-1-CD-373, BLM Palm Springs, South Coast Field Office
25 requested \$37,380; received a score of 57 for 50

432

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 percent funding for \$18,690.

2 MONA DANIELS: We were not going to address
3 this. We accepted this one, as you figured.

4 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: It's showing as being off of
5 Consent, so the pleasure of the Commission.

6 COMMISSIONER SPITLER: It's off Consent, so we
7 have to hear it. It is off Consent.

8 CHAIR BRISSSENDEN: But if you don't want to say
9 anything, we'll move right along.

10 COMMISSIONER SPITLER: If you're fine with the
11 staff's recommendation -- I was prepared to increase
12 it, but if you're fine with the staff recommendation.

13 MONA DANIELS: No, definitely. This is our NICO
14 routes. We had NICO designation in 2002, and we are
15 right now on the verge of implementing all of our
16 signing from the northeastern corner of Riverside
17 county where the Palm Springs BLM office ends, coming
18 down to the Riverside Big Marias and on over toward the
19 Mecacopia Special Recreation Area. These are a
20 necessity. Both the staff that's hooked to this as
21 well as the equipment, the carsonites, the sticky
22 labels, the interpretive signing that would be involved
23 on this grant is vital to addressing. We're now
24 getting heavily hit with OHV out along the Colorado
25 corridor area. So not only would this help benefit our
433

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 office, but probably also the Yuma Field Office
2 corridor sections, as well as maybe even underlying
3 areas of effect coming in from Needles. Mona Daniels,
4 Palm Springs.

5 CHAIR BRISSSENDEN: Any public comment?

6 JOHN STEWART: John Stewart, California
7 Association of 4-Wheel Drives and United 4-Wheel Drive
8 Associations. Yes, we concur with the Palm Springs
9 Field Office that this is a very important item and
10 something that needs to be done. Palm Springs has made

11 a tremendous effort to work with the various user
 12 groups out there. They've been able to, you know,
 13 create several Adopt a Trails. So their partnership
 14 building with the users in that area has been a
 15 pleasure to work with them. The clubs like the area,
 16 and the one thing is is this area is growing for
 17 recreational opportunities, where people are going
 18 there to seek recreational opportunity. And having the
 19 proper signage on the ground is extremely important in
 20 order to protect the several wilderness areas that are
 21 within the Palm Springs Field Office. So we support an
 22 increase in the scores in order to bring it up to a
 23 point where, yes, they need the equipment, they need
 24 it, and it is critical in order to move ahead to
 25 protect the resources. Thank you.

434

SCRI BE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
 916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Thank you. Commi ssi oners?

2 COMMI SSIONER PRI ZMI CH: I'll move staff
3 recommendati ons.

4 COMMI SSIONER McMI LLIN: Second.

5 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: It's been moved and seconded
6 for staff recommendati on. Under di scussi on?

7 COMMI SSIONER SPITLER: I think this warrants an
8 i ncreased score. I can either do it as an amendment or
9 you can amend the moti on after you hear what my
10 recommendati on is.

11 I don't understand why this grant scored so low
12 in the first category. It was scored a 17 out of 40
13 regarding the ability to cover operational costs, which

14 the Division staff analysis says specifically they can
15 cover the operational costs. And ability to provide
16 staffing without reliance on OHV funds, they say
17 they're going to provide a full-time BLM employee Sweco
18 tractor operator. So based on that, I guess I have a
19 hard time understanding why that scored so low. Maybe
20 the applicant, you can address.

21 MONA DANIELS: Well, I know the Sweco tractor is
22 connected to one of the other projects inside the grant
23 program for this year, and so both the tractor
24 equipment and the trails program were all tied
25 together. We unfortunately scored, we feel, too low on
435

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 the trail maintenance project, and so right now this
2 was, I think, maybe the three of them tied together is
3 why we're scoring low.

4 COMMISSIONER SPITLER: Do you have the ability
5 to cover the operational costs associated with the
6 equipment grant?

7 MONA DANIELS: Yes, we do. We also have Desert
8 Side Tracks who was in my office two days ago saying
9 when are the signs coming in so we can get out there
10 and start work. So we've got a fairly large volunteer
11 group that's also waiting to get busy on this, so.

12 COMMISSIONER SPITLER: Based on that, I would
13 like to increase that to 35 out of 40.

14 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Are we getting concurrence
15 from the moti oner?

16 COMMISSIONER PRIZMICH: No.

17 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: You'd need to make an
18 amendment.

19 COMMISSIONER SPITLER: I'll make an amendment.
20 Item one, I'll increase that to a score of 35 out of
21 40. Regarding that this is an efficient use of funds,
22 to me this is a particularly efficient use of funds in
23 that small investment in signing will help riders stay
24 on the designated routes, reduce your enforcement
25 costs. Can you speak to whether this is cost

436

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 effective, whether using any volunteers or
2 partnerships, whether this is going to reduce your
3 maintenance costs down the road?

4 MONA DANIELS: Oh, definitely. We also know
5 that -- well, we definitely feel this is also going to
6 reduce our restoration costs down the road. We have a
7 number of routes, both primary and secondary routes.
8 We're seeing some impacts, some third- and fourth-level
9 routes starting to occur basically because the
10 secondaries they get lost on. And so we really need to
11 address the secondary routes, and that's what this
12 would definitely be doing, so.

13 COMMISSIONER SPITLER: I move to increase that
14 to 20 out of 20.

15 And finally the last two items of the proposed
16 equipment purchase address a specific need, I mean I
17 guess I have a hard time imagining a need more specific
18 than this item. I would increase number three to 30
19 out of 30. And adequate staffing, I will leave that

20 one alone at four. I don't know what that adds up to,
21 89. I'll move that as an amendment for a score of 89.

22 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: Second.

23 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: We have an amendment and the
24 motion and a second. All those in favor of the
25 amendment?

437

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 (Commissioners simultaneously voted.)

2 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Opposed?

3 COMMISSIONER McMILLIN: No.

4 COMMISSIONER PRIZMICH: No.

5 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: So the original motion with
6 the amendment, all those in favor?

7 (Commissioners simultaneously voted.)

8 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Opposed?

9 COMMISSIONER McMILLIN: No.

10 COMMISSIONER PRIZMICH: No.

11 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: The motion carries with the
12 amendment.

13 OHMVR STAFF BELLUCCI: Next application is line
14 23, OR-795, San Bernardino County Sheriff, Victor
15 Valley requested \$165,741; received a score of 52 for
16 50 percent funding for \$82,871. And on the
17 supplemental information for this application, again
18 like with California City, they referenced information
19 that was found in their law enforcement application.
20 And this time I do have some numbers for you, pages 16
21 and 18 of their original application.

22 SHANNON DICUS: Commissioners, I'm Sergeant

2007-01-25 OHV C1 x
23 Discus from the Victor Valley Station, San Bernardino
24 County Sheriff's Department. In your supplemental
25 information, tab number eight is the scoring rationale
438

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 for our increased scores.
2 Under criteria number one, we've identified both
3 (a) and (b) and increased the score, but for the sake
4 of brevity, I would like to also address the areas that
5 staff stated that we didn't address some of these
6 items.

7 On criteria number two, contributes to reduced
8 costs of maintaining roads, trails, and areas. Under
9 page 16, Victor Valley Station's jurisdiction contains
10 the largest OHV areas in the United States. The BLM is
11 tasked with providing law enforcement services for
12 these areas. Victor Valley Station continues to
13 provide law enforcement services in OHV areas to assist
14 the BLM and allow them to address other concerns such
15 as wilderness intrusion, vegetation destruction, and
16 trail maintenance.

17 In another area, item (c), the applicant did not
18 address this item. The emergency equipment will be
19 added to all OHV vehicles at department expense,
20 covered in page 68. The Victor Valley Station has
21 augmented grant funding with proposed funding from BLM
22 to assist with large events. Victor Valley is working
23 on reducing costs by setting up accounts with our local
24 courts to use funds from OHV violation fines to assist
25 enforcement costs.

439

1 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: Slow down, sir, slow down.
2 We are trying to follow the process.

3 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: We appreciate your
4 efficiencies, but they're having difficulty keeping up.

5 SHANNON DICUS: Under the same criteria (c),
6 we've also contracted with the different motorcycle
7 clubs putting on events to pay for law enforcement
8 services. The primary ones are the Atlanto Grand Prix
9 and the Desert Vipers Motorcycle Club.

10 Under the same criteria, section (d), line by
11 line, specifically and this is borne out of experience
12 with law enforcement as it relates to OHV enforcement,
13 I could have easily drafted the document to include
14 sheriff's department radios and radio systems that are
15 expensive. There is other civilian equipment out there
16 that would work, and it's a quarter of the cost, and
17 that's what we've outlined in this particular grant.
18 Also, we asked for utility-type ATVs, commonly referred
19 to as Rangers and Rhinos. We're using four-wheel drive
20 patrol vehicles that are set up with \$60,000 worth of
21 equipment to drive in and get these suspects from
22 remote areas. Vehicles like this, again borne out of
23 experience in enforcing these things, allows to take a
24 \$10,000 vehicle, go in and use the wear and tear on it
25 and bring them back to command post areas.

440

1 Under criteria three, section (a), the amount of
2 existing recreational use, Victor Valley Sheriff
3 Station's jurisdiction covers more than basically 1500
4 square miles of desert land. Many of these areas are
5 extremely remote. The greater Victor Valley region
6 contains the largest OHV recreation areas in the
7 continental United States. This particular aspect
8 draws OHV enthusiasts from surrounding areas of
9 San Diego, Orange, Los Angeles and Riverside Counties.
10 The Johnson Valley open area at 188,374 acres is the
11 largest designated OHV area known to exist.

12 The equipment will repair -- under section (c),
13 again criteria number three, it says that we did not
14 address this item. The equipment will repair, restore
15 damage or extend the useful life of roads, trails and
16 areas. Again, the Victor Valley jurisdiction contains
17 the largest OHV areas. And by us providing law
18 enforcement services out there will free up the BLM to
19 actually take care of wilderness intrusions, vegetation
20 destruction and trail maintenance.

21 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: Let me interrupt you. Did
22 you address this item in your application?

23 SHANNON DICUS: Yes, and we specifically
24 reference the page numbers on the supplemental
25 information that we provided at the south meeting.

441

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: Give us the tab number
2 again on the supplemental.

3 SHANNON DICUS: It was tab number eight under
Page 163

4 the supplemental information.

5 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: Next time, it's easier to
6 hand them out. We're working off of four volumes.

7 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Mr. Priznich, so long as
8 we're researching, go ahead with your question.

9 COMMISSIONER PRIZNICH: I have a question for
10 you. You glossed over it rather quickly. I'm not
11 sure, but I thought I heard you say that you've
12 encouraged or had some of your off-road groups to put
13 on fund raisers to pay for law enforcement services?

14 SHANNON DICUS: Actually, contracts. We have
15 large events, and the one I referenced was the Adalanto
16 Grand Prix, and there are 20 to 40,000 enthusiasts that
17 show up to this event at any given time during the
18 year. They have this event in February, and it's an
19 event put on by the Desert Viper Motorcycle Club. In
20 the past, they have not had to pay for law enforcement
21 services for that except for the last two years. We've
22 contracted with them, so we're not using any of the OHV
23 funds and the specifically trained deputy sheriffs to
24 patrol that event. A direct reflection of that, we
25 hear the pit bikes are a very popular right now, the

442

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 small little mini bikes that everybody rides. We had
2 17 of them stolen. The following year we only had one
3 bike stolen, and the last year we had zero.

4 COMMISSIONER PRIZNICH: Good.

5 SHANNON DICUS: In continuing, under section
6 (e), use of volunteers and other low-cost labor.

7 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: Just a second, please.
8 One question, staff has referenced page 16, and you
9 have referenced page 16, and when I go to the
10 application, there is no page 16, so. There are
11 numbers at the bottom, and there are numbers at the
12 top, the small print at top. The application starts at
13 281 of 388.

14 OHMVR STAFF BELLUCCI: That 281 is the page
15 number of the books we put together that are comprised
16 of a bunch of different applications.

17 COMMISSIONER SPITLER: How does page 16
18 translate into the book I have for the 281 series?

19 OHMVR STAFF ROACH: It's at the bottom.

20 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: At the bottoms they're not
21 sequential. If you look at the bottom of these things,
22 there's six, seven, then it goes to 68.

23 OHMVR STAFF BELLUCCI: Those are just the parts
24 of the application that we felt necessary to put in
25 this. They should be sequential with some numbers

443

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 missing in between.

2 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: So where would 16 be
3 between 68 and seven?

4 OHMVR STAFF BELLUCCI: Page 294 on the top.

5 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: Thank you very much.
6 That's what I was looking for. All right.

7 So let me ask staff again. So staff's point was
8 when they said in the analysis, the applicant does not
9 address this section, and then the applicant comes back

10 and says, I addressed it at page 16, how do we
11 reconcile those two comments? That would be my
12 question of staff.

13 OHMVR STAFF BELLUCCI: When we scored the
14 applications, we were held to the information
15 contained, and there are page limits for each
16 application type, and we were held to using the
17 information submitted in the application for a specific
18 grant. I believe if we went to another application,
19 but a project type from the same applicant, that it
20 could give them an unfair advantage by exceeding the
21 page limits.

22 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: I understand that. My
23 question is if in the staff analysis you say the
24 applicant did not address the item, the applicant comes
25 back and says at page 16 I said something, and here it
444

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 is in the box. Now I've filled out that original
2 application, I found the paragraph finally in the text,
3 why does the paragraph that they have in the text not
4 address the question?

5 CHIEF JENKINS: That's why he was trying to
6 explain that why we couldn't consider it while we were
7 scoring it on our teams because we were only scoring
8 each application as a stand alone application within
9 those page limitations. So when they were scoring this
10 particular project, they could not look outside the
11 page limitations at companion projects for the same
12 agency. The applicant here today is now presenting
Page 166

13 that information to you as additional information, so
14 you're able to consider that here. We didn't have that
15 flexibility as we were going through the scoring
16 process.

17 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: I see. I see, got it.
18 Thank you. Now, I understand.

19 Did you in your original application make a
20 reference to information in your enforcement grant or
21 did you just repeat it?

22 SHANNON DICUS: In many of the sections, because
23 of page limitations, we referred to the enforcement
24 grant. I mean we're reinventing the wheel that we
25 already put on the car.

445

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: Okay.

2 COMMISSIONER PRIZMICH: That's pretty common.

3 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: That's how I fill out
4 applications, see page 32, attached.

5 COMMISSIONER PRIZMICH: In law enforcement
6 circles, that's pretty common when they're referring
7 back, especially to a face page. Rather than repeat
8 information that's already contained in a page or two
9 prior to there, they'll refer back to whatever number
10 it was.

11 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: Right, I got it. So now
12 we have to unravel the construction here, okay.

13 SHANNON DICUS: Under criteria (e), the use of
14 volunteers or low-cost labor, we stated that we use
15 sheriff's reserves 60 percent of the time. We use your

16 sheriff's Arrow Squadron, which is a squadron that's on
17 the ground not paid for by the sheriff's department as
18 far as the vehicles are concerned, but we do pay for
19 their fuel. Their primary mission is if an aircraft
20 goes down, they try to find the beacon. But while they
21 are sitting there, we use them for OHV enforcement
22 also. Put them in the air, and they can assist us, and
23 again we pay for the fuel. We also use inmate labor to
24 clean and conduct minor equipment maintenance, again at
25 no cost.

446

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 Under criteria number three, I think I already
2 addressed this. Under criteria three, section (d),
3 unusual soil, topography and other resource conditions,
4 stated we did not address this item. The Victor Valley
5 Station again has jurisdiction over the Johnson Valley,
6 which houses two areas of environmental critical
7 concern. One at Soggy Dry Lake, the Criasoke Rings,
8 and again at Johnson Valley, the Yucca rings which are
9 bulletiny vegetative assemblages.

10 And that pretty much covers it. Also, I'd like
11 to point out that the Victor Valley Station has never
12 used the equipment grant process as, quote/unquote, a
13 cash cow. We also contribute to this. In the same
14 application, I stated that we would produce a van, a
15 cargo van to use as a tow vehicle. That was purchased
16 two months ago and is in the fleet and dedicated to OHV
17 enforcement. Motorcycles that we ride, they're ten
18 years old, but purchased that also out of our own

19 station money.

20 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Thank you. Any public
21 comments on this? Commissioners?

22 BRENT SCHORADT: I'm Brent Schoradt with the
23 California Wilderness Coalition, and we'd just like to
24 express our support for this grant, particularly the
25 fact, I think under category three, the testimony that
447

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 we've heard today in terms of patrolling the use area
2 of Johnson Valley, and also keeping vehicles out of
3 ACECs in the vicinity of Johnson Valley is a specific
4 need that's needed out there in Victor Valley. And I
5 think they got nine out of 30 on that, if you could
6 improve the score to 29 out of 30, since we did hear
7 that specific need that would improve the score to at
8 least 72 out of a 100. Thanks.

9 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Thank you. Commissioners?

10 COMMISSIONER PRIZMICH: If I might bring up
11 again something that I've talked about time and time
12 again, and that is the use of Aero Squadrons as a cost
13 effective means of dealing with wilderness intrusions
14 and dealing with just general safety issues. This is
15 an example of an outstanding use of the Arrow Squadron,
16 and I think you've got San Bernardino County that's
17 putting all efforts forward to maximize the enforcement
18 effort out in Victor Valley and doing it at a very cost
19 effective rate. I mean I can't commend them high
20 enough. So I would like to see, as a result of their
21 partnerships and reduced alliance on OHV funds, I mean

22 raising monies out of venues to pay for law enforcement
23 services, we really need to be rewarding these guys.
24 And so I'd like to see under criteria two, subsection
25 (b), that portion increased five more points. In lieu
448

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 of funds under number (c), another five points for use
2 of --

3 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: That's 2(c)?

4 COMMISSIONER PRIZMICH: I'm sorry, 2(c). Did I
5 say 3(c)?

6 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: You only have one more point
7 to work with there.

8 COMMISSIONER PRIZMICH: I only got one more
9 point, I'll find it, believe me. Of course, the use of
10 volunteers is also in the forefront with law
11 enforcement, and these guys have exemplified that.
12 Again, Aero Squadron is free. I want to emphasize
13 that.

14 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Aaron, I think he was
15 shooting for 20 there, actually five more points in
16 those two categories.

17 COMMISSIONER PRIZMICH: Did I make it?

18 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: If I was counting right, you
19 did, but I'll be corrected shortly, I'm sure.

20 COMMISSIONER PRIZMICH: And Brent brought up on
21 criteria three -- what was your suggestion, Brent?

22 BRENT SCHORADT: Specific need.

23 COMMISSIONER PRIZMICH: 29?

24 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: Yes, it was 29 out of 30.

25 COMMISSIONER PRIZMICH: I agree with his 449

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 assessment based on the testimony provided by the
2 sergeant. So what does that come out to?

3 OHMVR STAFF PEREZ: Sheriff Priznich, could you
4 please repeat your score for criteria number one?

5 COMMISSIONER PRIZMICH: I didn't change criteria
6 number one at all. Two would be 20, and three would be
7 29.

8 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: So you should have 73 as your
9 final score.

10 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: With the final criteria, I
11 would suggest ten out of ten based on the staffing
12 discussions we've heard in the testimony, that would be
13 the fourth criteria, if the maker of the motion would
14 accept that?

15 COMMISSIONER PRIZMICH: I'll accept that.

16 OHMVR STAFF FREITAS: That's a total score of
17 83?

18 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: Is that right, that's 83?

19 The final criteria was ten, right? That's a
20 staffing discussion that we had heard from the
21 sheriff's representative.

22 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: So is that one of your
23 motions?

24 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: And I second the motion.

25 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: So we're at 86. All those in
450

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 favor?

2 (Commissioners simultaneously voted.)

3 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Opposed?

4 VICE-CHAIR ANDERSON: Abstain.

5 COMMISSIONER McMILLIN: Abstain.

6 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: So we have a four, and two
7 abstentions. The motion carries.

8 The scribe is moaning over here with her hands
9 aching, so we will break for about 12 minutes.

10 (Break taken in proceedings.)

11 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: We begin again.

12 OHMVR STAFF BELLUCCI: Line 25, OR-818,
13 San Bernardino County Sheriff, Barstow requested amount
14 was \$148,500. They received a score of 55, and the
15 funding of 50 percent was \$74,250.

16 DOUG HUBBARD: Thank you, members of the
17 Commission. My name is Doug Hubbard. I'm a sergeant
18 with the San Bernardino County Sheriff's Department,
19 Barstow Station. And when I get started here, you're
20 going to hear many of the same things from me as you
21 heard from my peer, Sergeant Shannon Dicus, with our
22 volunteers and some of the tools we use because we're
23 with the same organization. We use many of them, so
24 bear with me. I just wanted to touch on a couple of
25 things.

451

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 On our equipment grant we received an overall

2 score of 55 out of a 100, and I suspect you'll find tab
3 nine in your binders. At one of the other meetings, I
4 provided some information for your review, and I'm
5 going to briefly touch on just a few of those things.
6 In section one, we received a score of 20 out of 40,
7 and in subsection (a), it talked about the ability to
8 cover operational costs, and the rationale from the
9 Division, at that time I agreed with, their rationale
10 has the applicant has a very structured maintenance
11 plan, conducted regular maintenance on all equipment.
12 I just wanted to add into that, and I guess you could
13 consider it as new information. But our particular
14 station in Barstow, we have an automotive budget of a
15 \$190,000 per year overall for our entire motor budget.
16 That's a significant pool of money to provide
17 maintenance from and we do it regularly. So I just
18 wanted to throw that in there. That part of it wasn't
19 in the original grant. I did feel that even the
20 Division's rationale was acceptable to receive a higher
21 score in that category.

22 And in subsection (b) as well, the rationale
23 from the Division was that the applicant is committed
24 to provide staffing without relying on OHV funds, and
25 staffing includes deputies and volunteers. I felt that
452

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 was a fair enough rationale to receive a score of 35
2 out of 40 at a minimum.

3 In section two, we received a score of 16 out of
4 20. I just touched briefly on that, potentially a

5 score of 18 out of 20. And more specifically in
6 subsection (a), where it says, contributes to reduced
7 cost of maintaining roads, trails and areas, the
8 Division's rationale was that we didn't address that
9 item. And I spoke of it before in other applications.
10 But our overall efforts and longstanding
11 accomplishments, as outlined in the application as a
12 whole, we feel reduces the cost associated with
13 maintenance through our enforcement efforts, and I felt
14 I covered that.

15 And section (e) there, use of volunteers or
16 other low-cost labor, we had included some information
17 in the PAR of the application. But again as mentioned
18 by one of the other applicants, our Victor Valley, our
19 sister section, the reserve deputies and the Aero
20 Squadron and things like that, we use endlessly in
21 areas like Dumont Dunes. And more specifically the
22 Aero Squadron for us this past year developed a grid
23 program for a GPS system so that we can respond to
24 calls timely with a GPS system using a grid map. And
25 if you're familiar with Dumont Dunes -- I know John

453

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 Pelonio has been to Dumont, that is a significant thing
2 when you can narrow a section of Dumont Dunes down to a
3 grid. So we feel that's very significant use of
4 volunteer time.

5 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Please summarize.

6 DOUG HUBBARD: Yes, I'm sorry. Section three,
7 we received a score of 13 out of 30, and that was

8 probably the biggest one from my perspective. And I
9 will I'll expedite here. But we cover an area of
10 10,000 square miles out of our jurisdiction. The
11 existing recreational use is probably the largest in
12 the country. From my jurisdiction for 10,000 square
13 miles, I don't know if there is anything larger. And,
14 again, the Atalanto Grand Prix, we also provide
15 assistance to the City of Atalanto for that. We see
16 hundreds of thousands of visitors to our jurisdiction,
17 and I felt that a higher score was warranted out of
18 that. That 13 out of 30, I felt was relatively low.

19 And lastly on question four, we received a six
20 out of ten. I truly felt that that warranted a score
21 of ten out of ten. We have a very, very dedicated
22 staff to our OHV team. We just increased the numbers
23 to eight deputies to provide additional resources to
24 our team. The equipment is critical to making that
25 happen for us. It's in use for five years on a grant

454

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 program, and it's just really getting old.

2 I think that about covers it. We just truly
3 encourage the Commission to consider rescoring our
4 grant to get us in the game so we can stay active for
5 the recreation enthusiasts of San Bernardino County.

6 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Thank you.

7 BRENT SCHORADT: Brent Schoradt with the
8 California Wilderness Coalition, and we support this
9 grant because the San Bernardino County Sheriff's
10 Department has done a great job of patrolling not just

11 Dumont Dunes and the use area down there, but also the
12 private property and the local community residents down
13 in Red Mountain. And I think just the specific need of
14 balancing both providing opportunities and patrolling
15 the use areas and also patrolling the private property
16 and the community areas, it's a specific need that
17 deserves to be funded. And we recommend 15 additional
18 points under category three, because of that specific
19 need, which would bring the score up to at least a 70
20 out of a 100. Thanks.

21 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Thank you. One more public
22 comment?

23 JEREMY VASQUEZ: My name Jeremy Vasquez. I'm a
24 deputy sheriff in San Bernardino County, currently
25 assigned out of the Barstow Station. I'm currently a
455

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 reserve coordinator and member of the OHV team. Just
2 like to add that, as Sergeant Hubbard said, our
3 equipment is getting very old. This last year, we have
4 a toy box hauler, which is used as a command post, has
5 an office and cargo space for four quads and a sand
6 rail. This last year, because our equipment is getting
7 used so much in areas that are bumpy and it's getting
8 worn out, this last year, with the services of a local
9 citizen, was able to replace our rear door, which is
10 also the ramp on our trailer, this year which was a
11 necessity. Also, the quads that we currently have are
12 outdated and are now having a difficult time keeping up
13 with the newer technology such as the 450s and the

14 750s. So, like I said, I would just like to humbly ask
15 you guys to reconsider the scores on this grant. Thank
16 you.

17 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Thank you. Commissioners?
18 Mr. Pri zmi ch.

19 COMMISSIONER PRIZMICH: Sergeant, could I have
20 you come back up here again?

21 DOUG HUBBARD: Yes, sir.

22 COMMISSIONER PRIZMICH: On category one, item
23 (a), you mentioned -- I wasn't real clear on this. You
24 mentioned something about you had a maintenance budget
25 of a \$190,000. Is that budget devoted to OHV?

456

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 DOUG HUBBARD: I wish.

2 COMMISSIONER PRIZMICH: Is part of it devoted to
3 OHV repairs?

4 DOUG HUBBARD: Yes, and regularly used for that.
5 Our entire station automotive budget with 15 police
6 cars, tires and oil changes and things, but a large
7 portion -- a portion of that also provides the service
8 for the quads and the sand rail and tires and fuel,
9 mostly the fuel.

10 COMMISSIONER PRIZMICH: Those of you who know
11 anything about off-road vehicles, they do take in terms
12 of maintenance quite a bit more maintenance than your
13 average car.

14 Now, the individuals that are actually doing the
15 maintenance, the county workers that are providing
16 that, is that also provided free of charge to the...

17 DOUG HUBBARD: We limit -- unlike Victor Valley,
18 they may use more. We limit the inmate worker
19 productivity hours. They do wash the vehicles and
20 clean the vehicles. We have an automotive tech, a
21 county employee at our station.

22 COMMISSIONER PRIZMICH: That's actually what I'm
23 referring to.

24 DOUG HUBBARD: But our reserve deputies do most
25 of the work themselves, repair work.

457

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 COMMISSIONER PRIZMICH: So we're getting a
2 pretty good bang for the buck.

3 DOUG HUBBARD: Absolutely.

4 COMMISSIONER PRIZMICH: And you requested an
5 increase on criteria one to 35 points is what you're
6 requesting?

7 DOUG HUBBARD: Yes.

8 COMMISSIONER PRIZMICH: And as far as the Aero
9 Squadron, you mentioned the grid pattern. How long did
10 it take for your Aero Squadron to accomplish that?
11 Could you hazard a guess?

12 DOUG HUBBARD: One of the volunteers, to my
13 understanding, he's worked on this for months. It took
14 a lot of programming, as I understand it. I'm not
15 familiar with how it works. But the ultimate outcome
16 of it was that our deputies have GPS units, handheld
17 GPS units. The information that he had produced in a
18 laptop computer or some sort of terminal that they use
19 in the airplane, mapping system, if you will, I think

20 is what he referred to it as, that information was then
21 downloaded to our handheld GPS units, that could be
22 attached to the vehicles.

23 Wilderness intrusion is a huge thing for the
24 Aero Squadron. They can cover a lot of very
25 treacherous terrain out in that area, look for

458

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 wilderness intrusion, report that grid pattern, if you
2 will, to our ground units who can immediately look at
3 their GPS unit or punch in what he tells you to within
4 10 feet, for example, and respond right to that area,
5 as well as medical emergencies. It was two parts. It
6 was the wilderness intrusion, primarily, and then the
7 emergency response to medical emergencies and things
8 like that. It's very difficult for the air unit to
9 tell us the third bush from the left, you know, in a
10 Dumont Dunes environment. So it was very, very
11 helpful.

12 COMMISSIONER PRIZMICH: In Amador County, it's
13 usually the oak tree on the left-hand side. And you're
14 requesting -- you think I'm kidding, too. And you're
15 requesting 18 points out of that item in criteria
16 number two?

17 DOUG HUBBARD: Yes.

18 COMMISSIONER PRIZMICH: And then finally in
19 criteria number three, you mentioned that you're one of
20 the largest, if not the largest, recreational areas in
21 the nation.

22 DOUG HUBBARD: Well, at least

23 juri sdi cti onal -wi se we cover 10,000 square miles. I
24 don't know about legal opportunity, but certainly
25 illegally and illegal opportunity.

459

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 COMMI SSIONER PRI ZMI CH: It woul dn't be incorrect
2 to say you're one of the largest.

3 DOUG HUBBARD: Absol utely, Dumont Dunes is
4 San Bernardi no's versi on of Grami s.

5 COMMI SSIONER PRI ZMI CH: I'd like to make a
6 moti on.

7 CHAI R BRI SSENDEN: Pl ease.

8 COMMI SSIONER PRI ZMI CH: Wi th the expl orati on of
9 the testi mony that I j ust went through, I'd like to
10 change cri teri a one to a Commi ssi on score of 35, so
11 i ncrease it 15. Cri teri a number two, I'd like to
12 change that to a score of 18, so that woul d be an
13 i ncrease of two. And on cri teri a three, I'd like to
14 change that adding 15 points to the 13 that are al ready
15 there, so make that 28, is that what it is? And I'd
16 like to i ncrease the fi nal i tem to 8.

17 CHAI R BRI SSENDEN: Fi nal tally is?

18 OHMVR STAFF FREI TAS: 89.

19 CHAI R BRI SSENDEN: So there is a moti on.

20 COMMI SSIONER PRI ZMI CH: That's my moti on.

21 COMMI SSIONER McMI LLIN: Second.

22 CHAI R BRI SSENDEN: Moti on and second. All those
23 i n favor?

24 VICE-CHAI R ANDERSON: Wait a mi nute, I have one
25 questi on. Sorry, Doug, j ust one questi on. Can you

460

1 tell me what kind of public notification you use with
2 this volunteer blimp.

3 DOUG HUBBARD: The blimp is actually ironically
4 very, very successful for us. At Dumont Dunes, and
5 other events that are desert related, we put that blimp
6 up. It's a lighted 25-foot helium blimp with a 18 --
7 24-inch sheriff letters on the side of it. We started
8 using that a couple of years ago with the lighting
9 equipment that's in it. It has a 1,000 watt halogen
10 bulb that goes in it, and at night literally on a
11 Dumont Dunes holiday weekend, we will get a dozen or
12 more enthusiasts who focus on that blimp when they need
13 help and they can find our command post. Quite
14 literally in the middle of nowhere, we've located
15 missing people who walked up to our command post
16 because they saw that lighted blimp 250 feet in the
17 air.

18 VICE-CHAIR ANDERSON: So it's not like your
19 running scrolling letters across it, but it's just
20 lighted?

21 DOUG HUBBARD: Yes, it's lighted with a halogen
22 bulb that goes inside of it and it's 200 feet. That
23 would be, though, the scrolling letters.

24 VICE-CHAIR ANDERSON: No, this is a person who
25 likes the surrounding wilderness. I'm not quite so

461

1 sure I'm --

2 DOUG HUBBARD: We use it for safety and really
3 lets the enthusiasts know where we are at.

4 VICE-CHAIR ANDERSON: 250 feet up is probably
5 not so bad. Much higher than that, I'm going to start
6 complaining about disturbing the surrounding wilderness
7 areas. Okay. Thank you.

8 DOUG HUBBARD: Thank you.

9 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Okay. We have a motion and a
10 second. All those in favor?

11 (Commissioners simultaneously voted.)

12 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Opposed? Motion carries.

13 OHMVR STAFF BELLUCCI: The final equipment
14 application is line 29, OR-785, Yucca Valley Police
15 Department requested \$10,834; received a score of 53
16 for 50 percent funding or \$5,417. And in looking at
17 their supplemental application information, it looks
18 like quite a bit of the information they provided was
19 not provided in the original application.

20 RICHARD COLLINS: Richard Collins, County of
21 Yucca Valley Police Department. Good afternoon,
22 Commissioners. I'd like to provide some additional
23 information. Under 1(b), I would like to expand, the
24 applicant currently employs 50 sworn patrol deputies
25 who can all be utilized for OHV enforcement,

462

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 educational purposes. The department incurs the costs
2 associated in training these personnel. Actual field
3 enforcement relies on state OHV fund outside the normal

4 work group to utilize these personnel.

5 Under 2(a), consistent enforcement of OHV laws.
6 The OHV users are directed to using designated trails
7 and roadways thereby reducing damage and deterioration
8 of the roadways, trails, and other environmentally
9 sensitive areas.

10 Under 2(c), I would like to add that the
11 applicant would respond to emergencies and assist other
12 agencies such as BLM, CHP, code enforcement, and the
13 National Park Service. The funding from this grant
14 provides additional resources to respond to remote
15 areas of the Morongo Basin where OHV activities occur.
16 These law enforcement personnel are trained in all
17 aspects of emergency response. The Town of Yucca
18 Valley and the City of Twentynine Palms occasionally
19 have state SLESF grant funds available to assist with
20 illegal OHV enforcement activity.

21 Under 2(d), dual sport motorcycles are the most
22 efficient method of patrolling remote OHV use areas
23 while allowing travel over paved roadways to get from
24 one area to another.

25 Under 2(e), I'd like to add the Morongo Basin 463

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 Station currently has eight volunteer groups consisting
2 of in excess of 200 volunteers. This includes search
3 and rescue, mounted search and rescue and six citizens
4 on patrol units. These volunteers have donated more
5 than 9,000 hours of time during the past year.

6 Under 3(d), I'd like to add, OHV enthusiasts are
Page 183

7 drawn to the Morongo Basin for its mountains, deserts,
8 lake beds, ecological systems, lava flows, marshlands,
9 varying elevation levels and other natural resources.
10 Weather conditions in the Morongo Basin provide year
11 round recreational activities for OHV use.

12 Additionally, I'd like to add, aside from the
13 submission of this, we recently had some very
14 substantial fires in the Pi oneertown area, which
15 removed many of the natural barriers that kept people
16 from entering the preserve and other wilderness areas
17 located there. Could really use to have an additional
18 motorcycle, so we could send out two teams on holiday
19 weekends to cover more areas. We currently have one
20 motorcycle purchased with OHV funds, and two that we
21 have purchased with other funds. If we could get one
22 more, then that allows to have four to send out two
23 teams.

24 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Any questions, any public
25 comment?

464

 SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 BRENT SCHORADT: Brent Schoradt with the
2 California Wilderness Coalition, and I'd just like to
3 display our support for this grant, and I think the
4 fact that what we just heard there's only -- right now
5 they have three ATVs they can use for patrols. If they
6 get this fourth vehicle, they'll be able to split up
7 into two teams of two for the busy holiday weekends,
8 and I think it's important, not just for monitoring and
9 patrolling use areas, but also keeping vehicles out of

13 COMMISSIONER PRIZMICH: No, that's two, but I
14 would like to increase, now that you mentioned it,
15 criteria number two from 11 to 18 based on the
16 testimony here.

17 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Leave four at four for a
18 total of 67.

19 COMMISSIONER SPITLER: I'll second that.

20 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: It's been moved and seconded.
21 Any discussion?

22 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: I think you should
23 increase the third criteria by four points, and I think
24 the evidence provided justifies an additional four, so
25 if the maker of the motion would accept that amendment.

466

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 VICE-CHAIR ANDERSON: Which would make it 22.

2 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: Make it 24, that would
3 give us an 81.

4 COMMISSIONER PRIZMICH: Yes.

5 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: It's agreeable to both the
6 motioner and the second?

7 COMMISSIONER SPITLER: Yes.

8 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: So with that adjustment, we
9 captured that. We have a total of what again? 81,
10 thank you. All those in favor?

11 (Commissioners simultaneously voted.)

12 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Opposed? Motion carries.
13 That is unanimous, take the message back to Yucca
14 Valley.

15 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: The Lion and the Lamb are
Page 186

16 happy.

17 OHMVR STAFF BELLUCCI: That takes care of all of
18 the equipment grants. I believe you would move on to
19 FOM next.

20 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: You're still with us.

21 OHMVR STAFF BELLUCCI: You'll have to ask the
22 Deputy Director?

23 DEPUTY DIR. GREENE: He was reinstated this
24 morning.

25 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: So he has another section to
467

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 go?

2 DEPUTY DIR. GREENE: A couple of year's worth.

3 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: But he wants to ride, better
4 let him out of office. Okay. Keep going, Larry.
5 Thank you.

6 OHMVR STAFF GLASPIE: Actually, the facilities
7 and operation management will be handled by me, Ken
8 Glaspie.

9 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: That was my question. I
10 thought Larry might be excused, but okay.

11 OHMVR STAFF GLASPIE: The first application
12 we'll be looking at is on line 33, OR-781, California
13 City Police Department, Facilities Operations and
14 Maintenance. They requested \$14,506. They scored 29
15 points for zero percent funding determination. They
16 did submit additional information, and it was
17 considerably better than the first thing we got.

18 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: You went to Ed Waldheim's
Page 187

19 school, right?

20 ERIC HURTADO: Took advice from staff to submit
21 a better grant. Eric Hurtado, California City Police
22 Department. Basically this grant deals with the only
23 trash, restroom, shower facility in the OHV area.
24 We've seen a dramatic increase in day use, so they
25 don't have their facilities on board to last for the

468

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 weekend. So they use the facilities at Boar Expo Park.
2 So this grant would cover the expenses to maintain that
3 facility, restroom supplies, and also trash dumpster
4 service, hauling away the trash. We've put out
5 donation boxes at our dump station hoping to keep up
6 with the cost of depositing the trash. We've sent out
7 flyers to the campsites hoping they would send their
8 trash back home with them. But conveniently the
9 command post and another key point has been the dump
10 station for the trash. We usually just have a couple
11 rollbacks there for them to deposit the trash, and it
12 doesn't cover the trash that's there, which will
13 probably cover about a third of this room by the end of
14 the weekend.

15 Specifically 1(a), we request reconsidering the
16 scoring to 30 points on this particular item. Going to
17 item 2(e), use of volunteers or low-cost labor, the
18 city has a position considered camp post, which a
19 person actual stays at the facility to do the upkeep
20 and maintenance for the facility. And also the desert
21 incident response team, if they have a facility to dump

22 rollbacks available, they pledge 250 hours of desert
23 cleanup. We have different organizations that are
24 willing to come out to help clean up the desert if they
25 just have get a place to deposit their trash that they⁴⁶⁹

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 pick up.

2 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Thank you. Any other public
3 comments on this item? Any questions or comments from
4 the Commissioners?

5 VICE-CHAIR ANDERSON: Just kind of a generic
6 one. You have a contractor who picks up all of the
7 trash, right?

8 ERIC HURTADO: Yes, there is a contract with the
9 local rubbish service to pick up the rollbacks from the
10 command post, yes, and haul it away and empty it.

11 VICE-CHAIR ANDERSON: Okay.

12 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Do I hear a motion?

13 COMMISSIONER PRIZMICH: I'm not quite sure I
14 understand why the police department is involved in
15 this.

16 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: I was asking the same
17 question in my mind.

18 COMMISSIONER PRIZMICH: Is it an administrative
19 function that the city has laid on you?

20 ERIC HURTADO: Try and tackle a problem with
21 littering. A lot --

22 COMMISSIONER PRIZMICH: Illegal problem of
23 littering.

24 ERIC HURTADO: I'm sorry, I didn't make that
Page 189

25 clear. The problem with a lot of users will throw 470

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 their trash bags in the back of the trailers, and it's
2 a long ride through town and they end up on the side of
3 the road. So in order to address this problem and
4 prevent littering and give them a place to legally
5 deposit it, the city has kind of taxed the police
6 department to come up with a resolution to the problem.

7 COMMISSIONER PRIZMICH: I don't want to create a
8 problem here, but had you ever approached the SO to
9 perhaps have their inmate workers deal with this or is
10 that something the SO doesn't normally do?

11 ERIC HURTADO: Right. In our area, there's one
12 sheriff substation that's quite a distance away. I
13 think they have one inmate worker weekly, and it's not
14 an available service to where we're at.

15 COMMISSIONER SPITLER: Move the staff
16 recommendation.

17 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: Second.

18 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: It's been moved and seconded,
19 staff recommendation. All those in favor?

20 (Commissioners simultaneously voted.)

21 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Opposed? Motion carries.

22 Item 36.

23 OHMVR STAFF GLASPIE: The next application is
24 line 36, OR-1-CD-351, El Centro Field Office,
25 Facilities, Operations and Maintenance. They requested
471

1 \$654,006. They received a score of 74 points for 70
2 percent funding determination of \$457,804. There was
3 no additional information submitted with this
4 application.

5 NEIL HAMADA: Neil Hamada, Imperial Sand Dunes
6 Recreation Manager, and here to answer questions. We
7 were ready to be on Consent; however, this application
8 was pulled off by Commissioner Anderson.

9 VICE-CHAIR ANDERSON: That's correct. I guess
10 in looking over your entire application, I was under
11 the impression from some things that were said at the
12 last meeting that you collect a lot of user fees in the
13 Imperial Sand Dunes area.

14 NEIL HAMADA: Right.

15 VICE-CHAIR ANDERSON: And the funds that are
16 collected are expended by a committee that you have?

17 NEIL HAMADA: Technical review team, they're
18 advisors, correct.

19 VICE-CHAIR ANDERSON: Okay. But they review how
20 the funds are expended?

21 NEIL HAMADA: That's correct.

22 VICE-CHAIR ANDERSON: Okay. And it didn't look
23 like under the application, at least under your
24 enforcement grant application, it didn't look like any
25 of the money was going into enforcement. And I'd like
472

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 you to elaborate on whether or not any of those

2 \$3 million that you mentioned you were collecting,
3 whether any of that went into operations and
4 maintenance, and/or did I miss something in your
5 application? Was it in the application? I didn't see
6 anything that indicated the use of these monies.

7 NEIL HAMADA: In the project needs and benefits,
8 number 2(c), in the text it identifies that federal
9 dollars and fee dollars are used in the Dunes. About
10 \$3 million, as you mentioned from fees, which goes
11 towards EMS, law enforcement, and operations and
12 maintenance.

13 VICE-CHAIR ANDERSON: Okay. So how much of it
14 is going into operations and maintenance?

15 NEIL HAMADA: Majority of that has gone into
16 operations and maintenance. If you look at it in the
17 grant program, about three-quarters of a million was
18 going into holiday expenditures for labor, and another
19 couple hundred thousand for non-law enforcement labor.
20 The rest of that, the majority of it, was going into
21 what in the grants Division would be called operations
22 and maintenance. Some of those things would go towards
23 like a hundred thousand dollars in vehicle costs. We
24 have off-highway vehicles and sand buggies, which are
25 very expensive to maintain. We have five of those,

473

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 rescue and law enforcement and monitoring dune buggies.
2 Last year we installed \$300,000 worth of vault toilets,
3 that's in addition to the ones we have already on site.
4 Right now, we're in the process of building a million

5 dollar station in the southern portion of the Dunes to
6 facilitate a multiagency law enforcement area,
7 interpretive area, as well as EMS area for the local
8 ambulance company.

9 VICE-CHAIR ANDERSON: Okay. Then you do have
10 specific things you are using the money for, but I'm
11 looking at your grant application within the booklets,
12 page 176 of page 333 in volume nine, and wondering
13 under the match, there's zero dollars. How do we
14 interpret that? And I see the same thing under law
15 enforcement equipment agency contribution is zero. So
16 where are you laying out so that this Commission can
17 get a sense of where you're spending that? Because
18 beyond your oral description right now, it's not in
19 here.

20 NEIL HAMADA: If you look at the same sheet, the
21 quantity amounts for the first part, which is staff
22 labor, is 1,040 hours, which is half a year not an
23 entire year. So the rest of that amount would be under
24 agency contribution. However, you're right. It's not
25 listed. There are different ways.

474

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 VICE-CHAIR ANDERSON: There is no way for me to
2 know that that's a half a year. Okay. The lower ones
3 are for one contract for trash bins within the year,
4 but I'm not aware and there is no description here. It
5 might have been -- you need to be more explicit because
6 I'm wondering where that money is going, and I'm sure a
7 lot of users are, too, if they're not reading the

8 reports from the technical review team on where the
9 \$3 million is going that you've raised. I don't think
10 you're necessarily mispending it, but it's certainly
11 not clear within what you've submitted how much is
12 going into which category. That's why I took it off
13 the Consent Calendar. I don't have any particular
14 scoring adjustment that I want to make, but I wanted to
15 get that information on the record in terms of my
16 concerns about the fact that we're not getting detailed
17 information on where that money is going.

18 And I don't know, given the page constraints
19 that you have for each of the grant applications, how
20 to tell you where to put it. But it certainly would be
21 useful if you incorporated it someplace in there so
22 that it would be easy to identify that 1,040 hours
23 is -- I don't know whether those are weekends and maybe
24 that's a whole year. I have no help there. So give me
25 some help in the future, okay?

475

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 NEIL HAMADA: Okay.

2 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Need a motion.

3 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: Given what we've just
4 heard, Commissioner Anderson, that criteria two would
5 be adjusted to the fact that there is no match.

6 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Well, she brought the
7 question up. Yes, I'll come back to you guys, our
8 great public.

9 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: So Commissioner Anderson,
10 would you intend to adjust the criteria?

11 VICE-CHAIR ANDERSON: No, I didn't intend to
12 adjust any criteria.

13 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Shall we hear from the great
14 public? Sorry, I didn't mean to ignore you there.

15 DON AMADOR: Don Amador, Blue Ribbon Coalition.
16 I first want to say, I think Neil does a great job down
17 there and writes some great grants. But my comment is
18 not specifically for Imperial County in this area, but
19 for some of the other counties. I would just encourage
20 the Commission to review the in lieu funds. As I
21 understand it, a \$600,000 check was just deposited into
22 the bank account for Imperial County for OHV recreation
23 enforcement management, what have you, and I would just
24 like to see the Commission have access to these new
25 numbers that are coming in, particularly into the rural
476

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 counties where OHV recreation is occurring.

2 And as a member of the public, I'd like to see
3 that information, too. Because from what I've seen,
4 Imperial County and San Bernardino are going to be
5 getting some pretty big checks to be used for OHV
6 recreation law enforcement management, et cetera. So I
7 would like to see the Commission have access to that
8 new information to help in their decision-making
9 process. Thank you.

10 DEPUTY DIR. GREENE: Chairman Brissenden, if I
11 may. Just for clarification purposes, this is all part
12 of the Fuel Tax issue that will be explained on
13 Saturday and presented to the Commission in this issue

14 of the in lieu fees. We will have the documents for
15 you. They are currently, I believe, available on the
16 website. The controller did this last week, with no
17 knowledge to us, but we wanted to make sure that this
18 will be part of the presentation so you'll be fully
19 informed.

20 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: That's why they're the
21 controller. So all of that information for specific
22 city and county in lieu funds will be illustrated and
23 available?

24 DEPUTY DIR. GREENE: Correct.

25 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Thank you.

477

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 JOHN STEWART: Good afternoon, Commissioners,
2 John Stewart, California Association of 4-Wheel Drive
3 Clubs, United 4-Wheel Drive Association, and Tierra Del
4 Sol 4-Wheel Drive Club. We support the staff
5 recommendations on this deal, and I'd like to point out
6 that some of the discussions so far right now center
7 around the Glamis. The BLM El Centro Field Office
8 covers more than just the Glamis area. It covers from
9 the Colorado River to the San Diego County border, and
10 from the Mexican border north, and it is probably the
11 most heavily-visited recreation area in the State of
12 California. On any given weekend to say that there are
13 a half a million people out there is probably an
14 underestimate as far as the people that come into the
15 area.

16 This money and this funding for the El Centro

17 Field Office is critical in order to provide the
18 quality of recreation, in order to provide protection
19 for the resources out there. We endorse and support
20 the fact that BLM is out there struggling to do their
21 job, and we'd like to see them get as much money as
22 they can. They deserve it and need it, and it really
23 does help on the ground. And we know that the vehicles
24 that they use -- you know, there has been talk about
25 the maintenance issues. Yes, these vehicles are used

478

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 in extreme environments, yes, they fail more quickly,
2 much more quickly than you would find the average user
3 of the average vehicle that is driven just on the city
4 streets, although some of the city streets are getting
5 some pretty hefty potholes. But out in the desert
6 environment where you have the constant dirt, they need
7 a heavy-duty maintenance schedule, and they need a
8 consistent replacement cycle. We endorse this grant,
9 and we would actually like to see you increase the
10 funding on this grant. So thank you.

11 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Thank you. Commissioners.

12 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: Yes, I'll make a motion,
13 but I would move the -- the existing staff
14 determination is 74. I think it should be reduced at
15 criteria number two by five, and particularly in light
16 of the information that the match was deficient and
17 unspecified on the contribution side and uncertain on
18 the receipt side. So I would move the matter with
19 criteria two being 22 out of 30, and, let's see, it's

20 one or more of the following, and I've explained by
21 rationale. So that would be a total of 69 for that
22 grant.

23 COMMISSIONER SPITLER: Second.

24 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: It's been moved and seconded,
25 score of 69. All those in favor? Oh, there's a

479

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 question first.

2 COMMISSIONER McMILLIN: I have a question. Can
3 I ask Kenny what your opinion is of that lack of
4 matching here? Do you feel like it's been matched, but
5 just not noted.

6 OHMVR STAFF GLASPIE: They're not required to
7 match at all. We do give additional points for agency
8 contributions, but they're not required to.

9 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: I understand that. I'm
10 using criteria 2(d), which talks to in lieu funds,
11 grants, use fees, and matching funds. So it was that
12 analytical determination based on the testimony and the
13 criteria 2(d) that was the basis of my motion.

14 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: If you're going to have
15 questions, please address them to everyone.

16 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: That's the motion.

17 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: So it's been moved and
18 seconded and almost voted on. Sorry for not
19 acknowledging that question. Those in favor?

20 (Commissioners simultaneously voted.)

21 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Opposed?

22 VICE-CHAIR ANDERSON: No.

23 2007-01-25 OHV C1 x
COMMISSIONER McMILLIN: No.
24 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Motion passes.
25 OHMVR STAFF GLASPIE: Next application is line 480

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 41, OR-2-ME-57, Mendocino National Forest, Facilities,
2 Operations and Maintenance. They requested \$277,720.
3 They received --

4 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Ken, we are missing one,
5 Los Padres.

6 OHMVR STAFF GLASPIE: Okay. Item 40,
7 OR-2-LP-100, Los Padres National Forest, Facilities
8 Operations and Maintenance requested \$216,524. They
9 received a score of 62 for 60 percent determination,
10 \$129,914.

11 JEFF BENSON: My name is Jeff Benson. I'm with
12 the Los Padres National Forest. We'd like an
13 adjustment of the score based on the following:

14 Item No. 1, we were scored at 40 points, and
15 we'd like to increase that by five points. And we feel
16 like we get that five points by -- this grant provides
17 so much for us as far as maintenance of our facilities
18 that we are really, really dependent upon it. The
19 grant provides toilet pumping, trash pumping in a large
20 number of sites affected by the OHV users, and it
21 includes graffiti removal, toilet pumping, vandalism
22 repair, signing. I really believe that we deserve a
23 score of 35 on Item No. 1.

24 The other area that I'm looking at is Item No.
25 3, application history. Once again, the Los Padres has 481

1 had OHV grants successfully, more than 40 grants over
2 the last 20 years, and we've had good outcomes on
3 those, good for activity, we've passed all of the
4 audits. So I believe that we should have an increase
5 in score from seven is all we got on there, add 15 more
6 points for a score of 22 on Item No. 3. And I'm
7 requesting a total score of 82.

8 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Public comment?

9 JOHN STEWART: Good afternoon, Commissioners,
10 John Stewart, California Association of 4-Wheel Drive
11 Clubs, United 4-Wheel Drive Associations. We support
12 the request for Los Padres' increase. We believe that
13 it's not only rational, but it's reasonable, and it is
14 fair and equitable. The Los Padres Forest has been
15 working very diligently with the OHV community in order
16 to -- and with the various Adopt-a-Trail programs and
17 with trail maintenance issues to keep the recreation
18 opportunity there. As said earlier this morning, this
19 area sits on the fringe within an hour or two drive of
20 one of the largest metropolitan areas within the United
21 States. If you're looking at efficient use of funds,
22 the sheer number of visitors into this area with the
23 funding is a good dollar per person ratio and is
24 something that, you know, keeping this as a
25 recreational opportunity is necessary. You know,

482

1 keeping the recreation program alive is necessary. You
2 know, it provides a good boundary security for the
3 various wilderness areas and the sensitive areas within
4 this region. So we endorse this requested amount of
5 the Los Padres. Thank you.

6 TOM TAMMONE: Tom Tammone, I'd also like to be
7 put on record as supporting the score increase for
8 Los Padres National Forest. It is a unique riding
9 opportunity and one of the better in the area, and
10 definitely is an efficient use of funds. And I'd like
11 to see their scoring increase request filled. Thank
12 you.

13 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Thank you. Commissioners?

14 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: Adopt the staff
15 recommendations.

16 COMMISSIONER McMILLIN: Second.

17 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: It's been moved and seconded
18 for staff recommendations. All those in favor?

19 (Commissioners simultaneously voted.)

20 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Opposed? Motion carries.

21 OHMVR STAFF GLASPIE: Next, line 41, OR-2-ME-57,
22 Mendocino National Forest, Facilities, Operations and
23 Maintenance. They requested \$277,720. They received
24 63 points for 60 percent funding determination of
25 \$166,632. They in addition submitted new information

483

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 that did touch on some of our concerns, and this grant
2 originally was written kind of all over the place, was
3 hard to find a lot of information, and their new

4 information kind of told us where some of that
5 information was hidden in the previous submission. And
6 they did refer to the PAR on this one with a good
7 figure for cost per visitor, and they addressed on Item
8 3(c), they addressed that fairly well this time, too.

9 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: So you're suggesting we have
10 a map as part of the criteria for next year as to where
11 to find it? Please, go ahead.

12 JEFF APPLGATE: Yes, Chairman, Commission, I'm
13 Jeff Applegate for the Mendocino National Forest, a
14 resource specialist there. And I'd like to point out
15 the specific rationale for increased scoring references
16 that are 98 percent within the original application, if
17 you know where to find it. There are a couple of areas
18 where we added some numbers to emphasize what we were
19 trying to convey.

20 For the overall grant, we would like to see an
21 overall increase from 63 to 94. And to summarize,
22 hopefully you do have a copy of the factual findings
23 that we turned in, and if you'd like to follow along
24 you can, but these are a little bit different because
25 I'm highlighting. So to summarize, we'd like to

484

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 increase the score for Item No. 1 from 34 to 39 out of
2 40. In the application, we explained how the project
3 enhances or protects existing or new OHV opportunities
4 as follows: Funding assistance is essential to
5 continuing the level of visitor services, which
6 includes public information and education, care

7 policing contracts, fee compliance and visitor safety.
8 OHV opportunities have been sustained and incrementally
9 expanded with state OHV funds in our area since 1982.
10 Visitation has increased 18 percent in the last five
11 years and continues to skyrocket. This equals more
12 need for sanitation like garbage collection, septic
13 waste removal, facility maintenance, and utility costs.
14 On our forest, four to six AMA sanctioned OHV events
15 are hosted annually using our state-of-the-art staging
16 areas and extensive trail systems that have been
17 developed over those years with a lot of assistance
18 from state OHV funds.

19 We provide an extensive system of designated
20 routes and have since 1995. We have also enlisted our
21 stakeholders in OHV ad hoc committees, including local
22 landowners, law enforcement, environmental interests,
23 and OHV users who have been essential to assisting us
24 in problem solving. We have wildlife closures,
25 restoration project areas, and cultural sites that are

485

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 protected by fencing, gates, barriers, and signage that
2 are maintained with FOM funding. Our extensive OHV
3 support infrastructure assures and sustains sanitation,
4 water quality, and safe well-made facilities. And that
5 was more pointed out in our project description than
6 maybe in the actual criteria. We thought that they
7 would be judged together. Deferred and regular
8 facility maintenance at the requested amount would
9 equal reduced facility depreciation in our area.

10 On number two we think there should be an
11 increased score from 27 to 30 out of 30, based on your
12 detailed description of efficient use of funds,
13 innovation, effective partnerships. We continue to
14 deliver a quality experience for a low cost of \$1.85
15 per visitor in the '05/'06 PAR. Agency contribution in
16 fiscal year '06/'07 was 15 percent, or \$41,635. We
17 recorded 2,880 hours of volunteer and contributable
18 labor in '05/'06. And under the Recreation Enhancement
19 Act we collected a total \$26,959 for fees at Grape
20 Line, Middle Creek and our dump station, which can be
21 95 percent returned to those facilities.

22 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Please summarize.

23 JEFF APPLGATE: Yes, thank you. Finally, in
24 number three, we recommend increasing the score from
25 two to 25 out of 30, for providing a detailed history

486

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 of implementing similar projects. The Mendocino has
2 had grants awarded every year since 1982, which totals
3 over a \$11 million, which is one of the numbers we
4 added. Our success is a direct result of the
5 outstanding personnel assigned to OHV management and
6 their ownership in the program for the last 24 years.
7 The forest has recognized experts, master performers,
8 and OHV management experience. That totals 121 years
9 of combined experience. I would like to finish and
10 open it up to questions. Thank you.

11 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Public would like to comment.

12 DON AMADOR: Don Amador, Blue Ribbon Coalition.

13 I just wanted to give a quick personal experience from
14 this area. Just last week, we had Brian Hawthorn from
15 our Public Lands Department come out and do a trail
16 ride at Stony Fort. He had never been out to a
17 developed OHV site in California, was quite impressed;
18 but as Jeff has pointed out, maintenance in the
19 facility is critically important with the amount of use
20 it's getting. At least one of the toilets was close to
21 being filled up there. You know, they're often called
22 SSTs or sweet smelling toilets, but when they're full,
23 they're not very sweet smelling. I'm just telling you
24 it gets a lot of use, and the funds actually go to
25 providing real on-the-ground public services. So any⁴⁸⁷

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 consideration of looking at this grant given some of
2 the new information, it would be appreciated.
3 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Thank you. Commissioners.
4 COMMISSIONER PRIZMICH: If I can just make a
5 comment, I know that Mendocino and Jeff have been held
6 up for a long time as one of the stellar groups, and
7 I'm a little bit, I guess, surprised to see that they
8 didn't score higher than they did. I think with the
9 new information on criteria number three, at the very
10 least, that should be moved up to a 28. They certainly
11 have had more than adequate criteria three.
12 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: I'll second that.
13 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Is that the full motion?
14 COMMISSIONER PRIZMICH: Yes, that would be the
15 motion.

16 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: So you have a total of 89?

17 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: Criteria is three more?

18 COMMISSIONER PRIZMICH: It's at 28.

19 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: It's 26 more.

20 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: Oh no, no, I was operating
21 off of --

22 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: He boosted it 26 points.

23 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: I'm not going to support
24 that.

25 COMMISSIONER PRIZMICH: That's my motion.

488

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Do we have a second on that
2 motion? Dies for lack of a second. Do we have another
3 motion?

4 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: I'll support staff plus
5 three on the criteria three, which is what I thought
6 they were asking for.

7 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: To boost it to five, is that
8 what you're saying?

9 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: No, I'll go with staff. I
10 misread this. Staff recommendation.

11 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: So we have a motion for staff
12 recommendation, which leaves it at 63. Do I have a
13 second?

14 COMMISSIONER McMILLIN: Second.

15 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Mark seconded. All those in
16 favor?

17 (Commissioners simultaneously voted.)

18 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Opposed?

19 COMMISSIONER PRIZMICH: No.
20 VICE-CHAIR ANDERSON: No.
21 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Motion carries. Item 42.
22 OHMVR STAFF GLASPIE: Line 42, OR-2-SW-35,
23 Pacific Southwest Region, Facilities, Operations and
24 Maintenance. They requested \$723,250. They received a
25 score of 35 points for zero funding determination. I
489

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 don't have any new information from them.
2 KATHLEEN MICK: Good afternoon, Commissioners,
3 staff members, Kathleen Mick, U.S. Forest Service.
4 Mardi is about to hand you some clarified information,
5 as well as some new information that we are providing
6 on this project. You'll find on pages two through
7 four, I ask you not to get rid of that document as that
8 document also contains information for our projects
9 that would be heard later on. So if you'd hold on to
10 that, that would be appreciated.

11 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: You're saying there are
12 multiple projects in here?

13 KATHLEEN MICK: Yes, sir. I also wanted to make
14 note that of the fact that on page two you'll see that
15 we have listed a priority for our funding. As based on
16 information that had been given previously by the
17 Division counsel, we're not allowed to adjust anything
18 until we're actually awarded money, but that would show
19 you at least where our priority is.

20 With that said, we would ask for an agency
21 revised score of 89. Starting first with criteria one,
Page 207

22 which would be a score of 39. You'll see there that
23 there is rationale in the first sentence of the
24 paragraph in criteria one, second sentence, third
25 sentence, as well as some clarification as requested by
490

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 the OHV Commission talking about different problems and
2 conditions that I deal with as coordinator or a person
3 in my position; would provide direct oversight to all
4 19 national forests, 18 in California and in the lands
5 of the Humboldt-Toiyabe. The centralized coordination
6 provides the ability for quick results. For instance,
7 you know, John Stewart called the other day, had a
8 couple of problems with some Southern California
9 forests, and I think the OHV community, whether or not
10 they support it, will find that the centralized
11 coordination, as well as the Division, helps to get
12 action to the director of the regional forester in a
13 timely manner.

14 DEPUTY DIR. GREENE: Excuse me, Ms. Mick, do you
15 have copies that? Did you make 13 copies?

16 KATHLEEN MICK: Yes, I just gave them to Mardi.

17 Chas, my assistant, had some more copies, but
18 she had to go, and she wasn't briefed to present this,
19 and she had to go pick up my daughter at school who is
20 sick. So I apologize for that.

21 On criteria two, we would request a score of 20
22 based on the clarification that's been provided. And
23 then for criteria three, a score of 30. We have a
24 history of good grant productivity ranging from

25 OR-2-SW-15, OR-2-SW-16. OR-2-SW-15, which was a grant
491

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 for \$2 million has recently been audited. We spent all
2 but \$91, and right now there's currently \$15,000 that
3 we're negotiating because we actually may have made
4 some mistakes in the way that we charged vehicles. But
5 overall got a listing of four, five, six grants ranging
6 from OR-15 to OR-27, along with some rescope grants for
7 a total of \$10 million. We've had good audits on all
8 of that and spent all of it, but \$1,190. So I think
9 that we've got a demonstration of a good track record
10 in that regard. So with that I'll just answer any
11 questions.

12 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Thank you. Do we have public
13 comment on that?

14 KAREN SCHAMBACH: Karen Schambach, Center for
15 Sierra in Nevada Conservation and PEER. I would at
16 least rescore this at 20 on number one, 20 out of the
17 40 based on -- some of these criteria really don't
18 apply to this position, but as Kathy pointed out, the
19 ability of not only off-roaders but the environmental
20 community, they have a central place to call, you know,
21 have questions answered or issues raised or resolved is
22 very valuable, so 20 there. 20 points under number
23 two, and we think a full score in number three because
24 the region does have a long history of completing their
25 grants. Thanks.

492

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax
Page 209

1 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Thank you.

2 JOHN STEWART: Good afternoon, Commissioners,
3 John Stewart, California Association of 4-Wheel Drive
4 Clubs, United 4-Wheel Drive Associations. I'm kind of
5 in a quandary with this grant. And I do appreciate the
6 fact that we have a central spot to call. That way we
7 know that we have somebody to call when problems do
8 arise. And knowing that with the various forests,
9 there is always a shuffling around of people, and so
10 it's difficult to get a straight answers at times. So
11 having this central point is important.

12 With this grant, especially when you look at
13 Item No. 2, partnerships to reduce reliance, we see no
14 other evidence that this is really coming up and
15 dealing with any kind of partnership issues. This is
16 purely a grant that is central to the region
17 headquarters. And to that extent, very little of this
18 money gets out on the ground. So while I'm not
19 really -- I don't like the 35, I just cannot quite
20 support the full amount of increase. I would go with
21 more like a -- well, 12 and eight, you know -- the 12
22 maybe go up to a 15, and then eight to a 15, but that's
23 about it. Thank you.

24 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Any further public comment?

25 TOM TAMMONE: Yes, Tom Tammone. I would like to
493

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 agree with John Stewart with both of his statements,

2 and with his specific statements on the scoring
3 criteria. Central point is good. I was trying to get
4 some educational signing through the region, rather
5 than going through each district, but there are issues
6 with that, too. And it's important, but it's not going
7 to replace dealing directly with the districts, but I'd
8 like to echo John Stewart's remarks.

9 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Thank you. Other comments?

10 BRENT SCHORADT: Brent Schoradt with the
11 California Wilderness Coalition. I'd like to see an
12 increase in the score in category one. I think it says
13 one or more of the following, and they've done a good
14 job of really describing what this coordinator would
15 do, the benefit of the coordinator. And really the way
16 that we view this coordinator position, is the person
17 who's really, you know, following through with all of
18 the forests. There are 18 different processes that are
19 all in various stages in terms of the route designation
20 process. So I think it's important to have someone in
21 the centralized office that can give direction on all
22 sorts of issues that are coming up across the forests,
23 and I think it will ultimately lead to more
24 efficiencies in terms of making sure that there is a
25 uniform standard that these forests are complying with.

494

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 And for category number two, we see there's
2 \$115,000 in agency contributions, which we think is
3 sufficient, so we give that one at least another eight
4 points to bring it up to 20. And then the applicant

5 obviously has a successful history of implementing
6 projects, so we would like to see another 20 in
7 category three.

8 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: What would be the totals
9 for your three categories in your recommendation?

10 BRENT SCHORADT: 75, I think I said 25, 20, and
11 20.

12 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: 25 for criteria one, 20
13 for criteria two, and 25 for criteria three?

14 BRENT SCHORADT: I'm sorry, 30 for criteria
15 three.

16 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: 30 for criteria three.

17 BRENT SCHORADT: 25, 20 and 30; 75.

18 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: Those are your
19 recommendations on the -- and because these are one or
20 more -- well, criteria one is a one or more criteria.
21 Criteria two is one or more. Criteria three has three
22 subsets. Are you suggesting that each of the (a), (b),
23 and (c) would be allocated 10, 10, 10?

24 BRENT SCHORADT: Yes, exactly, based on the
25 testimony from the agency on what we know in terms of
495

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 their successful history of implementing projects.

2 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: Okay. Thank you.

3 BRENT SCHORADT: Thank you.

4 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Any other comments?

5 DON AMADOR: Don Amador, Blue Ribbon Coalition.

6 As much as Blue Ribbon supports the work that the
7 regional office does for our trails, in this day and

8 age where we have units suffering at the project level
9 for getting cut a couple thousand here, a couple
10 thousand there, where we just explained where an extra
11 \$1,000 might be able to pump the toilets for the rest
12 the year, then you're considering almost three-quarters
13 of a million dollars, and I don't know they need any
14 toilets pumped in the regional office from a
15 Facilities, Operations and Maintenance grant; certainly
16 not with OHV money.

17 Now, historically when Crimsons was here, we've
18 been supportive of some funding for that position, but
19 certainly not three-quarters of a million dollars. For
20 the Commission to go from zero up to anything
21 substantive is really a stretch in my opinion. Thank
22 you.

23 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Thank you. Commissioners?

24 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: Yes, I have questions. Go
25 ahead. Do you want to do the motions, then I'll ask
496

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 the question.

2 COMMISSIONER SPITLER: So I have some comments
3 on this grant. I have some mixed feelings about it
4 because I do think that there is a lot of need out on
5 the ground, and I think that this is an awful lot of
6 money and these regional grants are getting larger and
7 larger every year, but that's really not the basis by
8 which we evaluate these applications. And when I look
9 at the basis by which we do evaluate them, I just can't
10 really understand the scores that they were given. So

11 I'm going to propose some new scores.

12 Under criteria one, enhances or protects
13 existing OHV opportunity or providing new opportunity
14 for protecting resources, solving operational
15 maintenance, law enforcement, user conflict problems;
16 reducing avoiding, conflicts with non-motorized
17 recreation. That's exactly what this grant is designed
18 to do. I just have a hard time understanding how this
19 grant couldn't receive a higher score. I suggest a
20 score of 35.

21 Under the second item, efficient use of OHV
22 Trust funds, this is the one where I really have a
23 difficult time. Innovative design to reduce reliance
24 on OHV Trust funds, this certainly isn't designed to do
25 that. So I will accept the staff recommendation there.

497

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 I think there is some partnership from the agency which
2 is great. I'd like to see more partnership from the
3 agency, but I understand their budget is suffering.

4 On item three under history of successful
5 implementation, I think clearly the regional office has
6 a very successful track record of implementing the
7 grants. We funded them for a route designation project
8 for the last four years now. They've done an
9 outstanding job. I do wonder about that \$91, but we
10 will let that one slide. So I have a hard time
11 going -- reducing this score at all. I would advocate
12 a score of 30 out of 30. I don't know what that total
13 adds up to.

2007-01-25 OHV C1 x
14 OHMVR STAFF FREITAS: 77.
15 COMMISSIONER SPITLER: Advocate a score of 77,
16 and that's my motion.
17 VICE-CHAIR ANDERSON: I'll second that.
18 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Under discussion, any
19 comments, questions?
20 COMMISSIONER McMILLIN: My only comment, I would
21 echo what Don Amador said about this is -- how many
22 forests have we got, 16, something like that? This
23 isn't getting out there. This is covering overhead at
24 the mothership level, and I think we need -- with
25 limited dollars, we need to get the money out in the 498

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 field. So I would have supported staff's
2 recommendation.
3 COMMISSIONER SPITLER: I would just want to say
4 that I echo that sentiment; although, evaluating the
5 criteria that we're evaluating these grants on, that's
6 not one of the criteria. I'm looking at the criteria
7 that we're evaluating the grants on, and frankly I
8 think this grant scores high based on those criteria.
9 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Mr. Thomas, you had a
10 question?
11 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: Comment really. Anybody
12 who has worked with the national forest system in
13 Northern California and probably Southern California as
14 well, knows that it's a series of fiefdoms. Each
15 individual national forest with its own independent and
16 thoughtful at times and perhaps not at other times

17 management. It is the regional office that has given
18 us the glue that has held this program together on a
19 statewide basis. It's remarkable what a different
20 program we have today than what we had when I first
21 came on the Commission because of the regional decision
22 to get involve and to tell the forests, the fiefdoms
23 what to do. Now, there is an inherent tension between
24 central command telling powerful local and important
25 local entities what to do, and it plays out in the

499

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 ever-shifting power balance in bureaucracy between
2 centralizing and decentralizing. Any government
3 employee has watched centralization and
4 decentralization. That all being said, it's very
5 important that we fund centralized management so that
6 we can get a handle on this program as a whole.

7 Now, under these criteria that we have, there's
8 not a criteria for really important centralized
9 management directives. It's not one of the criteria,
10 and we didn't adopt these criteria. So we're stuck
11 with the rules as they're provided.

12 The other aspect of this program that bothers me
13 is that by giving a rating, we're going to partially
14 fund something, which means we won't necessarily, and
15 we may -- we may end up funding nothing because
16 depending on what happens later in this meeting. But
17 we also may end up funding only part of a coordinator.
18 And anybody that has worked with government knows that
19 if you have a quarter time or a half-time employee, you

20 get half-time service. And we don't need half-time
21 service. We need full-time central management
22 coordination now. So we're constrained in our
23 efficiency. Maybe we ought to have a criteria,
24 efficient use of Commission directives, but we don't
25 have one, and we're stuck with it. We're stuck with
500

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 this system.

2 So I'm going to support the motion. If staff or
3 someone were able to tell me how I can fund the
4 statewide coordinator and the assistant coordinator and
5 drop off the resource specialist, I would be happy to
6 do that. But I see no way today within our current
7 system. So I'll support the motion for that long and
8 complicated reason.

9 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Any other comments or
10 questions? I have a question for staff. This position
11 obviously was funded in past years. What are those
12 amounts? What were those amounts?

13 CHIEF JENKINS: Give us a moment to look it up,
14 but I don't believe -- we will have that in a minute.

15 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Ms. Mick might be able to
16 respond that. Take a deep breath. I hope your
17 daughter is doing well.

18 KATHLEEN MICK: She's all right. It's just
19 being a mother. You know how it is. Well, I guess you
20 don't know what it's like being a mother, but you know
21 what it's like to be a dad. But thanks just the same.

22 Last year we were funded by the Commission. But

2007-01-25 OHV C1 x
23 based on money in the bucket, we fell below the line,
24 so we didn't actually get any money. But in the past
25 years it's been anywhere -- the funding has been from 501

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 \$200,000 to \$800,000 for the coordinator, most of
2 which -- the higher numbers were associated to some
3 specific projects that we were going to achieve, so
4 it's been in a range.

5 CHIEF JENKINS: Last year neither the BLM
6 statewide coordinator or the Forest Service state
7 coordinator was funded.

8 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Last year.

9 CHIEF JENKINS: As in the most recent grant
10 cycle.

11 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Well, some comments that
12 Commissioner Thomas made resonated with me, so I will
13 support this because we need to get through this very,
14 very important route designation process, with a sure
15 hand on the stick, so.

16 With that said, if there are no other comments
17 or suggestions or ideas, we will go forward with the
18 vote. All those in favor?

19 (Commissioners simultaneously voted.)

20 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Opposed?

21 COMMISSIONER McMILLIN: No.

22 COMMISSIONER PRIZMICH: No.

23 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Motion carries.

24 KATHLEEN MICK: Thank you. And I understand
25 that our other grants will be heard tomorrow?

502

1 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: As I see our charge for the
2 rest of the day, I don't think we're going to get
3 through more than line item 62, through the safety
4 items. I'm hoping to get that far. So we will take
5 planning tomorrow.

6 OHMVR STAFF GLASPIE: Next application, line
7 number 43, Plumas National Forest, Facilities,
8 Operations and Maintenance. They requested \$279,000.
9 They got a 35 point score for a zero percent funding
10 determination. This grant -- this applicant did turn
11 in additional information. His, once again, was one
12 very, very difficult to read the first time, and his
13 new information is much easier to find what he's
14 pointing out.

15 FRED KRUEGER: Good afternoon, Commissioners,
16 Chairman Brissenden. My name is Fred Krueger from the
17 Plumas National Forest. I'd like to first start by
18 thanking you for the reconsideration of this grant. We
19 have a number of things going on in the Plumas, as I
20 think you're aware of, and I think the first thing I
21 want to note to you is that we have completed the
22 Interim Order Step Two for the route designation, which
23 restricts OHV to the route trails, which I noted
24 earlier. That give us over 5,000 miles to ride on over
25 approximately 6,000 acres, wonderful opportunity.

503

1 We've already developed those maps with the Forest
2 Order on there according to the process and the route
3 designation process. I do have examples of those maps
4 with the Forest Order with me, and I'll give those to
5 Mardi to handout, as well. So from that alone, we need
6 to sign that on the ground and educate our users.
7 That's a large effort that would come from this grant
8 specifically, and that is the newest information.

9 Then the last part is in the performance of
10 three, and again we've noted that, and we noted that
11 past performance in there. So if those two items alone
12 could be considered, we, the Plumas National Forest out
13 of Quincy, California would definitely appreciate it
14 and answer any questions.

15 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Public comment.

16 SYLVIA MILLIGAN: Sylvia Milligan, with
17 Recreation Outdoors Coalition. I also want to say this
18 pumps the potties, and from a woman's point of view and
19 from the public's point of view, please pump the
20 potties. They also have a good match for their money.
21 I'd hate to see them lose that. They show 17,444, but
22 in actuality it's over 58,000. They're getting the
23 influx of people from Sacramento and the valley. If we
24 don't get this FO&M money, give us enough money for a
25 big billboard that says, go follow the money, go to the
504

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 south state. Thank you, guys.

2 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Thank you. Commissioners.

3 COMMISSIONER SPITLER: Move the staff

4 recommendati on.

5 CHAIR BRI SSENDEN: Staff recommendati on has been
6 moved. Di es for lack of a second.

7 COMMI SSIONER THOMAS: We' re starting at 35.

8 CHAIR BRI SSENDEN: Yes, you' re starting at 35.
9 Great leap of something.

10 COMMI SSIONER THOMAS: Thi rty gets you two out
11 of -- certainly for criteri a three, if you add 30
12 points -- 28 points, make it less than perfect, that
13 would be consistent with the testimony and would
14 actually be accurate because apparently we have an
15 accurate record of completi on, it' s just that it wasn' t
16 shown in the right boxes on the form. Apparently we
17 have an accurate satisfacti on of criteri a 3(a), (b),
18 and (c). It just wasn' t shown on the form. So my
19 suggesti on would be to add 28 points to that, and that
20 would give you 63 points. And that will be -- if the
21 maker of the moti on would accept that. If not, I' ll
22 try a substi tute moti on.

23 COMMI SSIONER SPITLER: My moti on died for lack
24 of second.

25 COMMI SSIONER THOMAS: So I would move that 63. 505

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 COMMI SSIONER PRI ZMI CH: Second.

2 CHAIR BRI SSENDEN: It' s been moved and seconded.
3 All those in favor?

4 (Commi ssi oners simul taneously voted.)

5 CHAIR BRI SSENDEN: Opposed? Moti on carries.
6 Item 45.

7 OHMVR STAFF GLASPIE: Line 45, OR-2-SB-89, San
8 Bernardino National Forest, Facilities, Operations and
9 Maintenance, requested \$153,690; received a Division
10 score of 63 points for a 60 percent funding
11 determination of \$92,214. They, in addition, have
12 submitted some additional information specifying this
13 time really big on their volunteer contribution, same
14 as their trail maintenance.

15 CHRIS EVANS: Chris Evans, San Bernardino
16 National Forest. The first thing that I would like to
17 address with this particular application for O&M, maybe
18 a point of clarification, this was a very difficult
19 application for me to put together because we do so
20 much out of O&M. It's not only the pumping of the
21 toilets and the cleaning of the trailheads and
22 everything else that goes on at the district level,
23 this is also the primary application as far as support
24 of the San Bernardino National Forest Association and
25 the volunteer programs and partnerships that come along
506

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 with that. Somewhere in the neighborhood of \$100,000
2 of the \$150,000 that was requested does go toward a
3 challenge cost share agreement that we have with the
4 association that supports their staff which helps us
5 manage the OHV volunteers and leads towards that big
6 number that we have for our volunteer contribution.
7 And I think that may have been a little bit difficult
8 to pick up in the application itself because it was
9 trying to pack a lot of information into kind of a

13 share with the association, their support of the OHV
14 volunteer program, also Adopt-a-Trail, as well.

15 Category three, the history of successful
16 implementation, we have a score of 12 out of 30, we'd
17 like to see an increase there, as well.

18 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Please summarize.

19 CHRIS EVANS: Yes, completion of prior projects,
20 I think the Commission heard me speak to that earlier
21 on some of our other applications. We did have a
22 20-year history of audits that was determined to be
23 pretty clean on our part. In fact, we were able to
24 refute anything that we found that would have been owed
25 back to the state, and then also the recent history of
508

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 agreements completed within time frames and with the
2 high percentage of completions.

3 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Thank you. Public comments?

4 BENJAMIN von DELINGEN: Benjamin von Delingen,
5 San Bernardino National Forest Association, OHV
6 Programs. I just want to support the suggestion of a
7 new score of 75 out of 100, particularly 1(a) with the
8 folks, all of the volunteer time. I don't know if you
9 caught the number, but our volunteers do contribute
10 about \$600,000 of in kind donation average, so it's a
11 huge return of investment, if you will, for the amount
12 given to the Forest Service program. Under 2(c) also,
13 as far as partnerships where it's addressed, between
14 5,000 hours from our volunteer program alone, that's
15 pretty substantial. That's hard to ignore a

16 partnership like that, as well as Adopt-a-Trail, as
17 well. So we have SPFA OHV volunteers which maintain a
18 little over 300 -- I'm not sure how many Adopt a Trail
19 volunteers. There is a good number of those clubs, as
20 well. So partnerships are alive and well with the
21 San Bernardino National Forest, and I'm one of them.
22 Thank you.

23 JOHN STEWART: Good afternoon, Commissioners,
24 John Stewart, California Association of 4-Wheel Drive
25 Clubs, United 4-Wheel Associations, Tierra del Sol 509

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 4-Wheel Drive Club. We support the increase scoring,
2 but again as with their other grant, I think the
3 San Bernardino crowd is being a little bit modest when
4 they look and talk to two criteria number two. Because
5 if you look at efficient use of funds, this is a prime
6 example. It is being held up by the Forest Service
7 nationwide as a good program, and it's being looked at
8 to be implemented throughout the state; therefore, it
9 is a significantly important program, and it does
10 provide a very efficient use of funds. So I would like
11 to see that actually up to a 30.

12 And as a history of successful applications,
13 they've been working this program off of grant funds
14 for a long time. So, you know, historically, they've
15 got it, it's set up, you know, Item No. 3 should be up
16 in the 30 itself. So we support this with the much
17 higher scoring. Thank you.

18 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Thank you. Commissioners.
Page 225

19 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: Move staff.
20 COMMISSIONER SPITLER: Second.
21 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: It's been moved at staff
22 level of recommendation and seconded. Those in favor?
23 (Commissioners simultaneously voted.)
24 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Opposed? Motion carries.
25 We do have the assistant to the Chair here. 510

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 Cheryl, do you need a break? And I just heard one
2 Commissioner Judith Anderson also wanting to break.
3 There are currently 17 more grant applications to be
4 heard.
5 I do have one special request under safety where
6 a volunteer individual has to be back to work tomorrow
7 morning and has a flight at 7:00. I will just
8 suggest --
9 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: It's the Chair's
10 prerogative.
11 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Exactly, and go to that one
12 item, and then we'll leave the rest until tomorrow. If
13 you're okay for about another ten minutes, we'll
14 adjourn. We have a closed session at 8:30, and we hope
15 to be out of that by 9:00 to start the review once
16 again.
17 So without further ado, I will go to line item;
18 I believe it's 58, which is the Gold Rock Outdoor
19 Schools, OHV Safety Education Program.
20 I know I would probably curry favor by moving
21 everyone around, but this one I'll do today.

22 OHMVR STAFF ABARRA: Okay. Line number 58, Gold
23 Rock Outdoor Schools. They requested \$109,300. They
24 received a score of 66 at 60 percent for an amount of
25 \$65,580. They did submit additional supplemental

511

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 information. And if we would have received this
2 information in the original application, it may have
3 justified a higher score. Martha Abarra, Grant
4 Administrator.

5 CINDY SABOLICH: Cindy Sabolich, Gold Rock
6 Outdoor Schools. And John Stewart, thanks to you, I
7 just had my coat on and was ready to head out. He was
8 sweating, now I am. So here I am.

9 So we are submitting additional information. We
10 have sent 13 copies out to the Commission. My first
11 important thing I want to do is bring you right to the
12 very back. I want to start backwards. I don't know,
13 maybe it's out in the desert we do it that way, I don't
14 know, but here we go backwards.

15 Number one point, the sole reason I'm here if
16 you guys could give us at least one point, of course,
17 we're asking for more than that, but qualifications and
18 availability of staff to carry this out. Since we've
19 written this project we have recruited a curriculum
20 advisory board. In that board, they've come up with a
21 strategic plan of an outstanding program that we've
22 unveiled to several users here. It's a 12-point
23 program that is called, "Responsible Rider." Instead
24 of one course, one activity, one day, OHV safety

25 education requires a whole lot more than that. This is
512

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 a compilation, a collection of all of the programs
2 together in a systematic-based program similar to a Boy
3 Scout's program with the gold helmet award being the
4 ultimate award in the end after they meet 12 criteria
5 in each of the four items, so 48 different ones.

6 Again, I'm sorry, was on my way out, but number
7 one, if we can have one more point there for our
8 qualifications of staff. In addition to our advisory
9 board, we've had to have a technical team for this
10 program as it's largely web based. The first thing
11 we're out there is to raise awareness and consciousness
12 that people need to take responsibility. They need to
13 register as a responsible rider. They need to take the
14 tread pledge, and they need to start being accountable
15 for their actions and get in a program, a progressive
16 based systematic program that will lead to the future
17 of OHV recreation. So we've had to add about eight
18 other people down there in that criteria.

19 The next criteria I would like to point out is
20 about two up on the sheet I handed you from that one.
21 And we've just recently completed last year's grant,
22 which is about six months early. We were granted on
23 the 23rd of January '06, \$80,100, and throughout the
24 Christmas season to about January 3rd, we completed all
25 of our deliverables and exceeded the amount of students
513

1 that we described in the product description, and we're
2 able to start working on this project before we even
3 know that we're funded on it. So we think that we have
4 excellent use of funds on that. And I've described the
5 project and am open for public comment. I hope a lot
6 of people that we've spoken to are interested in
7 commenting. And I'll answer any questions.

8 JOHN STEWART: Good afternoon, Commissioners,
9 John Stewart, California Association of 4-Wheel Drive
10 Clubs, United 4-Wheel Drive Association. This is one
11 of those projects that strikes to the very heart of the
12 efficient and effective use of OHV funds. This, of
13 anything, is one. This actually gets out and teaches
14 the responsibility and teaches ethics to the
15 youngsters, to our young riders coming up, to the
16 people that are at a real impressionable age. This is
17 the point where we need to reach them.

18 Looking at this, basically the scoring criteria
19 could, you know, actually had about five to six points
20 all the way down the board because this program
21 outlines a very good methodology for instilling ethics
22 issues into our young people. And not only does it
23 provide for good training methodology, but provides for
24 reinforcement of that training. And the outside, is
25 that once the training, then it also provides for a

514

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 volunteer patrol to again go back and peer teaching

2 peer, in other words, once they do reach that gold
3 helmet, they become the elite of this group, and now
4 they can go back and actually start working with the
5 younger people. And this is where you start getting a
6 good resonance of the training, and you're getting the
7 people that are relating to ones within their age,
8 something we really desperately need within a good
9 safety training and awareness program.

10 I would really support the increased scoring,
11 like I said, five maybe six points all the way down the
12 board, because this program is one that really is worth
13 it, and it is a highly efficient and effective use of
14 OHV funds. Thank you.

15 TOM TAMMONE: Tom Tammone. Again, I agree with
16 John Stewart's comments. This responsible rider
17 program is in addition to everything that's been
18 involved in the grant. The way the regs are written
19 this year, they can do, and I'm supporting it. It
20 alone is definitely worth at least half the points that
21 they're increasing.

22 They're asking for a 12 point addition for the
23 first criteria. The information they provided here
24 more than justifies that. They're asking for a nine
25 point increase in the second criteria. They're only

515

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 asking for two additional points in the third criteria,
2 and they're asking for three additional points in
3 the -- no, they're asking more than that. They're
4 asking for seven additional points in the last

5 criteria. Completion of prior projects, I don't know
6 why that wasn't captured. This program has been around
7 for a long time. It's a very stable program. It's one
8 of the stable programs everybody looks at, so I don't
9 see why it scored so low, but it's definitely worth 15
10 out of 15.

11 Another thing, this responsible rider program,
12 it's a web-based program. They've got an 800 number,
13 they've got a website, they've got website
14 registration. People have to register to be involved
15 in the program to get recognition. It's a good
16 program, and it has the potential to be actually global
17 since it's web based, but it even includes a snowmobile
18 criteria. So there's more to this than just riding
19 quads out in the desert. I definitely support the 96
20 points that they're asking for in the score adjustment.
21 It's well worth the money. Thank you.

22 BRUCE BRAZIL: Bruce Brazil, California Enduro
23 Riders Association. I sure wish I was able to come up
24 with some additional new facts to help you increase the
25 scores on this, but they said everything there is to be
516

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 said. You look at the category, OHV safety and
2 education, what else could they add to their program to
3 supply that for you? Thank you.

4 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Thank you. Commissioners?
5 Ms. Anderson, you had a question?

6 VICE-CHAIR ANDERSON: When this program first
7 started, wasn't it more hands-on?

8 CINDY SABOLICH: That's correct.

9 VICE-CHAIR ANDERSON: Can you describe what this
10 transition is now?

11 CINDY SABOLICH: Excellent question, thank you
12 for giving me the opportunity.

13 VICE-CHAIR ANDERSON: Is there still a hands-on
14 component?

15 CINDY SABOLICH: Absolutely, that's part of the
16 whole responsibility issue, but I mentioned earlier, it
17 cannot be a one course, a one hands-on. As you know as
18 a teacher, it doesn't happen that way. As a parent you
19 have to keep going on and on. And I'm helping quote a
20 study with a Colorado OHV division, it shows that when
21 parents and families are involved with children, that
22 they also behave more responsibly. So this program has
23 a huge team component as mentors, and I know somebody
24 is going to ask me about the puppet and give me time to
25 do that, too. I'll just keep holding it until somebody
517

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 asks.

2 Anyway, about 25 percent of it will be hands-on
3 in one of the criteria, but, of course, the repetition
4 on the trail patrol and the mentoring is a huge part of
5 the riding end, but as far as hands-on training, it is
6 now approximately 25 percent of the four categories of
7 our grant funding.

8 COMMISSIONER McMILLIN: So, Cindy, how many
9 riders do you actually have on site in a year's period?

10 CINDY SABOLICH: I think that I have -- if I

11 haven't put that out for you, I had one here. Last
12 year, if we count the hands-on ATV and dirt bikes, who
13 are real regulated by their class sizes. We can only
14 do four students at a time. So for us it's more
15 beneficial to do a number of hours that we have
16 provided. So including ATV, dirt bike school, and
17 trail mentoring, this is not the DVDs we show the Tread
18 Lightly tread pledge, the meet and greet. We have
19 19,800 hours logged of safety education deliverables to
20 students.

21 COMMISSIONER McMILLIN: How many students do
22 have you on site that are taking your class in a year?

23 CINDY SABOLICH: In a year, we have done in
24 collaboration with the State of Arizona, we've done
25 2,000 this year.

518

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 COMMISSIONER McMILLIN: Two thousand students on
2 site on Gold Rock Ranch?

3 CINDY SABOLICH: Correct.

4 COMMISSIONER McMILLIN: So you have a lot of
5 additional money, other than that that's funding this?

6 CINDY SABOLICH: Absolutely, there is no way we
7 can do it on those.

8 COMMISSIONER McMILLIN: I'm asking. I'm very
9 familiar with this program. And just recently
10 recommended it to -- there is a radio show host in
11 San Diego who knows something about off-road, just
12 bought five vehicles, a motor home, spent half a
13 million dollars. I said you got to go somewhere and

14 I learn how to ride this stuff.

15 CINDY SABOLICH: And to help answer another one
16 of Judith's question, it doesn't limit there. We just
17 have to keep coming up with things because the go-carts
18 out there are big issues, along with side by side and
19 rhinos, so we have a lot of clinics going there. And
20 we hadn't had a system to integrate that hands-on
21 training to count our hours yet. So hopefully this
22 program and this year's funding will create a huge
23 database to be able to record and give you all kinds of
24 statistics. We need a tech dude for that. I am the
25 P.E. teacher.

519

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Thank you. Commissioners?

2 COMMISSIONER SPITLER: I think it's a good
3 grant, and I think the staff has done a good job of
4 scoring it. I'll move the staff recommendation.

5 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: Second.

6 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: It's been moved and seconded
7 at staff recommendation, which is a level of 66. Any
8 discussion?

9 COMMISSIONER McMILLIN: I'm going to vote in
10 opposition to that, I'd like to go higher. So take the
11 vote.

12 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Either that, or you can try
13 an amendment.

14 COMMISSIONER McMILLIN: Okay. I'll make an
15 amendment then. Based on their handout here, I would
16 like to propose that we raise the first category up to

17 28, the second one up to 33 based on their
18 recommendations, the third category 15 out of 15, and
19 the fourth one, the same, an additional seven points
20 for 15 out of 15. I ask if that would be accepted by
21 the maker of the motion.

22 COMMISSIONER SPITLER: I wouldn't accept it.

23 COMMISSIONER PRIZMICH: I'll second his.

24 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: It's been moved and second,
25 at amendment at the total of 91.

520

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 COMMISSIONER McMILLIN: 28, 33, 15 and 15.

2 OHMVR STAFF FREITAS: 91.

3 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: That would be 91. So the
4 amendment that is on the floor, all those in favor of
5 the amendment?

6 (Commissioners simultaneously voted.)

7 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Opposed?

8 COMMISSIONER SPITLER: No.

9 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: No.

10 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: So the amendment passes and
11 back to the original motion. All those in favor of the
12 amendment signify by saying aye.

13 (Commissioners simultaneously voted.)

14 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Opposed?

15 COMMISSIONER SPITLER: No.

16 COMMISSIONER THOMAS: No.

17 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Motion carries.

18 CINDY SABOLICH: I think I'm saying thank you.

19 I got lost, but I think I'm saying thank you. It's not

20 quite often you get a second chance at life, and that's
21 why I got an excellent program out to you guys. I hope
22 to exceed your expectations. Thank you.

23 CHAIR BRISSENDEN: Thank you. With that said,
24 we will continue with the thank yous. Staff, thank
25 you; and our great public, thanks for being here.

521

SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING
916-492-1010 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax

1 Sorry we didn't get to all of you, but we did schedule
2 two days of meeting on this one. So tomorrow morning
3 again we reconvene as the Commission at 8:30 for a
4 closed session. We hope to open up the public session
5 at nine o'clock. Have a great evening.

6 (Meeting adjourned at 5:19 p.m.)

7 Respectfully submitted,
8 Cheryl Kyle, CSR No. 7014

9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22

2007-01-25 OHV C1 x

23

24

25

522

916-492-1010 SCRIBE REPORTING & LEGAL COPYING 877-453-1010 916-492-1222 Fax